The Dialect is Just a Difference: Speech Language Pathologists and Issues Assessing African American Vernacular English ................................................................. 1
Jade Nicole Hicks

A Comparison of Attitudes Regarding Health Insurance among Students at Truman State University ................................................................. 17
Dominique Johnson

Factors that Influence Retention of Black Male Educators ........................................ 29
Jeremy E. Mapp

Philip Trager and Ralph Lemon’s Persephone: Performing the Dialectic of Power Relations ................................................................. 47
Brook Ratterree

Minority Party Electoral Performance in a One-Party Russia ........................................ 73
Christopher R. A. Reid

Romantic Attachment and Self-Esteem Among Women with Turner Syndrome ................................................................. 89
Kayla Simmerman

College Students’ Perceptions Regarding Legal Drug Usage: Caffeine, Alcohol, and Nicotine ................................................................. 99
Jonathan Whitfield

Experience with Classical Music and Student Academic Performance ........................................ 119
Amanda Wiggans

Negotiating the Panopticon: On Queer Theory, Queerness, Queer Space, and Tactical Strategies ................................................................. 141
Leia Penina Wilson
McNair Scholarly Review

Editorial Staff

Dr. Sylvia Macauley
Ms. Sarah A. Hass

Dr. Gail Victoria Landrum, Editor
Ms. Bich Kuhns

Management Staff

Dr. Sylvia Macauley
Director
Ms. Bertha Thomas
Assistant Dean of Multicultural Affairs
Ms. Bich Kuhns
Administrative Assistant

Dr. Gail Victoria Landrum
Research Coordinator
Ms. Sarah Hass
Program Coordinator

Research Supervisors

McNair Scholars

Dr. Janet L. Gooch
Jade Nicole Hicks

Dr. Janice Clark Young
Dominique Johnson

Dr. Wendy S. Miner
Jeremy E. Mapp

Dr. Cole Woodcox
Dr. Lynn Rose
Brooke Ratterree

Dr. John James Quinn
Christopher R. A. Reid

Dr. Michele Y. Breault
Kayla Simmerman

Dr. Maureen Carlson
Amanda Wiggins

Dr. Martin Joseph Ponce
Leia Penina Wilson

Dr. David Conner
Jonathan Whitfield
The Dialect is Just a Difference: Speech Language Pathologists and Issues
Assessing African American Vernacular English ...................................................... 1
Jade Nicole Hicks

A Comparison of Attitudes Regarding Health Insurance among Students
at Truman State University ......................................................................................... 17
Dominique Johnson

Factors that Influence Retention of Black Male Educators .................................. 29
Jeremy E. Mapp

Philip Trager and Ralph Lemon’s Persephone: Performing the Dialectic
of Power Relations ................................................................................................. 47
Brooke Ratterree

Minority Party Electoral Performance in a One-Party Russia ................................ 73
Christopher R. A. Reid

Romantic Attachment and Self-Esteem Among Women
with Turner’s Syndrome ......................................................................................... 89
Kayla Simmerman

College Students’ Perceptions Regarding Legal Drug Usage: Caffeine,
Alcohol, and Nicotine .............................................................................................. 99
Jonathan Whitfield

Experience with Classical Music and Student Academic Performance ............. 119
Amanda Wiggans

Negotiating the Panopticon: On Queer Theory, Queerness, Queer Space,
and Tactical Strategies .......................................................................................... 141
Leia Penina Wilson
Preface

We are proud to present this edition of *The McNair Scholarly Review* and the writing produced by our talented undergraduate authors whose research articles represent a broad array of academic disciplines and topics. Their diverse interests range from such timely concerns as attitudes towards healthcare insurance experienced among today’s college students, to the enduring power of classical myth to inform the creative process of balletic movement and the resulting images captured by a photographer’s discerning eye. Our McNair scholars have explored topics ranging from an analysis of emerging patterns in electoral politics within 21st century Russia, to an examination of psychological factors that shape student perceptions of everyday, legal drug usage with substances such as caffeine, alcohol and nicotine. These articles are as truly unique as their authors. They reflect the intellectual curiosity and dedication to scholarly inquiry that remain the hallmarks of the McNair program experience for its participants. We are strongly committed to supporting the goals and aspirations of these talented, productive scholars. Therefore, with this issue of *The McNair Scholarly Review*, we proudly invite you to share in the celebration of their achievements.

Kirksville, Missouri                      Gail Victoria Landrum
December 2009
Acknowledgments & Permissions

*The McNair Scholarly Review* wishes to acknowledge its appreciation for the outstanding mentorship provided by the dedicated faculty members who, as research supervisors, have inspired and expertly guided our scholars as they’ve pursued their undergraduate research. We are also deeply grateful and indebted to the Office of the Provost and Vice President for Academic Affairs for its generosity and longstanding support of the Ronald E. McNair Post-Baccalaureate program throughout the years, which has made our students’ success possible.

We would also like to offer our sincerest thanks to Mr. Philip Trager, Photographer, for his generosity and support, especially granting permission for the use of his photographic images of choreographer Ralph Lemon’s *Persephone* ballet, for Ms. Brooke Ratterree’s article in the current issue of *The McNair Scholarly Review*.

Finally, we are most deeply grateful for the participation of the following faculty members who have generously served on the review committees for the articles in this year’s issue:

Jana Arabas, MS
Ilene Ashbaugh, Au.D.
Michele Y. Breault, Ph.D.
Maureen Carlson, DMA
Jacqueline L. Collett, DMA
David Conner, Ph.D.
Janet L. Gooch, Ph.D.
Wendy S. Miner, Ph.D.
Martin Joseph Ponce, Ph.D.
John James Quinn, Ph.D.
Lynn Rose, Ph.D.
Joseph Sencibaugh, Ph.D.
Jackwon Suh, Ph.D.
Cole Woodcox, D. Phil.
Janice Clark Young, Ed.D.
The Dialect is Just a Difference: Speech Language Pathologists and Issues Assessing African American Vernacular English

Jade Nicole Hicks

Dr. Janet L. Gooch, Mentor

African American Vernacular English (AAVE) is one of the multicultural dialects of Standard American English (SAE). Speech-Language Pathologists (SLPs) who lack experience with AAVE dialect may be at risk for misdiagnosing clients who speak the dialect. This study explored whether increased exposure to clients who speak AAVE affected the transcription skills of graduate level Communication Disorders students. The participants were 21 graduate students, 14 from Truman State University located in rural northeast Missouri and 7 from Rockhurst University, located in Kansas City, Missouri. Participants listened to an audio recorded sample of an adult male speaker who used AAVE and transcribed the speech sample using the International Phonetic Alphabet and any necessary diacritics. The transcriptions of students from both schools (rural vs. urban university) were compared to a key to determine the accuracy of each transcription. A difference in the number of phonemes transcribed correctly between the two groups was determined using the Mann-Whitney U test. Results revealed that graduate students receiving training in rural northeast Missouri were more accurate in their transcription than those receiving training in Kansas City, Missouri. Factors affecting transcription other than exposure to AAVE likely accounted for differences between the two groups.
Speech-Language Pathologists (SLPs) who are not specifically trained in working with clients who speak non-standard dialects may be at risk for misdiagnosing a cultural difference in language as a communication disorder. By definition, a dialect is a variation of a language spoken by a particular group of speakers. Dialects are defined by such factors, as class and/or ethnicity. One form of dialect in the United States that causes transcription and possibly diagnostic issues for SLPs is African American Vernacular English (AAVE) (Meredith & Pollock, 2001). The use of this dialect is not restricted to only African Americans. According to Meredith and Pollock (2001), similarly, “It is important to realize that not all African Americans speak AAVE (in fact, some non African Americans speak AAVE) and that there is considerable variation in the use of AAVE among speakers…” (p. 47). Students who are training to become SLPs are most often taught to transcribe in Standard American English (SAE), the dialect form perceived as most “neutral” and free of regional characteristics. They may also be trained to transcribe other dialects that are relevant to their practice, in order to “distinguish between dialectal differences and communicative disorders” (ASHA, 2003).

Speakers of AAVE have various phonological (sound) differences from SAE. One phonological variation that is subject to misidentification as a communication disorder by an under trained SLP is the /f/ to /θ/ place change (e.g., “with” would sound like “wif”). In young children who are developing speech, /f/ to /θ/ is a common substitution error. An SLP unaware of the dialect’s rules may be diagnosing AAVE speakers (particularly children) with a communication disorder if these features are present after age six or seven. There is a high possibility of misdiagnosis occurring in this scenario as the dialect is a part of the client’s speech. Not being aware of the features of AAVE and the culture surrounding the dialect can lead to misdiagnosis of a communication disorder. Misdiagnosis can have negative effects on the client (the client may be in therapy when he or she may not need services) and reflects poorly upon the clinician in a way that the clinician’s professional skills may be questioned.

Limited exposure to a minority population while in a clinical setting and non exposure to extensive dialect training may put SLPs at a disadvantage when transcribing AAVE. Speakers of AAVE may be misdiagnosed when evaluated by SLPs inexperienced in transcribing dialects that are not SAE. According to Robinson and Stockman (2009), “School based SLPs, who are not familiar with normal mainstream dialect development, may have a tendency to judge speakers as disordered when they are not…IDEA [Individuals with Disabilities Education Improvement Act] states that schools with predominantly Caucasian students and teachers are apt to place minority students into special education classes at disproportionately high rates” (p. 139). This research focused on graduate clinicians in
Speech-Language Pathology and their abilities to recognize and correctly transcribe a speech sample from an AAVE speaker. The study focused on the questions of whether exposure time and interaction with speakers of AAVE influenced clinicians’ ability to transcribe AAVE. The research question was: *Did lack of exposure to non-standard dialects affect an SLP’s transcription abilities?*

**Literature Review**

**AAVE features**

Phonological (sound) differences are one of the main differences between AAVE and SAE. According to Hinton and Pollock (2000), the following are characteristics of AAVE: “…reduction of the final consonant clusters that have the same voicing, substitution of /f/ for /θ/ [voiceless “th”] in the word medial and final positions, substitution of /d/ for /ð/ [voiced “th”], in the words *the, that* and *them*, and deletion of postvocalic /r/ following /o/, such as *po* for *poor*” (p. 2). These phonological differences would be seen as a disorder if the person was speaking SAE, but if the speaker is speaking AAVE, an SLP has to understand the dialect differences in order to prevent misdiagnosis of a client.

**AAVE and schools**

The American Speech-Language Hearing Association (ASHA) has released documents, such as the technical report *American English Dialects*, created by the ASHA Multicultural Issues Board, discussing the issue of the role of non-standard dialects in Speech Language Pathology. According to ASHA (2003), dialects are not speech disorders only differences, and the dialect is to be treated with sensitivity to the client’s culture and beliefs (ASHA, 2003). A ruling in 1979, *Martin Luther King Junior Elementary School v. Ann Arbor School District*, addresses the use of AAVE and how it affects classroom activities; Anderson and Screen (1994) tell of the Ann Arbor decision in their book, *Multicultural Perspectives in Communication Disorders*. In Ann Arbor, Michigan, parents were worried that their children’s use of AAVE might negatively impact the students’ developing reading skills. The Ann Arbor decision required teachers to complete in-service hours during the school year to learn about AAVE and increase their level of sensitivity towards the AAVE speakers learning to read in the classroom (Anderson & Screen, 1994). Issues with the use of AAVE were still present after the Ann Arbor decision. For example, the Oakland California school board case that debated over treating “Ebonics” as a separate language illustrates this controversy over AAVE (DeBose, 2005). The use of AAVE not only affects the profession of Communication Disorders, but connects
with Linguistics, Sociology, and education of children. SLPs in training have to be made aware that differences in SAE exist since they are taught to transcribe speech using SAE. DeBose (2005) asserts that AAVE is not a failure to correctly speak SAE; a mistake some inexperienced SLPs make (DeBose, 2005).

AAVE and misdiagnosis

To ensure that accurate information about dialects is provided to SLPs during undergraduate and graduate years, ASHA has created a list of competencies regarding dialects an SLP needs to be informed about. The importance of dialect awareness is mentioned when ASHA states (2003),

The speech-language pathologist must have certain competencies to distinguish between
dialectal differences and communicative disorders. These competencies include:
1. recognizing all American English dialects as rule-governed linguistic systems,
2. understanding the rules and linguistic features of American English dialect(s) represented by their clientele,
3. being familiar with nondiscriminatory testing and dynamic assessment procedures... (p 2).

Failure to be properly trained in AAVE can lead to clients being over diagnosed or under diagnosed with communication disorders. Meredith and Pollock (2001) discussed the ramifications of being an SLP undertrained in AAVE when they stated, “Mistakenly identifying AAVE speech patterns as errors may ultimately result in over identification of a disorder. However, assuming that productions represent AAVE when the expected variable usage patterns are not apparent can lead to under identification of a disorder” (p. 52). Anderson and Screen (1994) stated that, “Misdiagnosis and inappropriate educational placement can occur from professionals continuing to assess children of color without regard for the students’ cultural and linguistic experiences. Nonbiased assessment can correct these trends; the continuation of biased assessment stems from limited understanding and knowledge” (p. 80). The study of AAVE and the importance of recognizing AAVE as a dialect and not a disorder is important to current as well as future SLPs.

Test bias

In the study, the participants are transcribing items from a standardized test the Goldman-Fristoe Test of Articulation (2nd edition) (GFTA-2). The GFTA-2 is a standardized test that can be affected by test bias because of the dialect sensitive items in the test. Standardized testing bias also causes difficulty when assessing AAVE clients. Stockman (1996) states, “Although we attempt to eliminate or minimize negative test bias by not counting an alternative dialect response to an item as an
error, this strategy need not result in adequate assessment either. After allowances are made for dialect sensitive items, there may not be enough remaining items for a valid assessment” (p.138). The limited information obtained from the standardized test may force a clinician to administer multiple assessments to obtain enough information to diagnose a client. Even though standardized tests have limitations when assessing culturally and linguistically diverse (CLD) clients, SLPs continue to use them because of how easily they can be administered and graded (Thomas-Tate, Washington, Craig & Packard 2006).

Avoiding test bias
Since test bias can occur, special considerations have to be made when assessing AAVE speakers as well as other speakers of non-standard dialects for communication disorders. According to Laing (2003), “Excluding and/or giving credit for dialect sensitive stimulus items on standardized assessments has been shown to be effective in reducing the over identification of AAVE speakers as phonologically disordered…However there is some concern that these alternatives may perpetuate racial stereotyping that leads to inaccurate conjecture regarding an AAVE speaker’s linguistic competence” (p. 273). Racial stereotyping can be a problem when assessing a client because not all African Americans speak AAVE. SLPs need to make sure that they are listening for a difference and not assuming a difference based on visual information such as skin color or physical features. To help clinicians who want to ensure that their clients are being assessed properly, T. Coleman, J. Wilson and W. Wilson (2000) suggest that non biased assessment

1. Is ongoing.
2. Results from a team effort.
3. Involves the child’s parents as active participants.
4. Investigates all relevant data sources such as observations, historical data, language dominance, educational achievement, sensorimotor development, adaptive behavior, medical or developmental history, personality, and intellectual development. (p. 106).

A holistic approach should be used when assessing AAVE clients to ensure that test bias does not negatively affect the client’s diagnosis. The risk of misdiagnosis of the AAVE dialect is one of the influences behind this study.

Methods

Subjects
A sample of convenience comprised of graduate level students in
Communication Disorders programs from Truman State University and Rockhurst University respectively were invited to participate in this study. Their degree granting undergraduate and graduate institutions, and ages varied. The students from Truman represented four undergraduate institutions and Rockhurst students represented six different universities. A comparison was made between the transcription abilities of students at the two universities. The sample used in the study consisted of 21 participants (14 from Truman, 7 from Rockhurst). All the participants were Caucasian women between the ages of 22 and 28 who were in either their first or second year of graduate school.

**Apparatus and Instruments:**

**Demographic Questionnaire**

A questionnaire was developed consisting of demographic items and items to assess categorical variables such as location of the participant’s undergraduate and graduate institution, degree of prior exposure to AAVE in terms of percentage of the day the participants were in contact with speakers of AAVE (e.g., *never*: 0 - 24%, *rarely*: 25-49%; *sometimes*: 50 – 74%, or *often*: 74 – 100%), participant’s feelings about their preparation to work with clients who speak AAVE (Yes - please explain/No – please explain), and self-assessment whether or not they felt adequately prepared to transcribe AAVE (Yes - please explain/No – please explain).

**Speech Sample**

In order to assess participants’ ability to accurately identify and transcribe AAVE, a sample recording of this vernacular speech was developed using an adult male AAVE speaker from the St. Louis, Missouri metropolitan area, who was recruited through the Ronald E. McNair Summer Research Internship Program. The sample was recorded inside a sound treated Audiology suite at Speech and Hearing Clinic using a Marantz PMD 101 Portable Cassette Recorder. The Goldman Fristoe Test of Articulation (2nd edition) (GFTA-2) was used to elicit the speech sample. The Sound In Words subtest of the GFTA-2 was administered to the AAVE speaker and his responses were recorded. In order to ensure that proper pronunciation of the dialectal features was obtained, the researcher and the man providing the speech sample reviewed the words that would be used for the speech sample. To practice for the recording of the speech sample, the words were written phonetically on note cards and produced first by the researcher. The researcher and her mentor then transcribed the speech sample to 1.) develop a scoring key against which the subjects’ transcriptions were compared 2.) establish inter-scorer reliability. An 84.8% inter-scorer reliability was achieved when scoring for differences using diacritics, and an 89.3% inter scorer reliability was achieved when scoring for differences without using
diacritics. To resolve differences in transcription between the researcher and the
mentor, the sample was listened to collectively and discussion occurred until a
consensus was reached.

Procedure

Experimental Task
The participants were tested as a group in a classroom setting. These classroom
spaces were allocated with permission of the participating institutions. An effort was
made to maintain consistent environments for testing participants. Both testing
locations were on campus classrooms at Truman State University and Rockhurst
University. Both testing groups listened to identical speech samples, wrote their
transcriptions on identical response sheets, and completed the same demographic
survey.

Each participants’ transcriptions was compared against the key created by the
researcher and the mentor. First, a phoneme by phoneme comparison was
performed to determine whether the broadly transcribed phonemes were in
agreement. Next, narrow transcription was used to determine if the diacritics the
participants used were in agreement with the key. When scoring the individual
transcriptions without diacritics, the number of differences between the student’s
transcription and the researcher’s key was subtracted from the total number of
phonemes (201). When scoring the individual transcriptions with diacritics, the
number of differences between the student’s transcription and the researcher’s key
was subtracted from the total number of phonemes and diacritics (223). When
scoring for the items that contained diacritics, the transcriber received credit if the
diacritic was correctly used. Speech transcription data were entered into SPSS and
analyzed by the researcher. The mean level of correct values of all the transcriptions
was compared using the Mann-Whitney U Test.

Results

The study focused on whether differences existed between the transcription skills
of graduate students attending school in rural and urban locations. The following
research question was posed: Do differences exist between transcription abilities
based on exposure to AAVE?

The results of the Mann-Whitney U test showed that a difference existed
between the Truman and Rockhurst groups. The Truman participants transcribed
more phonemes in agreement with the key than the Rockhurst group.

When the transcriptions of the listeners were examined on a phoneme to phoneme basis, excluding the use of diacritics, the 21 participants transcribed on average 151 of the 201 possible phonemes (75% agreement) when compared to the key. The number of phonemes transcribed in agreement with the key ranged from 108-170 (54%-85%). When the subjects’ transcriptions were evaluated more narrowly (i.e., phoneme to phoneme plus the use of diacritics) the number of phonemes transcribed in agreement ranged from 86 to 149 with a mean score of 129/223 (58% agreement). The average score of the Truman transcription when diacritics were not considered was 159 (80% agreement). As a group, Truman students correctly transcribed 80% of the phonemes when compared to the key. When transcriptions were evaluated more narrowly and diacritics were assessed, the Truman mean score was 138/223 (62% agreement). Truman students correctly transcribed 62% of the phonemes and diacritics when compared to the key. Rockhurst participants received mean scores of 66% for the transcription without diacritics and 50% for transcriptions with diacritics.

Table 1

Results of Mann-Whitney Truman vs. Rockhurst

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Descriptive Statistics</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>Minimum</th>
<th>Maximum</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ND # correct</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>150.81</td>
<td>15.924</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D # correct</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>129.24</td>
<td>16.099</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>1.33</td>
<td>.483</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Group 1=Rockhurst; Group 2=Truman)

(ND#= correct phonemes without diacritics; D#= correct phonemes including diacritics)

Listeners’ reported exposure to AAVE

When asked “In the past three months, how often within a clinical setting have you interacted with speakers of AAVE?” 20 of the 21 participants reported that their exposure to clients who speak AAVE was zero to five hours a day. One other participant reported her exposure to be six to 10 hours a day. The survey also contained two sections where students self reported their exposure to AAVE. The participants could respond with “Never” 0-24%, “Rarely” 24-49%, “Sometimes” 50-74%, or “Often” 75-100% regarding daily exposure to AAVE. When the participants were asked: “Do you feel that the level of instruction you received on the transcription of AAVE was adequate to prepare you for clients who are speakers of AAVE?” Fifty seven percent of the participants answered “No” and 43% answered “Yes.”
broken down by university, 71% of Rockhurst students replied “No,” while 29% responded “Yes,” and 50% of Truman students replied “No” and 50% responded yes.

**Discussion and Conclusion**

The results of the study revealed that there was a difference between the two groups’ transcription abilities, and their collective mean score of phonemes transcribed in agreement with the key is “fair” but not as high as is likely desired. Students from both Truman and Rockhurst had significant variability in the number of diacritics transcribed correctly (ranging from zero to ten or more diacritics used during transcription) in their transcriptions. Few of the participants used diacritics on the appropriate phonemes and others neglected to use diacritics when they were needed. Some of the responses varied on self reported preparedness to transcribe AAVE and when the participants commented on their preparedness to transcribe AAVE, the majority of concerns expressed were related to the use of diacritics. When the listening task was presented, the participants were told to use diacritics when appropriate, but not all of the participants used diacritics with their transcription and others wrote in their surveys that they needed to practice using diacritics when transcribing.

Even though Rockhurst University is located in an urban area the Rockhurst participants reported their exposure to AAVE was similar to that of Truman students. The highest reports of AAVE exposure were from two Rockhurst students “SOMETIMES 50-74% of the day.” These two participants reported that they interacted with speakers of AAVE 50-74% of the day in the past three months. Even though the students reported their exposure as relatively high (50-74%) their phoneme by phoneme comparison scores were (139/201) and (142/201). Neither of the two participants used diacritics in their transcriptions. Only one participant (from Rockhurst) reported working with an AAVE client more than 0-5 hours/day. The student with more than 0-5 hours per day AAVE exposure scored in the lower end of the range of transcription scores when diacritics were not compared (136/201). The participant did not use diacritics when transcribing her speech sample. The student who reported relatively frequent work with an AAVE speaking client transcribed 68% of the phonemes correctly as compared to the group mean of 75% (s.d.= 16).

**Weaknesses of the Study**

The study contained weaknesses that can be improved upon for future studies. All of the listeners in this study were Caucasian. A future study could be performed
using only African American participants and then a comparison of the results from the two groups can be made. In addition, sample size was small. Statistically, the minimum number to assume normality is 30, so future studies should employ a greater number of participants (Everitt, 2002).

**Contribution of this study**

This study could aid in future research by showing how graduate students attending urban and rural universities feel about their exposure to AAVE both in professional and casual settings. The importance of being able to identify the dialect is reflected in the following quotation, the authors Robinson and Stockman (2009) state, “The likelihood of misdiagnosis may increase, however, if intelligibility is affected by the use of particular AAE [African American English] phonological patterns such misdiagnoses may explain why African American students are overrepresented on SLPs’ caseloads when compared to the general population” (p. 140). The ability for the clinicians to correctly transcribe AAVE features is beneficial for the clinicians’ future clients.

**Clinical Implications**

The results of the study revealed considerable variability in the transcription abilities of first and second year graduate students during the listening task, and their abilities varied. Scores ranged from 54% to 85% for phoneme by phoneme transcriptions and from 38% to 67% correct for transcriptions with diacritics. Extra steps may have to be taken to ensure that future SLPs are not scoring in the 54% and 38% range when transcribing speech samples. The institutions that train future SLPs should offer skills test throughout the semester to test the clinicians’ transcription abilities with normal speech, disordered speech, and dialects. Instead of the professor providing the speech sample to transcribe or using tapes for transcription it may be more beneficial for volunteers to come to class to provide real life samples. An effort should be made to ensure that the volunteers speak a variety of dialects so the clinicians are not practicing with only SAE speech samples. According to ASHA, when working with a CLD client it is the clinician’s responsibility to become informed about the culture of the client as well as the dialect the client may use. To help clinicians learn about non standard dialects and different cultures, instructors could guide the clinicians towards resources that may help them when learning about CLD clients. Since the study revealed that there was difference between the transcription abilities of the clinicians in urban and rural locations, additional training and testing may be needed to help the clinicians in the study improve transcription of AAVE and awareness of the dialect.
Conclusion

This study explored whether increased exposure to clients who speak AAVE affected the transcription skills of graduate level Communication Disorders students. Truman State University and Rockhurst University graduate students were used for this study. Avoiding issues with clinicians misdiagnosing AAVE as a communication disorder influenced this study. Quantitative analysis of variables predicting dialect recognition and accuracy of transcription was used. Truman participants scored higher than Rockhurst participants on both phoneme by phoneme transcription and transcription including diacritics. The mean score of the participants’ phoneme by phoneme transcription agreement was not as high as desired. To resolve this problem, training institutions could have an AAVE speaker come to class and provide a speech sample for transcription. A smaller than desired sample size was one factor to improve upon when repeating the study. This study could affect the field of Speech-Language Pathology by showing that clinicians may need to continually practice their transcription skills, in particular transcribing AAVE. The information in this study could benefit AAVE speaking clients as well as other CLD clients by demonstrating to institutions the importance of awareness and transcription abilities involving non standard dialects.
References


Appendix

Demographic Survey
Demographics
Age
Gender
Ethnic background
Year in graduate school
Location of graduate school (city, state)
Location of undergraduate school (city, state)

Interaction with speakers of African American Vernacular English (AAVE)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Never 0-24% Of the day</th>
<th>Rarely 25-49%</th>
<th>Sometimes 50-74%</th>
<th>Often 75-100%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In the past three months, how often did you interact with speakers of AAVE?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In the past three months, how often in social settings did you interact with speakers of AAVE?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0-5 hours/day</td>
<td>6-10 hours/day</td>
<td>11-15 hours/day</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In the past three months, how often within a clinical setting have you interacted with speakers of AAVE?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Do you feel that your interaction with AAVE speakers affects your transcription skills? Yes/No (Please Explain)

Do you feel that the level of instruction you received on the transcription of AAVE was adequate to prepare you for clients who are speakers of AAVE? Yes/No (Please Explain)
Appendix B

Participant Answer sheet

RESPONSE FORM/ANSWER SHEET
(Transcribe using IPA)

1. 
2. 
3. 
4. 
5. 
6. 
7. 
8. 
9. 
10. 
11. 
12. 
13. 
14. 
15. 
16. 
17. 
18. 
19. 
20. 
21. 
22. 
23. 
24. 
25. 
26. 
27. 
28. 
29. 
30. 
31. 
32. 
33. 
34.
A Comparison of Attitudes Regarding Health Insurance among Students at Truman State University

Dominique Johnson

Dr. Janice Clark Young, Mentor

A study was conducted at a Midwestern, liberal arts university to survey students’ attitudes about their need for health insurance coverage. A 33-item survey was administered online to Truman State University students (N=42, 11 males and 31 females) enrolled during summer semester 2009. The data indicated that the majority of survey respondents (85.7%, n=36) were insured mainly through their parents’ policies, did not think college students are more prone to have accidents and unintentional injuries than other age groups, and health insurance coverage was neither necessary while in college, nor important afterwards. All of the uninsured students were satisfied with being uninsured. Results suggested that more information should be made available to students regarding the university-offered health plan. Further investigation is recommended because of the small sample size of this study and the limited amount of existing research about college students, their insurance coverage, and their attitudes about health insurance.
Why are there uninsured college students on university campuses? This question is frequently not considered, except by the ones who are uninsured while in college. Even so, the uninsured students don’t think about this until they are placed in an emergency situation and being uninsured becomes very costly. The lack of health insurance is part of a nationwide problem in America today. There are many US citizens who do not have health insurance and college students often fall into this category (Government Accountability Office, 2006). Yet, the problem may go unrecognized because it is assumed that college students are either insured by their parents’ health care plans or by their school’s health care plan. Unfortunately, this is not always the case.

A recent study by the Government Accountability Office (GAO), suggested that 1.7 million college students were uninsured (GAO, 2006). At Truman State University, health insurance coverage is not a requirement for domestic students prior to matriculation. Conversely, it is required for international students. A student health survey at Truman State University is conducted every two years. The 2006 survey was administered to 1,500 randomly selected students chosen to represent the 6,000 students at Truman. Of the 1,500 students surveyed, 90% of the students were covered by their parents’ health insurance plan.

Literature Review

Approximately 1.7-million college students aged 18-23 were uninsured in 2006 (Dawn, 2008). Uninsured students incurred $120 - $255 million in uncompensated expenses for injury-related medical events in 2005 (GAO, 2006). Certain groups of students were more likely than others to be uninsured. For example, in 2006, 38% of Hispanic, 29% of Black, and 26% of Asian college students aged 18-23 were uninsured, in contrast with 15% of uninsured white students (GAO, 2006). These racial and ethnic statistics are consistent with characteristics of the uninsured found in the general U.S. population (GAO, 2006).

Students are uninsured for a variety of reasons. The most common explanation is that health insurance coverage through the parents’ employment has been terminated. Many family insurance plans do not cover children once they reach 23-24 years of age, while some plans drop coverage automatically at age 18 years (Brindis, 1997).

To assist with students’ health care coverage while enrolled, many colleges and universities offer students health insurance plans that are as much as 30% lower than those in the commercial market (Gibson, 2005). Additionally, students cannot be deprived coverage for pre-existing health conditions (Gibson, 2005). These plans often provide coverage for frequent student medical needs like treatment for drug-and-alcohol-related illness, injuries, eating disorder counseling, and prenatal care
Although universities and states have taken a variety of steps to increase the number of insured college students, there are still related insurance issues. The GAO (2006) has reported some states have expanded the eligibility for dependents to remain on their parents’ plans; this option is typically for full-time students only (Redden, 2008). However, there is a maximum age of eligibility for insurance, or mandating continuing coverage for students who take a leave of absence or switch to part-time status for medical reasons (Redden, 2008). Some states including Massachusetts and New Jersey have laws in place requiring full-time college students to have health insurance (Redden, 2008). Currently, the State of Missouri only requires international students to have health insurance coverage.

Many young adults do not feel that they are at risk for illness or injury because of their age and previous good health, so obtaining health insurance is not a priority. Reducing financial risk or uncertainty is the economic purpose of insurance (Manning & Marquis, 1989). In order to reduce the risk of a large financial loss caused by the possibility of future occurrences of illness and the resultant medical care expense, individuals are generally willing to pay more than an actuarially fair amount for health insurance (Manning & Marquis, 1989). There is not a great deal of certainty that young adults with many other financial priorities will pay for this type of expense if they strongly feel they have no personal need for it the given time.

There are many potential health consequences that uninsured college students may face. According to Sara Collins, assistant vice president for the Program on the Future of Health at the Commonwealth Fund, the number of prevalent health risks among young adults, such as obesity is increasing (Collins, 2008). Also, 3.5 million pregnancies occur each year among women ages 19-29, while one-third of all HIV diagnoses are made among this age group, and injury-related visits to emergency rooms are most common among young adults (Collins, 2008). Losing insurance disrupts young adults’ access to the health care system, introduces barriers to care when it is needed, and leaves them and their families at risk for high out-of-pocket costs in the event of a serious illness or severe injury (Collins, 2008).

Uninsured college students also may experience spiraling health care costs and untreated health problems. There is evidence suggesting that the decisions of health professionals differ due to the insurance status of the patient (U.S. Congress, Office of Technology Assessment, 1992). Insurance coverage also plays a role in physicians’ decisions to order procedures or other uses of health care resources (The Congress of the United States Congressional Budget Office, 1991).

One study reported that uninsured individuals ranged from slightly less likely to more than twice as likely to receive less intensive care than individuals who are privately insured, when other factors potentially related to differences in the process
of care were considered (U.S. Congress, Office of Technology Assessment, 1992). It has also been noted that people without insurance are less likely to have routine diagnostic tests, less likely to undergo key surgical procedures, and more likely to die during their stay in a hospital than those with similar health status who had private insurance (The Congress of the United States Congressional Budget Office, 1991). This study estimated that uninsured hospital patients were 1.2-3.2 times more likely to die than were insured patients (The Congress of the United States Congressional Budget Office, 1991).

Today in the United States, gaining access to health services typically depends on the individual’s ability to pay for those services, (U.S. Congress, Office of Technology Assessment, 1992). The receipt of health services can be critical to improving and maintaining health (U.S. Congress, Office of Technology Assessment, 1992). Some form of third party payment—either public coverage or private insurance—has become a necessity to cushion the financial impact of seeking health care services (U.S. Congress, Office of Technology Assessment, 1992). Lack of health insurance is a serious national problem in the United States. No matter what age, being uninsured presents serious potential threats. Therefore, the purpose of this study is to survey students’ attitudes regarding health insurance.

Research Question

What are Truman students’ attitudes about the need for health insurance?

Methods

To explore the research question, a 33-question survey was developed by the investigator to determine what undergraduate Truman State University students’ attitudes were regarding health insurance.

Instrument: The questionnaire included: 1) demographic items including ethnicity, age, race, gender, and insurance status; and 2) Likert-type items regarding participants’ attitudes about being insured or uninsured with a five-point response set ranging from “strongly agree” “agree”, “to “strongly disagree”.

Participants: Participants for this study were undergraduate students enrolled at Truman State University during the 2009 summer session. All students were recruited by a campus e-mail to complete the online questionnaire.

Procedures: Permission to conduct the study was received from Truman State University’s Institutional Review Board (IRB) during the spring of 2009. After IRB approval, the investigator contacted Information Technology Services (ITS) to request permission to post the online survey and upload it to the Truman server. Undergraduate Truman students enrolled in summer school were e-mailed an IRB-approved invitation letter with a link to the Truman website-hosted questionnaire.
welcome page with IRB information about their rights and other appropriate disclosures appeared for participants to read and respond to by “electronic signature” before gaining access to the survey. Potential participants who did not provide an electronic signature were redirected from the page. The online questionnaire was available to Truman students for two weeks after the initial e-mail invitation. At the end of the survey, the respondents were provided an additional web page link, for the option of participating in an online drawing to win a $25 Ruby Tuesday gift card. This web page required participants to provide their name, a phone number, and email address where the winner could be reached. One individual’s name was randomly selected and notified as to how to receive the gift card.

Data Analysis: Data was downloaded from the ITS website and imported into SPSS (Statistical Package for the Social Sciences) version 16.0 software for analysis. To reduce the likelihood of Type I error, the level for significance was set at \( p \leq 0.05 \). Relationships between the independent variables (age, sex, class standing, ethnicity, and health insurance coverage) and the dependent variables (attitudes and beliefs) regarding health were examined.

Results and Discussion

A total of 42 students completed the online health insurance survey. The respondents were 11 males and 31 females ranging in age from 18-22+ years of age (2.4% were 18 years old, 14.3% were aged 19, 26.2% were 20, 38.1% were 21 years old, and 19% were 22 years old or older). Of the 42 students participating in the survey, 14.3% were sophomores, 21.4% were juniors, and 64.3% were seniors. The ethnicities of the participants were 78.6% South Asian (from India, Nepal, etc), 2.4% Hispanic, 2.4% Hawaiian/Pacific Islander, 4.8% African American, and 11.8% classified themselves as “other”.

The majority of survey respondents (85.7%, \( n=36 \)) were insured, while 14.3% (\( n=6 \)) reported being uninsured. Of the insured students, 83.3% were covered under their parents’ health insurance policy, 2.4% had a private insurance policy that they bought themselves, 9.5% did not have health insurance, and 4.8% indicated “other” insurance coverage.

When participants were asked to describe their own health condition, 21.4% reported that they were in “poor” condition, 33.3% listed “below average”, 40.5% were in “average” condition, 2.4% responded “above average” condition, and 2.4% believed they were in “excellent” health condition. In response to the question asking whether or not they had experienced a serious illness in the past 12 months, 47.6% answered “yes,” and 52.4% reported not experiencing illness. When asked whether or not they have been contacted by a collection agency within the past 12 months, 73.8% or the participants reported “no”, 16.7% reported “yes,” and 9.5%
reported not knowing if they had been contacted. The location for respondents’ personal health care was as follows: 71.4% received care at a private doctor’s office, 16.7% at a “public clinic or community health center”, 4.8% at a “hospital clinic”, and 7.1% at a “hospital emergency room”.

Participants answered questions regarding their attitudes about health insurance. This data was processed through a cross-tab chi-square analysis, and the responses of insured participants versus the uninsured participants were compared. In these, no significant results were found. Out of 36 of the insured students, 69.4% “strongly disagreed”, 27.8% “disagreed”, and 2.8% were “neutral” in their responses as to whether or not health insurance is necessary while in college. (See Table 1.) When asked whether college students were at more risk for accidents and unintentional injuries than other age groups, 27.8% of these insured students “strongly disagreed”, 33.3% “disagreed”, and 33.3% were “neutral”, and 5.6% “agreed”. When asked if they felt health insurance coverage was important once they graduate from college, 83.3% of the insured participants “disagreed”, 13.9% were “neutral”, and 2.8% “agreed” in their opinions. In response to whether or not it was easy for them to get medical care when they need it, 30.6% of the insured students “disagreed”, 52.8% were “neutral”, 8.3% “agreed”, and 8.3% “strongly agreed”. Lastly, the participants were asked if they felt privileged having health insurance, and 44.4% of these respondents “disagreed” with the statement, 36.1% were “neutral”, 13.9% “agreed”, and 5.6% “strongly agreed” in their responses (See Table 1).

Table 1: Percentage of Response to Questions Regarding Health Insurance (N=42)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Health Insurance Coverage</th>
<th>Survey Question: Is health insurance necessary while in college?</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Insured (n=36)</td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2.8%</td>
<td>27.8%</td>
<td>69.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uninsured (n=6)</td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>33.3%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>66.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Survey Question: Are college students more at risk for accidents and unintentional injuries than other age groups?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SA</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Insured (n=36)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5.6%</td>
<td>33.3%</td>
<td>33.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uninsured (n=6)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>16.7%</td>
<td>33.3%</td>
<td>33.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Survey Question: Is health insurance coverage important once you graduate from college?
A Comparison of Attitudes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Insured (n=36)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2.8%</td>
<td>13.9%</td>
<td>83.3%</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uninsured (n=6)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>16.7%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>16.7%</td>
<td>66.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Survey Question: Is it easy for you to get medical help when you need it?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Insured (n=36)</td>
<td>8.3%</td>
<td>8.3%</td>
<td>52.8%</td>
<td>30.6%</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uninsured (n=6)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>33.3%</td>
<td>33.4%</td>
<td>33.3%</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Survey Question: Do you feel privileged/underprivileged having/not having health insurance?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Insured (n=36)</td>
<td>5.6%</td>
<td>13.9%</td>
<td>36.1%</td>
<td>44.4%</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uninsured (n=6)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>16.7%</td>
<td>33.3%</td>
<td>50.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Survey Question: Are you satisfied with being uninsured?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Uninsured (n=6)</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In contrast, the attitudes of the uninsured (n=6) participants differed from the insured students in this study. When asked whether they were satisfied with being uninsured, 100% of the uninsured respondents reported that they “strongly agreed” with this statement. (See Table 1). The majority of uninsured students (66.7%) “strongly disagreed” that health insurance was necessary for them to have during college, while one-third were “neutral” in their responses to this question. When asked if they believed they were more at risk for accidents and unintentional injuries than any other age group, 16.7% of these uninsured students “strongly disagreed”, one-third “disagreed”, one-third were “neutral”, and 16.7% “agreed”. The uninsured students were evenly split in their responses about the ease of getting personal medical care when they need it (33.3% “disagreed”, 33.4% were “neutral”, and 33.3% agreed). Regarding their belief of the importance of health insurance once they graduate, 66.6% of the uninsured “strongly disagreed” 16.7% “disagreed”, and 16.7% “agreed”. These participants did not indicate feeling underprivileged by not having health insurance (50% “strongly disagreed”, 33.3% “disagreed”, and 16.7% were “neutral”).

Non-Parametric Chi-Squared analyses of differences between age categories, ethnicity, sex, and class standing and health insurance coverage were investigated. The attitudes of the insured participants versus the uninsured were examined using Kruskal-Wallis Non-Parametric One-Way Analysis of Variance (ANOVA). Due to the
small sample size of this study, these data analyses did not produce significant results.

A Non-Parametric Kruskal-Wallis One-Way ANOVA was conducted regarding the participants’ responses to serious illness in the past 12 months and their self-description of their health. In the ANOVA testing, there was a significant difference (p=0.49) in the amount of individuals who reported having a serious illness within the last 12 months by their self-reported health condition. Respondents who noted their health as “above average” or “poor” had more health issues during the past 12 months compared to those who reported their health status as being “average” or “excellent”. (See Table 2.) The limitation to this analysis was that there was only one subject in the “above average” health category.

Table 2: Non-Parametric Kruskal-Wallis Test of Serious Illness and Description of Health (N=42)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Description of Health</th>
<th>Number of Respondents</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Mean Rank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Serious Illness</td>
<td>Poor</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>21.4%</td>
<td>27.83*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Past 12 Months</td>
<td>Below Average</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>33.3%</td>
<td>23.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Average</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>40.4%</td>
<td>16.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Above Average</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.02%</td>
<td>32.50*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Excellent</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.02%</td>
<td>11.50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*p≤.05

The results of this study indicated that the majority of these college participants did not believe that health insurance is important to have while in college, nor after graduation. This unanticipated response may be due to the fact that unintentional injuries and accidents, not diseases, are the most frequent cause of death or disability for college students (Collins, 2008). Because most college students experience the typical good health of their age group and expect it to continue, they may not realize the need for health insurance.

In this study, the students’ falsely believed they are not more at risk of having accidents and unintentional injuries than any other age group. Many young people are risk takers and naively think their chances of injury are minimal. Since they assume they are not going to get hurt, it is understandable that they would not strongly feel that health insurance is necessary.

The majority of participants in this study had health insurance, and had coverage under their parents’ insurance policies. Since their coverage has always been provided for them, they may not comprehend the importance of health insurance in the
future. Therefore, since most of the students in this study have not yet fully assumed adult responsibilities, they may not understand the potential financial burdens being uninsured might cause them.

Limitations

In this study, participants’ attitudes were measured by self-report. In order to ensure the validity of self-reported data, methods recommended by Rouse, Kozel, and Richards (1985) were followed to gather data through anonymous inquiry, using brief, easily understood directions to complete the survey. The use of self-report provided estimates of the students’ most current attitudes regarding health insurance at the time of the survey.

The small number of participants who completed the online questionnaire during the summer session was another limitation of the study. The typical demographics of Truman State University were not reflected in the participating students. For example, there were no freshman students that completed the questionnaire. There are different proportions of ethnicities in the total student population during the academic year at Truman. Therefore, within context of the volunteered population sample, the results of this study have to be examined very carefully.

Conclusions and Recommendations

Based on the findings of this study, most of the students in this research study did not seriously consider the need for having adequate health insurance coverage. They also did not understand that young adults are more prone to have accidents and unintentional injuries than any other age group. Since the majority of these participants classified their current personal health status as being “average” or “below average”, it would be important for them to understand that health insurance will make a difference when they are faced with serious injuries, accidents, and diseases.

Even though the number of participants in this study was small, it is still important to understand college students’ attitudes about health insurance, especially since their age group is more at-risk than other age groups. This study on undergraduate students’ attitudes regarding health insurance is important primarily because very little research is available on this subject. Since most individuals are removed from their parents’ health insurance policies between the ages of 18-24, it is important to know how many students are in this situation, and whether they have health insurance coverage or not. Additionally, it is useful to know if they are aware of the university-offered health insurance plan and about the affordability of available policies for college students. It is recommended that more information be made
more available to Truman students regarding the university-offered health plan.

Further investigation on this topic is recommended because of the small amount of existing research about college students and their health insurance, as well as about the attitudes of these young adults. The investigator plans to continue this research study during the fall semester at Truman State University in order to gather a larger sample of participants, and to refine and expand the online survey questions.

To reduce the consequences for the 1.7 million uninsured college students, health insurance coverage is necessary. Universities and states should take the lead to provide low-cost group plans for college students as a way to reduce the health care gap for them.
A Comparison of Attitudes

References


Collins, S. (2008, April 29). *Rising Numbers of Uninsured Young Adults: Causes, Consequences, and New Policies*, Invited Testimony, Subcommittee on Federal Workforce, Postal Service, and the District of Columbia Committee on Oversight and Government Reform, US House of Representatives Hearing on “Providing Health Insurance to Young Adults Enrolled as Dependents in FEHBP.”


Factors that Influence Retention of Black Male Educators

Jeremy E. Mapp

Wendy S. Miner, Ph.D., Mentor

A study was conducted to discover factors that impact retention of black male educators in the education profession. This study surveyed current black male educators in St. Louis, Kansas City, Columbia, and Northeast Missouri area public school districts. Thirteen participants were recruited using the snowball sampling technique. They completed paper surveys seeking to discover factors that impact retention of black male educators. These participants reported that they enjoyed their jobs because it was rewarding to see students achieve. Frequencies were reported from the data given by participants.

As a child, I loved elementary school. I had the opportunity to participate in student government, honor organizations, orchestra, and sports. What I remember most were the faculty and staff I encountered in elementary, middle, and high school. I had many great classroom teachers who were indeed all different, they had different names, different experiences, different backgrounds, but one thing was always the same...their gender. I never had a male classroom teacher growing up and most specifically, I never had a black male classroom teacher. I feel I could have benefited from a male role model in the classroom, and I wondered why there were
so few black male educators. During my junior year at Truman State University, I had the opportunity to gain field experience in an elementary classroom. On the first day, many students stared at me - probably both frightened and interested to know “who in the world is this guy?” I entered the classroom of all white students in rural Missouri and even my mentor teacher later told me, “You were not at all what I expected.” Honestly, a black male entering an elementary school in rural Missouri is the last thing anyone would expect. These experiences led me to research retention of black male educators, because there is much to be gained, for students and staff members, from having a diverse teaching population. It is important to recruit exemplary black male teachers, but the retention of them is vital.

Literature Review

History of Blacks in Education

In the days of slavery, there was no education for blacks. Through the years, segregated, poorly-funded schools were developed. In segregated school systems of the early and middle 20th century, black students attended schools operated mostly by experienced, dedicated, concerned, and skilled black educators, who lived in the same communities in which they taught. Many of these teachers developed meaningful professional relationships with students and their families outside of the school (Milner & Howard, 2004). Black teachers and principals were interested in the whole child. They told students what they could do when everyone else told them what they could not accomplish (Roundtable Inc., 2001). The black teachers were very qualified, even more so than white teachers in the white schools (Roundtable Inc., 2001). Most black teachers had their master’s degrees, and other jobs weren’t open for blacks (Roundtable Inc., 2001). When schools became integrated with the passage of Brown vs. Board of Education of Topeka, KS, both Whites and Blacks had concerns, “a white school committee (board) said colored children’s peculiar structure requires educational treatment different from that of white children” and some blacks thought, “What kind of education would our children receive from a white teacher? The Smith School (black school) should hire a black teacher with a college degree” (Roundtable Inc., 2001). The Brown v. Board of Education of Topeka decision focused on integration of black children; however, no one ever sought the black teachers (Roundtable Inc., 2001). According to Holmes (1990) and King (1993), approximately 38,000 black teachers and administrators in 17 states lost their positions between 1954 and 1965.

Black teachers are still low in number according to recent research, “The black teaching force has declined significantly over the last few decades and continues to
decline even in 2003” (Milner & Howard, 2004, p. 285). In today’s post-Civil Rights era, ironically, fewer African American men are pursuing these professional roles (Chmelynski, 2006). Extensive evidence suggests many black males do not choose teaching as a career because it is not a high paying job and they fear being accused of abuse (Chmelynski, 2006). This decline in the black teaching force has led to a need for recruitment of these professionals, because there is a shortage of black teachers, specifically black male teachers.

**Need for Black Male Teachers**

There is a shortage of black male educators in K-12 classrooms. According to the Institute of Education Sciences (2004), nearly 17% of K-12 public school students were black in 2004. The US Department of Education and National Center for Education Statistics reported that, 6.5% of teachers were black in 2002 (Milner & Howard, 2004), however, only 2.4% of approximately three million K-12 public teachers were black males (Chmelynski, 2006).

Some would argue that Brown v. Board of Education of Topeka marked the beginning of the troubled cycle of underachievement for many black students and that their quality of education has not been the same since (Milner & Howard, 2004). According to Lee (1991), black male students’ academic and social problems are often intensified by educators’ inability to understand black culture and black male development. Fordham and Ogbu (1986) reported that gender socialization encourages and rewards black males for not achieving academically. However, Irvine (1990) has suggested that “when teachers and black students are culturally aligned, better communication, effective instruction, and positive teacher affect are reported” (Brown & Butty, 1999, p. 282). Previous research conducted on 540 school districts and 668 college campuses indicated that the academic performance of minority students improves when school faculties include minority teachers (Weiher, 2000). Black male educators establish positive learning environments, with more time dedicated to teaching and learning (Kunjufu, 2002) and they are also better adapted for boys, in that they talk less, use humor, and are more understanding of boys’ attitudes and behaviors (Kleinfel, 2007). Black male teachers and administrators enhance black males’ academic and social development in a more positive manner (Brown & Butty, 1999).

With a student population expected to continue to grow in size and diversity, an aging and gender imbalanced teaching force, and high teacher “burn out” rates, there is a need for new and diverse teachers (Brown & Butty, 1999). However, the number of black male teachers is influenced by the number of black males who attend college, which is influenced by the number of black males who graduate from high school and so on (Brown & Butty, 1999).
Recruitment and Retention

Dr. Chance Lewis (2006) studied black male educators at three urban school districts in Louisiana in an effort to find factors that would help bring black males into the education profession. According to Lewis (2006), over the past decade, education organizations have suggested that black male teachers who leave school districts are usually more talented and qualified — based on teaching evaluations and college grade point average — than those who choose to remain in the profession. Lewis (2006) suggested that it is important that school districts are proactive in finding teaching positions within the districts that will allow high-quality African American teachers to stay in the classroom.

One such program recruiting black male teachers specifically is based at Clemson University in South Carolina. The Call Me Mister program offers up to $5,000 a year in monetary assistance in return for teaching in South Carolina schools (Matus, 2005).

Over the past decade, the main efforts to diversify the teaching profession have been focused on recruitment, with very little attention given to the retention of existing black male teachers (Kunjufu, 2002). Therefore, my research question is: “What specific factors contribute to Black male retention within the professional field of K – 12 Education?”

Method

Participants

Participants were primarily recruited through the snowball sampling technique. Educators and administrators who were known personally by the researcher, or through other individuals already in the profession were contacted via email requesting contact information for other black male teachers who may have also been interested in participating, hence the “snowball sampling” technique for recruitment. Due to the relatively small number of black male educators in general, a sample of convenience comprised of 13 black male educators from the St. Louis, Columbia, Kansas City, and Northeast Missouri area was recruited.

Instruments

Many of the survey questions come from a study conducted by Dr. Chance Lewis, entitled, “African American Male Teachers in Public Schools: An Examination of Three Urban School Districts” (Lewis, 2006). This survey included items based in part on the scale developed by Lewis (2006) eliciting:

- The educator’s opinions of the school at which they are currently employed
Factors That Influence Retention

(e.g., mission, resources, etc.)

• The educator’s attachment to the school
• The educator’s relationship with the administration
• The educator’s career plans for the next school year
• Factors that originally attracted the educator to the profession
• A few demographic questions will be used in the questionnaire.

A few Likert-scale items that addressed retention and the open-ended responses were courtesy of “Why Do They Stay? Elementary Teachers’ Perceptions of Job Satisfaction and Retention” (Perrachione, Rosser, & Petersen, 2008). Participants also addressed demographic items. (See Appendix A).

Procedure

After obtaining Truman State University Institutional Review Board (IRB) approval, I contacted school district administrators who approved my request to conduct research and identified qualifying individuals willing to participate in the study. Next, educators and administrators I knew, personally or through other individuals already in the profession, were contacted via email requesting contact information for black male teachers who might be interested in participating. Once possible participants were identified, a packet was sent to them at their school address via US Postal Service containing, an informed consent form, a copy of the survey, and a self addressed postage paid return envelope for the survey. Participants were also sent an email notifying them that they should be expecting a survey within a couple of days. Upon receiving the survey, teachers had the opportunity to sign the consent form and return it, if they so chose. Over a two-week period while waiting for surveys to be returned, I worked with my mentor to code the survey for analysis in SPSS (statistical computer software). This allowed my mentor and I to quantitatively analyze how differences in school settings and locations affect black male educators’ attitudes about their job and what sustains their interest in the field of education. Once the surveys were returned, the quantitative survey data were reviewed and descriptive statistics were obtained from Likert scale items. Other items were assigned numerical values and emerging themes were identified for open-ended responses.

Data Analysis

Due to the low sample size (N), I analyzed the data according to frequencies.

Results

Thirteen black male educators from the St. Louis, Columbia, Kansas City, and Northeast Missouri areas participated in the study. Participants identified their
schools as urban, suburban, or rural according to their own opinion. Three participants were from urban schools, eight participants were from suburban schools, and two participants were from rural schools. Participants range from 21 to 60 years old (see table 1).

Table 1 Age of Black Male Educators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Range</th>
<th>Participants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>21-30</td>
<td>3 (23%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-40</td>
<td>4 (30%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41-50</td>
<td>1 (8%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51-60</td>
<td>5 (39%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61+</td>
<td>0 (0%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All thirteen participants reported that they will return to the field of education for the next school year. Ninety-two percent of the participants will return to the same position in the same school for the next school year.

The top three influences for these participants to enter the profession were: family members, high school teachers, and experiences with school aged children. In addition, the educators’ experience ranges from 1 to over 14 years (see table 2).

Table 2 Years of Experience

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Years of Experience</th>
<th>Participants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1-3</td>
<td>3 (23%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-6</td>
<td>2 (15%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-10</td>
<td>1 (8%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11-13</td>
<td>2 (15%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14+</td>
<td>5 (39%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Many of the participants have some loyalty to their job. Ninety-two percent of the participants reported they would become a teacher again if they could repeat college. Seventy-seven percent of the participants are highly satisfied with teaching (see table 3). The remaining 23% are medium to highly satisfied with teaching (see table 3).

Table 3 Satisfaction with Teaching

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Encouraging</th>
<th>Discouraging</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(4)</td>
<td>(3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(77%)</td>
<td>(23%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Very Encouraging</th>
<th>Very Discouraging</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(1)</td>
<td>(2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(0%)</td>
<td>(0%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Seventy-seven percent of the participants reported that the contributions they could make to humanity, through teaching, were very encouraging (see table 4). The remaining 23% reported that the contributions to humanity were encouraging (see table 4).
Table 4 Contributions to Humanity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Very Encouraging (4)</th>
<th>Encouraging (3)</th>
<th>Discouraging (2)</th>
<th>Discouraging (1)</th>
<th>Not Applicable (0)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participants</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(77%)</td>
<td>(23%)</td>
<td>(0%)</td>
<td>(0%)</td>
<td>(0%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Discussion

The thirteen participants’ are not representative of all black male educators. Although the participants did represent varying age groups and years of experience, the researcher cannot assume that these are the views of all black male educators.

The participants reported that they enjoyed their jobs because it is rewarding to see students achieve. They addressed salary, parental support, and planning flexibility as areas for improvement. This means they believe teachers deserve more pay, teachers need supportive parents working with their students, and teachers want to be able to plan some lessons on their own. These areas for improvement were however, not significant enough for these participants to leave the profession.

All of the participants say they will be returning to the education field next year, and all but one will return to the same position at the same school. This demonstrates that these are educators dedicated to the field of education and their students.

My study attempted to answer the question: “What specific factors contribute to Black male retention within the professional field of K–12 Education?” The answer to this question was the same for most of the participants. All thirteen participants reported that the contributions they make to humanity is an encouraging factor as to why they stay in the profession. “Contributions to humanity” was open to interpretation on the survey. The researcher explained it as, the things that they (educators) do to help mankind. In answering open-ended responses, many participants explained that seeing students achieve is what retains them.

There are areas that participants felt could be improved upon to better assist educators. The first and most popular area for improvement which could be of concern for these teachers is salary. Salary is still something the participants are not happy with, consequently it still is perceived as a disadvantage of the profession, as many Americans believe that beginning teachers should earn more than they are currently paid (Wilson, 2009).

The second problem these educators addressed was a need for planning flexibility. The books are not only a guide for the lesson, but the curriculum requires you to follow it word for word. This leaves little room for creativity on the teacher’s part. Parental support was another area for improvement. Some teachers felt their
students were not being supported at home and teachers even expressed that in some cases, parents side with the student making it difficult to teach students skills for success.

Another finding from this research, one teacher expressed that they feel pressure being the only black person at conferences, within school staff, at meetings, etc. This could be a deterrent from the profession for some professionals. In addition, some educators may report “being the only black person” as a reason for leaving the profession. Salary, parental support, and planning flexibility are areas within education suggested by the participants that need to be improved for all teachers and some specific concerns for black male educators were evident.

There were questions addressing recruitment for profession as well. Out of 11 possible influences for entering the profession, these 13 participants rated family members, high school teachers, and experiences with school-aged children as the most influential. The term “family members” could be that family members encouraged them to teach or were teachers themselves, high school teachers could have encouraged them to teach or were such good teachers that they saw them as role models, and experiences with school-aged children could be earlier in life or during their college years. These influences could be emphasized to better address recruitment of black male educators.

This study’s findings have led me to these recommendations for school districts and universities: 1.) there should be a focus on providing black male students with opportunities to work with school-aged children and parents; and 2.) high school teachers should be targeted to mentor students in career planning.

Limitations

There were factors that limited my study. My research question was focused on a direct group of individuals which made my possible participant list extremely small. Initially, my surveys were sent via US mail only. Our ability to find participants was limited to contacts my mentor and I currently had in the public schools. This drastically narrowed our pool of participants. With surveys available online (which we had not yet made possible), people could access them anytime, easily notify others to participate, etc.

These educators are also very satisfied with their job. There are educators that do not enjoy teaching and educators who left teaching that were not participants in the study. There are numerous factors that limited this study and therefore could be improved upon for future studies. I intend on continuing to increase the sample size, so that statistical analyses can be calculated on the data rather than frequencies.

Further Implications
This study will extend to the fall semester for more data collection. The surveys will be available online and participants will continue to be recruited through the snowball sampling technique. The online survey will be hosted on the Truman website and participants will be able to access the survey at anytime and simply send a link of the survey on to other participants.

Once more data are collected; it will be analyzed using the Kruskal Wallis (one-way ANOVA for ranked/ordinal data) statistical method. The researcher will analyze the data for differences in the urban, suburban, and rural groups. In addition, I will have some data to take to colleges on why students enter the education profession so that recruitment of black male educators can improve as well.
References


Appendix A

Factors that Influence Retention Survey
2009

General Instructions: Most of the questions in this survey are answered by circling a single number or letter, which best indicates your response. (A few of the questions may call for several answers – on these please check all responses that best match your experiences.) If there are questions that you cannot or would rather not answer, leave them blank.

If you know any other black male teachers who may be willing to take this survey, please let me know their contact information via email at jmapp@truman.edu. We are using the snowball sampling technique, because you may know of other black males teaching in Missouri who may be willing to participate. Please only fill out one survey.

Please complete and return this survey ASAP. Do not hesitate to contact myself or my mentor with any questions, jmapp@truman.edu or 314-422-8752, and wsm@truman.edu or 660-785-4386.

Confidentiality: You can be assured of complete confidentiality of your responses. Your name will never be placed on the questionnaire and your answers will be treated confidentially. Specific answers will not be shared with anyone outside of my mentor and myself and will only be reported statistically to avoid revealing individual responses.

Please return the survey in the postage paid self-addressed envelope provided.

Thank you again for your participation.


I. YOUR PERSONAL EXPERIENCE

The following questions relate to the school in which you currently teach. Circle your response.

1. My school is classified as:
   a. Rural
   b. Suburban
   c. Urban

2. What percentage of the student population is not Caucasian?
   a. 25% or less
   b. 26% to 50%
   c. 51% to 75%
   d. 76% or more

3. What percentage of the faculty would not identify themselves as Caucasian?
   a. 25% or less
   b. 26% to 50%
   c. 51% to 75%
   d. 76% or more

4. Is your satisfaction with teaching...
   a. Generally high
   b. Medium to high
   c. Medium
   d. Low to medium
   e. Generally low

5. The most influential person(s) in your decision to teach (Circle all that apply):
   a. Family member
   b. Elementary teacher
   c. Middle/junior high teacher
   d. High school teacher
   e. Friend
   f. Elementary principal
   g. High school principal
   h. Counselor
   i. College professor/advisor
   j. Minister/Pastor
   k. Experiences w/school-aged children (summer camps, Sunday school, tutoring, coaching, etc.)
   l. Other (please specify) ___________________________________________
II. The following items represent various factors of teaching. Please rate each factor as you regard its relative degree of encouragement for retaining your current teaching position. Circle the number.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factors</th>
<th>Very Encouraging (4)</th>
<th>Very Encouraging (3)</th>
<th>Discouraging (2)</th>
<th>Discouraging (1)</th>
<th>Not Applicable (0)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Salary</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Benefits</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Contributions to humanity</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Individual social status</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Location of job</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. Class size</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g. Curriculum</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>h. Size of district/school</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i. Job security/support</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>j. Working conditions</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>k. Goals (long/short term)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>l. Administrative support</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>m. School district reputation</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n. School calendar (summer/holiday breaks, etc.)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o. Professional development opportunities</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p. Positive relationships with others (colleagues, administration,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Parents, community) 4 3 2 1 0
Other 4 3 2 1 0

III. Please circle each response that best represents whether you agree or disagree.
Future Plans Strongly Agree Agree Disagree Strongly Disagree
a. I plan to remain in this same teaching position for the next school year. 4 3 2 1
b. I plan to remain in this school for the next school year. 4 3 2 1
c. I plan to remain in education field for the next school year. 4 3 2 1

IV. Please answer the following questions and explain your reasoning.
1. If you could restart college with your knowledge of the teaching profession, would you be a teacher again?
   Why or why not?
2. What would be the number one action schools could take to encourage teachers to remain in teaching?
   Why?
3. Please write anything you would like to add that was not addressed in the survey.

V. DEMOGRAPHICS
Circle your response.
1. Age:
   a. 21–30
   b. 31–40
   c. 41–50
   d. 51–60
   e. 61+
2. Which do you consider to be your racial/ethnic group?
   a. Black or African-American, not of Hispanic origin
   b. Other
3. Years of experience (entire career)
   a. 1-3  
   b. 4-6  
   c. 7-10 
   d. 11-13 
   e. 14+

4. Grade level(s) for which you have had instructional responsibility (circle at all that apply)
   a. Elementary  
   b. Middle School  
   c. High School

5. Grade level for which you currently have primary teaching responsibility (circle one)
   a. K-2  
   b. 3-5  
   c. 6-8 
   d. 9-12

6. Circle the one content area which you spend most of your time teaching
   a. Math  
   b. Communication Arts  
   c. Science  
   d. Social Studies  
   e. Other

7. The highest academic degree you have attained:
   a. Bachelor’s  
   b. Bachelor’s plus  
   c. Masters  
   d. Master’s plus  
   e. Doctorate
Philip Trager and Ralph Lemon’s *Persephone*: Performing the Dialectic of Power Relations

*Brooke Ratterree*

Dr. Cole Woodcox and Dr. Lynn Rose, *Co-Mentors*

*Through* Persephone, choreography, photography and poetry are united to serve as a modern reexamination of an ancient Greek myth. In the collection, Philip Trager (photographer) and Ralph Lemon (choreographer) were able to combine their disparate artistic media to take what was once a live-performance experience and make it a permanent visual wonder (Trager and Lemon 2). Traditionally a story central to the experience between mother and daughter has now been reinvented to examine the roles of power among husband and wife. In a 2009 interview, Philip Trager spoke candidly about the creative process, which few have investigated through Persephone. In an attempt to better understand the dialectic of power between the collection’s main actors, it was discovered that traditional object-relations theory did not adequately address the variables. For that reason, Lacan’s theory of the Imaginary, Real, and Symbolic was applied to the collection to better understand the nature of unsatisfied desire. In the end, the Ancient Greek myth, Persephone, and Lacanian theory all come together to demonstrate the unstable nature of emotional relationships that are ultimately governed by regulatory systems that the actors have to use when negotiating meaning and power.
Introduction

In the series of images that comprise *Persephone* Philip Trager and Ralph Lemon unite choreography, photography and poetry. The collection in its final form, as commissioned in 1994 by the Jacob’s Pillow Dance Festival’s Dance Anthology Project and funded by The New England Foundation of the Arts, effectively united artists from across disciplines to create a modern reexamination of an ancient myth. In the published book, continuous balletic movement (choreographed by Ralph Lemon) is fragmented into discrete photographic images (by photographer Philip Trager) to reinvent a story familiar to many. While at first glance the collection may seem tied to the conventional Greek understanding of Persephone and Demeter, further investigation uncovers that multiple layers have been constructed to explore uncommon perspectives of the myth and problematize the power relationships between each of the characters.

What began as a simple viewing of the photographs has transformed into an in-depth analysis into the recreation of myth. When initially viewing *Persephone*, I held a number of assumptions and expectations given the collection’s textual connection to the Homeric *Hymn to Demeter*. However, upon further investigation I began to notice a number of divergences from the original *Hymn to Demeter* which called for further investigation. In an attempt to perform a comprehensive analysis of the collection, multiple methodologies were used to address a number of important elements and come to a more enriched understanding of *Persephone*.

The first step was to conduct a Formalist Analysis coupled with a Textual Analysis of the included poetry. The fundamental elements of the images and text in *Persephone* were explored individually and as a whole. Following that, a Mythical Historiography was conducted to examine the myth in relation to Ancient Greek culture and the roles that Demeter and Persephone played within society. Next, Philip Trager graciously contributed to the research by speaking about the creation of *Persephone*. Few published articles or reviews exist about the collection, making his contribution an invaluable addition to an overall understanding of the creative process. Finally, past psychoanalysis was examined in relation to Demeter and Persephone.

In Helene P. Foley’s interpretive essay analyzing the Homeric *Hymn to Demeter* she calls for further investigation of the myth from a psychoanalytic object-relations point of view on the “mother/daughter romance.” To better understand the dynamics of relations in the collection, an attempt was made to apply object-relations theory. However, it was discovered that this framework of thought did not appropriately address each of the variables. For that reason Lacan’s theory of the “real, imaginary, and symbolic” was used (Sarup).
Artist/Collection Historiography

Through *Persephone*, Philip Trager and Ralph Lemon were able to unite their disparate artistic media to take what was once a live-performance experience and make it a permanent visual wonder (Trager and Lemon 2). The original dance, of the same name, predated the collaboration between Trager and Lemon and was commissioned by the Jacob’s Pillow Dance Festival. Choreographed by Ralph Lemon, the performance premiered May 9, 1991, running for two weeks, at the Joyce Theater in New York with original choreography and balletic movements set to “Maps” by Anthony Davis, a violin concerto. In 1994 Ralph Lemon and Philip Trager revisited Lemon’s creation and “reimagined the dance in a series of tableaux surrounded by the wild, spring nature of the Berkshires...[which] evolved in the presence of the mechanical and emotional perspective of the camera’s lens” (Trager and Lemon 2). Through the finished product a complex commentary on the nature of marital and familial relationships can be seen, that none have investigated through *Persephone*.

Traditionally, the Homeric *Hymn to Demeter* or Ovid’s *Metamorphoses*, are used as the basis for understanding the myth of Demeter and Persephone. However, for the creation of the dance Lemon was inspired by a more modern piece by Homero Aridjis entitled *Persephone*, in which the ancient myth is told from the perspective of Pluto, Persephone’s captor, and a brothel owner. In an interview with Jennifer Dunning of *The New York Times*, Ralph Lemon talked about the creative process of the choreography and stated,

> We had a Pluto phrase and a Persephone phrase. Each takes on a little of the other. Pluto's phrase is soft, suspended, abandoned. Persephone's is more static, less free, unsure. She starts to take on more and more of Pluto's world. What was their love like? She had to have accepted that marriage. She could have left every six months, but she came back. Pluto was not a bad god. He was lonely. So his seduction of Persephone was somehow justified (Dunning C13).

Presenting Pluto as a victim in his own right differs significantly from his portrayal in the *Hymn to Demeter* and is grappled with in *Persephone*.

The vulnerability of Pluto becomes a key aspect in the examination of the collection once Lemon’s inspiration is know. Without this knowledge, the viewer is left to assume that *Persephone* is a recreation of the *Hymn to Demeter* because of the textual artifacts that accompany the images (introduction by Ralph Lemon, poetry, and closing remarks). For that reason there appears to be a discrepancy between the images and the text that is successfully merged within the book, but complicates analysis in regards to overall meaning. Moving away from the myths central focus on a uniquely female experience between mother and daughter, the artists pay great
attention to the volatile relationship between Persephone and Hades. To best understand why this perspective complicates the commentary of the collection, it is necessary to take a step backwards and view the myth through a Formalist lens.

**Formalist Analysis of Persephone**

*Persephone* is a small format (7.4 x 5.8 inches) with duotone photographs printed on glossy paper. The original prints were much larger, 20 x 24 inches, printed on silver gelatin plates by Trager himself (Trager). For the purposes of identification and ease of discussion, six images from *Persephone* have been included in Appendix A and will be referenced throughout. The book has 40 pages and contains 19 slides within and one on the back cover, equaling 20 unique images. The photo on the front cover is repeated on page 27 and will be identified as Image 1. The book opens with an introduction by Ralph Lemon which is followed by a brief synopsis of the myth. Two poems are included within, “The Narcissus Flower” by Rita Dove and “The Pomegranate” by Eavan Boland, which Trager chose for inclusion from other published texts. Concluding the book is a commentary about the project by Andrew Szegedy-Maszak from Wesleyan University. In that piece, Szegedy-Maszak revisits the main themes of the myth, introduces Demeter’s importance in the Eleusinian Mysteries, and talks about how Lemon and Trager have “transformed [the myth] into a contemporary ritual, with new reserves of mystery and wonder” (Trager and Lemon 39).

The images of the recreated myth were specifically made for viewing in *Persephone*, and are mainly absent from circulation, other than a few images that are present in collections at Wesleyan University and the Library of Congress. Through process of elimination, Trager carefully chose, sequenced, and sized the photographs, in addition to the poetry (Trager). Larger versions of Images 4 and 6 are available in *Philip Trager*, a retrospective of his photographic works published by Steidl in 2006. Interestingly, during a 2009 interview with Philip Trager, I discovered that *Persephone* was actually printed front and back on one large sheet of paper. For that reason Trager chose to include an eliminated photo from *Persephone* in his 2006 retrospective (Trager).

Compositonally speaking, there is a noticeable difference between the environment of Earth and the Underworld. While on Earth, the dancers are surrounded by open fields and skies. Once the transition is made to the Underworld, the sky is no longer visible and the frames are filled with the forestry of the Berkshires. Image 4 is a striking example of the eye catching composition throughout. An open, ominous sky surrounds the emerging Persephone. Entering from the left, this is one of the few images that actually breaks frame. The position and line of the woman’s open arms lead the viewer to the right and the eventual
return to Demeter, while the debris from the Underworld falls back to the left, signifying the past. Standing behind Persephone, Hades grasps a handful of leaves as he tries to capture her, yet again.

Image 3 is another example of the intricate images that compose *Persephone*. For this image, Demeter has been compositionally placed in the center with open space all around. The viewer is brought into the frame as though they are there witnessing the most private of moments. The height of the grain stands proportional to the subject, as though Demeter is a part of, and as damaged as, the foliage. The expression and flexed muscles enhance the viewers understanding of the situation and exert Demeter’s power.

When considering the addition of poetry during the construction of *Persephone*, Philip Trager stated, “I felt that poetry, carefully chosen and aesthetically appropriate, would enhance the book.” Guided by a few “extremely knowledgeable” people, he handpicked the poems by Rita Dove and Eavan Boland (Trager). The first of the two poems, “The Narcissus Flower,” is placed on page 11 and faces an image which contains three women running in an open field of flowers. The poem seems to inform ones understanding of the image in relation to the myth. The second poem, “The Pomegranate,” is placed on pages 28 and 29 and proceeds Image 1, in which a man holds seeds in front of the woman’s face. This poem also seems to inform an understanding of the related image and orients the viewer in relation to *Persephone*’s connection to the myth. This poem is also one of the few places that Demeter’s experience as mother is explored.

**Mythical Historiography**

Considering the foundation for creation of *Persephone*, it is important to look at the role that Demeter and Persephone have played throughout history and what makes the myth so unique. The ancient Greek myth of the Queen of the Underworld, Persephone or Kore (“maiden”), as told in the Homeric *Hymn to Demeter*, is a unique narrative central to the female experience between mother and daughter (Foley, 80). While the myth is commonly understood as an anecdote of the cycle of the seasons, further investigation reveals a variety of themes, such as loss and reconciliation, life and death, and the relationship between mother and daughter, which remain relevant today.

In the myth, a young and innocent Persephone is kidnapped and raped by Hades while playing in a field of violets and narcissus and taken to the Underworld where she is made his bride. In great distress, Demeter, Persephone’s mother and Goddess of fertility, searches the land for her daughter, to no avail. In her anger and despair Demeter makes all of the land barren to prevent any harvest from surviving. Knowing this, Persephone’s father, Zeus, demands that Hades allow Persephone to
rise from the Underworld and return to her mother. While Hades complies with Zeus’ request, he does not do so before tempting Persephone with a pomegranate seed. Upon eating the seed, Persephone becomes perpetually trapped in a cycle of two-thirds of the year in the heavens with her mother and one third in the Underworld, similar to the birth of spring and the senescence of fall.

Ovid’s *Metamorphoses* is the Roman equivalent of the *Hymn to Demeter* and is largely similar to the Greek version, with the exception of names and locations. In Ovid’s *Metamorphoses*, Pluto (Hades) serves as the God of the Underworld and Proserpina’s (Persephone’s) captor. The myth is set in Enna, the equivalent of Eleusis, where Ceres (Demeter) served as the Goddess of agriculture. While slight differences are found between the two, the stories are largely the same (Galinsky). For that reason the names can be, and are, used interchangeably.

In the collection, special attention of the text is paid to the *Hymn to Demeter* versus *Metamorphoses*. For example, the introduction on page seven gives a brief synopsis of the *Hymn to Demeter* using Greek names, as does the closing remark by Andrew Szegedy-Maszak on page 38-39. The poetry is the only text that hints at the Roman equivalent through elements such as the “Narcissus flower” and “Ceres.” For that reason, the Homeric *Hymn to Demeter* will serve as the guideline for comparison and interpretation of the photographs as the article progresses.

To best understand the roles of Demeter and Persephone and the myth overall, it is necessary to examine them within their historical context, the Archaic Age. It has been speculated that the original *Hymn to Demeter* was created somewhere between 675 and 550 B.C. The Archaic Age marked the beginning of a powerful political community, in which the Greek *polis*, or city-state was formed (Finley 87). With considerable focus on community participation and involvement, kingships were dissolved in almost every *polis*, and a noticeable division appeared between landlords and peasants (Starr 303). Along with the division of class came an emphasis on the socioeconomic inequality of the sexes. Both male and female gods were worshipped, but Lucia Nixon speculates that, “Though females, whether human or divine, are not without importance, it is clear that males [were] in control, in heaven (Zeus) as on earth (mortal men)” (74). For that reason, the power that Demeter maintained over fertility is a significant exception.

To venerate the Goddess, the *polis* celebrated annually with two festivals, the Thesmophoria and Eleusinian Mysteries. During the Eleusinian Mysteries, a truce was held all over the Greek world for fifty-five days, as people would travel from all of Greece to take part. Women and other non-citizens were permitted to attend, and played an integral role in the activities and rituals. This is of particular importance because Greek culture rarely allowed women to participate openly in public activities. The Thesmophoria mystery rite, also sacred to Demeter, was exclusively for women.
Every year the festival was held just before the fall planting season to worship Demeter in hopes of having a plentiful harvest for the polis. This gave women a vital role in society, as everyone relied on the harvest for their well-being. The practices served as a reenactment of the myth which reminded the women of the importance and mystery of fertility.

Archaic Greece maintained a “deep-rooted consciousness of belonging to a single and unique culture” that was bound by myth (Finley 126). Moses I. Finley states that

myth performed a number of functions: it was explanatory, didactic and prescriptive. It gave the archaic Greeks their sense of, and knowledge of, their past; it sanctioned cults, festivals, beliefs, the authority of individual noble families, and so on through a range of practices and ideas (126).

As the Archaic Greeks began to colonize in the Mediterranean world to the Black Sea, the myths traveled with them and were “adjusted and enlarged accordingly” (Finley 127). Not only have the myths in the Homeric Hymns been used for literary enjoyment, they have played a large role in the understanding that historians presently have about ancient Greece in general, and are historically representative of their time.

As the myths were re-shaped, so too were the festivals, including the Eleusinian Mysteries. By the end of the Archaic Age, they were fully formed. On the Athenian calendar the Mysteries took place within the month of Boedromion, or present day September. While little is known about specific detail, the festivals were thought to include a religious rite, and coined “Mysteries” because they literally were not to be spoken of. This silence had nothing to do with being mysterious “in the sense of containing some recondite teaching difficult to understand” (Parke 56). The location of the festival also coincides with the myth. After Persephone was kidnapped, Demeter, grief-stricken, went to Eleusis, where she became the caregiver of the young Eleusinian prince until her identity was discovered by his mother, Meteneira. For that reason people began to worship in Eleusis, where the Eleusinian Temple was eventually constructed during the Archaic Age.

After the abduction, Demeter and Persephone initially refused to take any food or drink as they were both mourning their separation. In the Eleusinian Mysteries and Thesmorphia, drinking wine was prohibited, perhaps because Demeter refused the glass offered to her by Meteneira. Instead, she requested a drink called kykeon, which consisted of barley meal, water, flour, and the herb pennyroyal. This combination may have acted as an anti-fertility drug or abortifacient, and was drunk by participants in the Mysteries (Nixon 85). The effects of kykeon are also similar to pomegranate, which Persephone was lured to eat by Hades. The Hippocratic Corpus,
a compilation of medical writings, explores the use of pomegranate as an astringent and abortifacient, none of which promote its use for increased fertility. Due to its effects, it is conjectured that upon eating the seed, Persephone became sterile. It is now known that the pomegranate seed contains female hormones which served as a contraceptive (Nixon 86).

This connection with decreased fertility is contrary to the common understanding of the Mysteries and Thesmophoria. While the ultimate goals of the ceremonies were to promote fertility, the combination of plants consumed in the myth show the power women had over their reproductive abilities. In regards to this, Lucia Nixon states:

It then becomes possible to suggest a truly polyvalent interpretation of the cults, as male and female desire for controlled fertility can have at least two meanings: men may have wanted to ensure legitimate heirs, but women knew that fertility was a matter of choice, and that they were only as fertile as they wanted to be (88).

Further exploration of *Persephone* in regards to illustration versus interpretation of the myth, more specifically the *Hymn to Demeter*, has been explored. In addition fertility control and the shared mourning between mother and daughter throughout the myth will be addressed from a psychoanalytic perspective.

**Illustration vs. Interpretation of Myth**

Throughout *Persephone* there is a noticeable emphasis on the experiences of Persephone and Hades, which differs from the *Hymn to Demeter*. This ultimately neglects the dynamics of the mother/daughter relationship that come from the text, but sheds light on an experience in the Underworld that remains unexplored in the text. In the *Hymn*, Demeter’s experience is central to the myth as she agonizes over the loss of her daughter. (Foley, 80). In *Persephone*, Demeter is only present in four images which is a small margin in comparison to that of Persephone and Hades. Other than the obvious stress and anguish that Demeter is exuding in Image 3 her experience is addressed in the poetry, giving her more of a text based voice in the narrative. Specifically, “The Pomegranate” by Eavan Boland lends itself well to the understanding of their separation from a mother’s perspective on the situation.

Persephone is present in 16 of the 20 images and Hades in 14 of the 20, placing most of the focus on the dynamics of their relationship and experience. The images at the beginning of the book are rather illustrative of the myth and tied to the sequence of events as presented in the text of the *Hymn to Demeter*. The fourth image in *Persephone* depicts beast-like males howling at the sky, looking as though they are about to embark on a hunt. That image is followed by three young women
gallivanting innocently through a field of flowers, as their dresses bounce with energy and flow in the wind. Two images later, Persephone is shown leaping across the field, as she tries to escape the inevitable capture by Hades and their descent into the Underworld led by Hades, follows (Image 2).

The photos that follow their descent are more interpretive of the experience in the Underworld and diverge from the previous illustration of the myth’s text. For the first time the subjects are in a forest, or the projected Underworld. It is also implied throughout that Persephone is not familiar with her surroundings and is there against her will. Image 6 is one of the most interpretive photos in the collection and it is unclear as to what exactly is taking place. Coupled together in a tight formation the dancers look as though they are bound in a womb. The contrast between the subjects and surrounding nature reminds the viewer of the darkness of the Underworld. The men’s expressions and placement of their hands hints at the emotional dynamics present and the desire for Persephone to stay where she is.

Interview with Philip Trager

Armed with a number of questions that arose throughout the research and investigation process, there were some that I could only address speculatively without the help of the artists. Fortunately, photographer Philip Trager enthusiastically agreed to contribute to the research. During the interview, I asked seven questions concerning the collection’s overall inspiration, the experience of the photo shoot, the significance of the absence of Demeter, and the purpose of multiple and interchanging dancers, among others. In the end, Trager was able to significantly speak to the experience of the photo shoot.

Since Ralph Lemon had choreographed the dance for the stage a few years before, he came to the shoot with a vision already in mind. Trager firmly believes in the importance of “working simply” and for the shoot natural light was used along with one medium format camera. This caused careful anticipation of rapid movement, which is interesting given that many of the images include balletic movement (Trager). In regards to the collaboration with Ralph Lemon, Trager stated

The photo shoot was an excellent experience, a true collaboration between Ralph and me. We spent the better part of a week at Jacob’s Pillow. I did no research other than to re-familiarize myself with the myth. Ralph had in mind certain segments of the myth and we would discuss possibilities. We would collaborate choosing the landscape “scene” and arranging the dancers (Trager).

A very interesting aspect that simply cannot be seen from the audience’s viewpoint,
was the courage that the dancers had to exhibit especially in Image 2. In that
instance, and others, the dancers “would leap from the roof of a shed or a high rock
onto very thin mattresses that [were] found at Jacob’s Pillow” (Trager).

**Past Psychoanalysis of Myth**

With a better understanding of the creative process and further questions about
the illustration and interpretation of Persephone, I decided to look at past psycho-
analysis of the myth given the traditional focus on the “mother/daughter romance.”
Helene P. Foley wrote a comprehensive essay addressing past psychoanalytic readings
of the *Hymn to Demeter* in which she went on to make her own contribution to the
literature by calling for further investigation of the myth from an object-relations
point of view. Taking Foley’s prompt, application of object-relations theory was
investigated in relation to past research and an attempt to apply the theory to
*Persephone* was made. Starting with Jung and Kerenyi, the archetypes of Mother/
Maiden and Divine Child were explored. From there, different aspects of Freudian
theory have been applied to the myth, starting with Marilyn A Katz, who applied a
traditional reading of “penis envy.” Using revised Freudian theory, Nancy Chodorow
combined the object-relations school of psychology with aspects of sociology and
anthropology to allow for new interpretations from a Freudian perspective.

To Jung, Demeter and Persephone represented the mother and maiden which
were considered “figures that operate in the unconscious of both individuals and
societies (which have a collective unconscious) and emerge in dreams and myths”
(Foley 119). Ultimately, these archetypes extended the female consciousness past the
boundaries of space and time so that “every mother contains her daughter in herself
and every daughter her mother, and that every woman extends backwards into
herself and forward into her daughter” (Jung qtd. in Foley 119). Jung also
considered the mother/daughter archetypal relationship to be a key component in
the allure women had to the Mysteries, as it gave them a purpose and sense of
identity that transcended generations.

In Nancy Chodorow’s “Family Structure and Feminine Personality,” she explores
ego-boundaries in regards to the mother-daughter relationship and exploits a lack of
self/other distinction between the two (Chodorow). In the text, Chodorow applied a
revised Freudian psychoanalytic interpretation of female psycho-sexual development to
the myth of Demeter and Persephone and makes the observation that,

Mother and daughter often see themselves as a physical extension of the
other. Ego boundaries between Demeter and Persephone are barely
developed, for we see each echo the reaction of the other. Neither
goddess eats as first, thus expressing a strong sense of symbiosis with the
other (Foley 127).
This idea of shared identity is evidenced in both the *Hymn to Demeter* and *Persephone*, lending the collection of photographs and poetry well to analysis from an object-relations point of view. However, upon investigation of *Persephone* a problem was unearthed concerning Hades. The major focus of the photographs on the relationship between Persephone and Hades rather than Persephone and Demeter moves away from the *Hymn to Demeter* and hints at Lemon’s inspiration for the dance. Before exploring this further, past psychoanalysis of the collection will be introduced to set the stage for investigation.

**Psychoanalysis of Dialectic Power Relations**

*Subject-Object*

Viewing the dialectic between opposing power relations, there are a number of key indicators that emerge to problematize the authority base between the various subjects. Throughout the collection there is not a consistent correlation between dancers and characters. There are a total of seven dancers in the photos with Ralph Lemon, a man, always playing Demeter, a woman. The feminine roles for the three women are interchangeable as are the masculine roles among the three men. For example, Image 1 depicts a woman with blonde hair acting as Persephone, in contrast with Image 2 in which a dark haired woman is projected to be Persephone on her way into the Underworld. The same pattern is observed for the male characters as Hades in Images 1 and 2, as well.

The performance in triplicate with an inconsistent correlation between characters takes the viewer beyond the general understanding of the myth and gives new meaning to the dynamics of certain relationships. Anna Kisselgoff, of *The New York Times*, reviewed the original choreography of *Persephone* at the Joyce Theater in 1991 and speculated that the different characters represented alter egos, especially in relation to Pluto (Hades). In the review she states, “Pluto’s brutality is clear -- at one point, one of his alter egos offers his victim a glass of water” (Kisselgoff C19).

While the theme of “alter ego” may have come across in the actual dance, that does not seem to be the case in the photographs. In each group image, all of the dancers are performing nearly the same move, allowing the multiplicity of characters to be interpreted on a more universal level. When questioned about the significance of Ralph Lemon’s decision to do this, Philip Trager stated, “I am conjecturing a little, but from my perspective Ralph was selecting the specific man or woman from a visual viewpoint and perhaps being “fair” by alternating dancers. However, he can provide the best answer to this” (Trager).

Concerning the roles of power, from a psychoanalytic perspective, the myth’s text depicts a classic subject-object relationship between Hades and Persephone. According to 17th century philosopher, Rene Descartes, in a true subject-object
relationship, Hades should serve as the active subject controlling a passive object (Persephone). This is evidenced in the visual telling of the myth through the abduction and rape, and has been extended further to incorporate the choreography, in which Hades is the one controlling what Persephone ingests, be it water or pomegranate seeds. However, this dynamic ultimately breaks down in the collection because Persephone is not completely passive. Once there is knowledge of Lemon’s inspiration --that Hades is actually a lonely brothel keeper and Persephone is choosing to return-- it is clear that she is just as active as Hades. While Hades may serve as the subject, providing Persephone with the necessities for physical well-being, she then becomes the subject, through choice and ability to leave and return, providing Hades with emotional well-being, to rid him of his loneliness. This convolutes the classic distinction between subject and object, calling for a more modern application of object-relations theory, as suggested by Foley in her object-relations analysis of the myth.

Object-Relations

The goal of object-relations theory is to acknowledge and explore the development of identity in familial relationships from a Freudian perspective. Contrary to traditional Freudian theory, object-relations theorists argue that gender identity is developed in the pre-oedipal phase. For this theory to be properly applied, two things must happen. First, the male identity must completely separate from the mother in the phallic stage. This should naturally happen to a male, especially in societies where female’s are the initial and predominant caretakers, as the mother tends to treat the son as separate from herself, supporting independence (Foley 121-122). Secondly, the female continues to identify with the mother as an extension of herself and struggles with maternal identity and separation. As the female matures, she grapples with her pursuit and battle against the shared identity with a maternal figure. The key element for female development is when the daughter is able to separate herself from the maternal identity and become a mother herself (Foley 122).

As Chodorow evidenced, object-relations theory lends itself well to the understanding of the relationship between Demeter and Persephone, in the myth, as well as, Persephone. Since the abduction takes place before ego boundaries were able to develop between the two, mother and daughter seem to mourn and feel each others pain as symbiotic extensions of the other. This is evidenced through extreme emotive gestures in many of the images. For example, Image 3 depicts Demeter’s extreme grief in her daughter’s absence and Persephone’s ecstatic gestures as she emerges from the Underworld in Image 4.

In the collection it is clear that the focus is on the relationship between Hades and Persephone, rather than Demeter and Persephone, and that Hades has failed to
separate from the mother at the phallic stage, thus preventing an object-relations analysis. For that reason Demeter and Persephone’s relationship lends itself very well to investigation from that perspective, which has been evidenced through Chodorow’s scholarship on this topic. Also, the emotive gestures from Hades throughout the collection depict his emotional unrest and reliance on Persephone to fulfill his emotional needs (Image 5). Had Hades managed to develop identity distinction during the phallic stage, he would not remain reliant on Persephone, or females in general, for emotional fulfillment. For these reasons, it is known that Persephone is not a traditional depiction of the Hymn to Demeter or myth itself, and that it is necessary to find a method of investigation that allows for a more broad application, one that can examine relationships between mother/daughter and husband/wife.

Lacan’s “Imaginary/Real/Symbolic”

While a number of Freudian interpretations have previously been applied to the myth, Lacanian psychoanalysis remains relatively unexplored. Since the collection of art takes on a non-traditional perspective of the myth, it lends itself well to analysis through Lacan’s theory of the imaginary, real and symbolic, which shows conflict in systems of creating meaning (Sarup). Much like Freud’s Oedipal stages, these are the stages which one goes through during the process of developing from egocentric to sociocentric.

Typically one starts in the “imaginary” phase, in which the distinction between self and other has yet to develop along with any type of linguistic system. The “mirror stage” takes place during this phase and signifies the point at which the ego develops into “I” but there is still a lack of knowledge of their relation to others. From there, one progresses into the “real” phase in which they are aware of “I” in relation to others and their needs. In this stage the person becomes aware of who has the capability to fulfill certain needs (ie. a mother feeding a child). Entering the final stage, one moves into the “symbolic” in which, according to Lacan, is forever bound by symbols and communicative systems. Every desire that one may have is ultimately bound by symbols or language, therefore shaping one’s experience.

From a Lacanian perspective the visual field of the photographic collection becomes the language that the artists and characters are speaking. The images in the collection serve to mediate the separation of identity between Demeter and Persephone, as well as Hades and Persephone. Throughout the images of different characters continuously cycle from the imaginary to the symbolic, which becomes the axis of the dialectic power relations. In the images the characters move back and forth through this system, switching from egocentric to socio-centric and back, almost instantaneously. This cycle, however, is often influenced by regulatory systems.
which inevitably become the authority, controlling one’s actions. Therefore, Lacanian theory coupled with the influence of regulatory systems makes for an obscure understanding of how a negotiated system shapes understanding of people and meaning.

The influence of regulatory systems comes from knowledge of themes in the text that also seem to be applied to Persephone. However, there are a number of powerful dialectical systems simultaneously taking place in which all the systems in the collection rely on a synthesis of two forces negotiating power. A number of systems are present and constantly taking place but the following are a few examples of the main ones. Although Hades thinks he can get away with whatever he wants by kidnapping Persephone and keeping her for himself, he has to remember he is constantly kept in check by Zeus and the deal that was made between the gods. Even though Zeus is ultimately the final power, he had to answer to Demeter when she exerted her control over fertility. Finally, Persephone generally seems helpless within the cycle, she constantly maintains power over Hades’ emotions by potentially not returning.

In the beginning of the collection it is clear that Persephone is being taken to the Underworld and held against her will, as Hades nearly had to drag her there. However, the book ends with Hades and Persephone embracing one another, as though she has finally accepted her fate as Queen of the Underworld. On the other hand, Hades is always presented as a beast-like character, with the expression of despair or pining for affection (Images 5 and 6, for example). The emotive gestures of the different characters, specifically Hades, lend themselves well for interpretation of Lacan’s imaginary, real and symbolic because they open up a level of vulnerability in the characters that does not come through in the myth itself. Ultimately, this creates a paradigm for selfhood of vulnerability and reliance on others for well being.

Returning to the quote by Lemon, it is interesting to examine the adjectives which he chose to describe Hades. Much different from the general conception that Hades violently abducted and raped Persephone, such words as “soft,” “abandoned,” and “lonely,” are used to justify the situation. Although Lemon stated that “Hades was not a bad god” the images throughout Persephone depict him in a very dominant manner (Lemon qtd. in Dunning). In Image 1, Hades towers over Persephone with the pomegranate seeds, not leaving her much option for rejection. The same can be said for Image 6 in which then men forcefully cover the eyes and mouths of the women who are trying to escape their grasp. Only in a few images, such as Image 5, does Hades appear in a “soft” or “lonely” manner.

Body & Fertility as a Regulatory System

The power inherent within fertility becomes a key aspect of the myth and a
major regulatory system within the collection. This level of control lends itself well to a Lacanian psychoanalytic approach because control of the body was the only power that women often maintained, as they were largely absent from society. In the text Demeter starts in the “symbolic” stage, as she is the Goddess of fertility. Once Persephone is taken away she frantically begins her search, as any mother would. When unable to locate her daughter or control the situation, she displaces her anger towards Hades onto the entire world. Due to her grief and mourning all of the plants die. In this moment Demeter reverts back to a very egoistic state in which she is primarily concerned with her feelings in relation to the loss of her daughter. Knowing that use of her power over fertility would catch the attention of Zeus, Demeter prevents crops from growing. Demeter is eventually successful with her threat as Zeus, knowing that the loss of food cannot take place, regulates the system by placating Demeter and Hades, creating a custody system of sorts. This system, in turn, is effected greatly by Persephone, who ingests the pomegranate seed and Hades who potentially forces them upon her. In this moment it is interesting to see how all four of the main characters are exerting power on the situation to control certain aspects for their own personal gain.

The role of the pomegranate within the realm of power dynamics can be interpreted different ways according to how the situation is read. The pomegranate, as described in the *Hippocratic Corpus*, was often thought to be used as an abortifacient. Depending upon the translation of the *Hymn to Demeter* that is read, there are varied understandings of Persephone’s intake of the seed. In some cases it seems as though she is lured in her innocence, but not forcefully, and in others it seems to be forced upon her by Hades. This understanding is pivotal, as it shapes further reading of the situation. In one interpretation, Persephone ingested the seed knowing full well that it would act as a contraceptive, allowing her to control her fertility. Therefore, Persephone’s ingestion of the seed could have been a deliberate power play on her part. This is interesting also because in the myth, Demeter intakes a drink called *kykeon* which has herbs in it that also acted as a contraceptive. Upon ingestion of the drink, all of the plants (specifically grains) die.

Fertility in general plays a key role in the overall statement of the myth. No longer dealing solely with the importance of female fertility as it was deified in Ancient Greece, it still exhibits the deliberateness of both sexes and the power they maintain over it. In terms of sexuality, this perspective makes an interesting commentary on the nature of fertile relations. A female homosocial relationship between parent and child seems to signify the most fecundate of all relationships. On the opposite end of the spectrum, it can be interpreted that a heterosexual relation between husband and wife is barren. Given the norms of procreation, this is a curious take on emotional relationships that applies well to the collection. In the
end, Persephone’s relationship with Hades becomes a necessary evil that even she chooses to accept.

Conclusion

What once was a myth often recreated through children’s literature, has been reworked and imagined to unite different artistic media and perspectives. In the end, the Ancient Greek myth, *Persephone*, and Lacanian theory all come together to demonstrate the unstable nature of emotional relationships that are ultimately governed by regulatory systems that the actors have to use when negotiating meaning and power. On a micro level each of these dynamics couple together to create a very complex understanding of the dynamics of power, that seem so defined, in certain relationships.

Persephone becomes the fulcrum of power around which different actors revolve. In this application of the myth, Persephone changed from the passive object that she once was, to an active subject, with control over her location. She develops her own personality outside of her mother (a key aspect for female development from an object-relations perspective) and her stay in the Underworld becomes more voluntary, opposite of the conventional telling of the myth. In general society, heterosexual relationships are conventionally accepted as the norm leading to procreation and fertility. However, this myth questions that perception by showing that the most fertility and happiness comes from a homosocial parent/child relationship.

The relationship between Hades and Persephone lends itself well to application of Lacanian theory due to the ever-present aspect of unsatisfied desire, which is never fulfilled. As a brothel keeper, Hades was constantly surrounded by potential female companions, but he lusted for Persephone to fulfill his emotional desire. Once he took her away from everything she knew and had her to himself, his desire still remained. The number ofinterchanging dancers, thought to be Hades’ alter egos by Kisselgoff, can be interpreted as a performance of the unstable nature of this relationship or the potential for universal application. There are a number of competing forces all working at once to control the situation and the multiple characters represent the emotional turmoil that Hades is experiencing. In terms of power dialectic, power distribution seems to be equal between the two, in which Pluto/Hades has the power over Persephone’s physical well-being and Persephone maintains the power over Hades’ emotional well-being. To that end, Persephone is then different than all of the women in Pluto’s brothel because she is the one he truly wants and her return is contingent upon her choice, forever leaving a level of uncertainty and desire in their relationship.

This dynamic is also of great importance when trying to reconcile the
relationship between Persephone and Demeter. Although Demeter is largely absent from the collection, her power is always there under the surface and all around. Although Persephone may be physically distant from her mother, they continue to exist through a shared identity. Furthermore, it is interesting that the scenery of the Underworld was photographed outside in the organic nature of the Berkshires. This is another way in which Demeter remains present in the Underworld, as neither Hades nor Persephone are ever separated from her connection to fertility and nature.

Overall, this re-imagination of Persephone opens the myth’s relations for more universal interpretations. As depicted in almost every image in the collection, the men appear to be doing essentially the same movements and playing the same character, which is also true for the women. For that reason, the concept of “every man, every woman” can be applied in terms of our own approach to power relationships and intimacy. Essentially, the myth not only affects Hades and Persephone but all of humanity through Demeter’s control of the food source and fertility. To that end, Persephone re-creates a mythic tale that is traditionally static, and closed. The final product becomes more flexible and open, allowing the viewer to approach and personalize a story that was once remote.
Appendix A

Image 1 (Copyright Philip Trager 1996)
Image 2 (Copyright Philip Trager 1996)
Image 3 (Copyright Philip Trager 1996)
Image 4 (Copyright Philip Trager 1996)
Image 5 (Copyright Philip Trager 1996)
Image 6 (Copyright Philip Trager 1996)
References


Davis, Anthony, Maps, Kansas City Orchestra conducted by William McGlaughlin. Gramavision 18-8807-. Vinyl Recording.


Trager, Philip. E-mail interview. 13 Aug. 2009.

Minority Party Electoral Performance in a One-Party Russia

Christopher R. A. Reid

John James Quinn, PhD., Mentor

This study is an examination of factors affecting the percentage of the national vote obtained by seat-gaining minority parties in the 2003 and 2007 Russian legislative elections. With the 2003 national elections, the United Russia party became the plurality political party in the Russian parliament; and with the 2007 elections, it became the majority party, holding over 60% of the seats. In light of power of the United Russia party, this study seeks to explain the conditions under which minority parties can gain seats in an emerging one-party dominant system. An ordinary least squares (OLS) regression analysis of secondary data was performed. Three variables were shown to have a statistically significant impact on the share of minority party vote levels: "Russian" ethnicity, economic dependence of voting regions on the federal government, and the changes in the legislative elections for the 2007 vote. Ethnicity was positively linked with minority party vote share, while the latter two were negatively linked with minority party vote share.

Studying elections in modern-day Russia offers some unique opportunities. In fact, with the collapse of the Soviet Union many people believed that Russia would transition from authoritarianism to democracy. Ended were the days of Communist
authoritarianism. It was to have been a new dawn for the Russian people. Recent elections, however, have shown that Russia may be headed back towards a one-party dominant system rather than being on a path to true democracy (Gel’man, 2006). According to Carothers (2002), many countries embark on a transition from authoritarianism that does not result in democracy, but rather they land in an area he calls feckless pluralism or a one-party dominant system.

Russia appeared to moving in the direction of a one-party dominant system with the formation of the United Russia (UR) party in 2002. It was created though a merger of the ‘Unity’ and ‘Fatherland – All Russia’ parties. Prior to the creation of UR, the Communist Party of Russia had been the largest political party through the 1999 legislative election, though it did not enjoy a majority. However, after Putin’s election to the Presidency under the United Russia (UR) party’s banner in 2000, UR has only continued to consolidate its power. In the 2003 legislative election, UR gained a plurality of the votes in the national election with 37.57% of the vote. In the 2007 parliamentary election, however, United Russia won a strong majority with 64.3% of the national vote.

The minority parties that managed to gain enough votes to hold seats in the 2003 election were the Communist Party of Russia (12.61%), Liberal Democratic Party of Russia (11.45%), Rodina coalition (9.02%), Yabloko (4.3%), Union of Right Forces (3.97%), Agrarian Party of Russia (3.64%), and the Russian Pensioner’s Party (3.09%). In the 2007 parliamentary election, however, the three minority parties that received enough votes in order to hold seats were these: the Communist Party of Russia (11.57%), Liberal Democratic Party of Russia (8.14%), and A Just Russia (7.74%).

**Literature Review**

Perhaps one of the best studies of the strength of political party strength in post-Soviet Russia, John Ishiyama (2002) examined the nationalization of voting patterns in Russia since 1993. “Nationalization of the vote” refers to the degree to which regional voting patterns for all political parties were reflect national voting patterns. The idea is the investigation is that the more nationalized the vote, the more stable the state. He examined a number of factors to explain why party politics in certain regions of Russia were characterized by a national vote than others. Ishiyama conducted his study using data from the 1995 and 1999 legislative elections wherein most parties that contest the election held at least one seat.

He also examined the variables of regional executive competition, the percentage of the population that is ethnically Russian, degree of urbanization of the regional

---

population, regional economic dependence, and level of regional party development and how they either increased or decreased the variance between how parties performed at the regional and national level (Ishiyama 2002). Of these variables, only economic dependence and regional executive power were found significant. He found that regional executive power, contrary to his hypothesis actually increased the likelihood that larger national parties would receive. Economic dependence followed his prediction in that it would lead to greater discrepancies in how people vote in different regions.

Other scholars found supported many of these conclusions. Bochsler (2006) found that urbanization and economic dependence on the federal government affected the nationalization of voting. He created a ‘triangle model’ that included party nationalization, decentralization, and ethnic groups to explain their connections. His primary hypothesis was that the degree of party nationalization is a consequence of the level of centralization of the government. While his hypothesis was not supported, he suggested that though he underestimated its significance in determining the nationalization of the vote in European countries. Nonetheless, Bochsler (2006) suggests that ethnicity regularly takes center stage in determining the nationalization of the vote in other central and eastern European countries.

Many other factors are often held to affect the number of seats held by minority parties. One such factor is the type of electoral system. As most comparativists know, Single Member District Plurality (SMDP) systems tend towards a two-party system unless the votes are regionally concentrated (Duverger 1972). Proportional Representation (PR) voting systems tend result in multiparty systems (Lijphart 1999). For example, if party ‘A’ wins 20% of the popular vote, then 20% of remaining seats given through PR for the legislature would be filled with its party representatives. Russia changed its system of legislative elections between the 2003 and 2007 elections. In all earlier elections, Russia used a system that mixed the properties of SMDP system and PR. Under the older mixed system, half of Russia’s legislature was composed of legislators form SMDP and the other half was filled through PR.

Changes in the minimum threshold for seats can affect the number of seats held by minority parties. The higher the threshold, one expects that the fewer smaller parties will have seats. By contrast, the lower the threshold is, the greater the number of small parties will be in parliament (Lijphart 1999). Russia raised its minimum threshold required to hold office from 5% to 7% after the 2003 elections.

One final and important change in the politics of Russia was that the power in Russia shifted from the office of the President (which had previously been held by Putin) to the office of the Prime Minister (now held by Putin). Therefore, Putin would care more about majorities in parliament now in contrast to when he held the
presidency. Under the old system, where the president had a fixed mandate, a parlia-
mentary majority was not necessary to execute executive power.

Another factor to take into account for party strength is the access to patronage
enjoyed by different parties. Ishiyama and Quinn (2006) examined formerly
dominant African parties and found that incumbency was an important factor in
determining how well all parties performed in later elections. Success in elections (or
failures) tended to beget further success (or failures) in African states with multiparty
competition (Ishiyama and Quinn, 2006).

Like those African countries, Russia has a great degree of state patronage dating
back to the late 1920’s when Stalin used the system to consolidate his power. In the
Russian Federation, and other states which have a high degree of state ownership,
there is the potential for a dominant party to place the state’s main assets (money,
jobs, public information via state media, and police power) in the direct service of
the party (Carothers 2002, Ishiyama and Quinn 2006). Carothers gave many
countries from that emerged from the collapse of the Soviet Union such as Armenia,
Azerbaijan, Georgia, Kyrgyzstan, and Kazakhstan as examples of democracies that
have stalled and become one-party dominant systems based upon their strong
systems of patronage and dubious, if not outright fraudulent elections. At the time of
his study, Russia seemed to have avoided this trap by allowing greater degrees of
freedom and conducting elections of some legitimacy. All of this, however, was
before a party emerged in Russia that could hold a large enough majority to
capitalize on Russia’s rich patronage system to change things in their favor. By the
2003 election, such a party had emerged in United Russia.

Hypothesis

Although this paper uses Ishiyama’s (2002) study as a baseline, given that Russia
is apparently becoming a one-party dominant system, this new phenomenon might
skew any attempt to directly repeat Ishiyama’s work: it would make the parties in
aggregate appear to be more nationalized since one party is clearly nationalized. UR
won a majority in each of the 89 voting regions in 2007. It is for this reason that this
study will focus on which factors allowed the surviving minority parties to gain seats
rather than focusing on nationalization of the vote, per se. Nonetheless, we will re-
examine Ishiyama’s variables to see which ones are relevant to explaining the
percentage of the vote received by minority parties.

Given the above literature, we include many variables found to be robust in
predicting minority party strength. From Ishiyama’s (2002) study, we will include
most of his variables in our model: the percent of population ethnically Russian, level
of urbanization, and the economic dependence on the federal government of each

---

2 For the role of legislatures under a strong presidency, see O’Donnell (1994)
voting region. However, the variable of regional party development is excluded as it measures the number of seats in regional legislature held by the same party. This could possibly introduce endogeneity because the variables that had these parties win at the regional levels may also explain their winning at the national level. Therefore, it might not have independent explanatory power. Also the variable of independence of the regional leader was not included due to difficulty in obtaining data.³

In switching from Ishiyama’s (2002) use of the variables in illustrating discrepancy between a national and regional vote to using them to predict a directional relationship between the variables and the percentage of the vote received by minority parties, some additional factors of the literature must be considered. Previous findings suggest that voters in urban areas of post-communist states tend to be more mobilized, and they tend to favor pro-reform parties (Fidrmuc, 2000). Also, regions that are more economically dependent on the economic “center” of government have been shown to have lower degrees of party penetration, with most of the support going to the party that has been in power (controlling government funds) for a period of time (Stoner-Weiss, 1997).

Given the logic of what could increase or decrease seats for minority parties, I also include the changes in electoral systems from 2003-2007, the physical distance of the regions from the economic and urban center of Moscow, and the percentage of the population that are pensioners. As discussed above, the change from a mixed system to a PR system would normally lead to more parties (Lijphart 1999; Duverger 1972). So a dummy variable for the second election in included. However, considering the increased threshold as well as United Russia’s incumbency and increasing authoritarianism, this variable could also predict fewer seats for the opposition. Therefore, this variable is as much the second election in a one-party dominant system as it is a reflection of changes in the electoral system. As such, we call the variable “second election.”

The geographic distance between the location of the region and the center of government in Moscow is included because it is assumed that the closer one is to Moscow, the more the ruling elite would have more power. The further away, the more difficult it would be for them to project power. This has to do with organizational and transportation costs, as well as general collective action costs. Finally, pensioners are included as a highly mobilized demographic of voters in post communist societies (Rose, 1995), and the percent of pensioners in any given region could have been an indicator of the more aged citizens and those more likely to have fond memories of Russia’s number two party, the Communist Party of the Russian Federation (CPRF). They could therefore be more likely to support that party (or others that appeal to pensioners) as opposed to supporting the United Russia party.

³ These data were not available in English.
Based upon these factors, the working hypotheses are as follows:

1.) The higher the percent of the population that is ethnically Russian in the voting region, the higher the percentage of the vote minority parties will receive.

2.) The farther from Moscow the voting region is, the higher the percentage of the vote minority parties will receive.

3.) The greater the percentage of a region’s population that is made up of pensioners, the higher the percentage of the vote minority parties will receive.

4.) The more urbanized a region is, the higher the percentage of the vote minority parties will receive.

5.) The more economically dependent a region is on the federal government, the lower the percentage of the vote that minority parties will receive.

6a) The change from a mixed system to a PR, should result in more votes for minority parties, based upon existing assumptions of proportionality.

6b) As the second election in a one-party dominant system, the lower the percent of votes for minority parties.

6c) The increase in the threshold from 5% to 7% should reduce the percent of votes for minority parties.

Therefore, the dependent variable for each model is the percentage of votes that all minority parties obtained in each election by voting district. Each independent variable is also measured at the voting district level (usually a state, or oblast).

Methodology

To study the impact of these variables upon minority vote for those with seats, I employ multivariate linear regression analysis. The unit of analysis in this study was the percentage of votes for parties that won any seats in the 2003 and 2007 Russian legislative elections. The eighty-nine voting regions are comprised of three different types of autonomous entities: oblasts (provinces), autonomous geographic regions, and autonomous cities such as Moscow and St. Petersburg. Each is considered an autonomous voting district. Therefore, the N is 178. The sources for my data were many. For the percentage of the population that is ethnically Russian, data were obtained from the 2002 Russian Census. Data for the distance from Moscow, level of urbanization, economic dependence on Moscow, and the percent of pensioners in each region came from Orttung (2000). Distance from Moscow was measured as the

---

4 Relevant data in English are available online: www.perepis2002.ru/ct/doc/English/4-2.xls
total number of kilometers from Moscow to the capital of each region and was logged. Economic dependence was coded as the total percent of incoming investment in the region that came from the federal government.

Using electoral system, ethnicity, distance from Moscow, level of urbanization, economic dependence on the federal government, and percent of pensioners in each region as independent variables and the total percentage of the vote minority parties received in the elections as the dependent variable, an ordinary least squares (OLS) regression was conducted using with SPSS. This initial overview model was followed by subsequent regressions where each minority party was the dependent variable, but only for those parties that held seats during both the 2003 and 2007 elections (including United Russia for the sake of comparison).

Model 1 reflects these hypotheses for all minority parties aggregated. This begs the question: “Do all minority parties gain or lose in a similar fashion?” In order to answer this later question, we have separate models for each individual minority party. Models 2 and 3 show the effects of these variables on the two minority parties that had votes in each election: the Communist Party of Russia of the Russian Federation (CPRF) and the Liberal Democratic Party of Russia (LDPR).

Table 1: Models 1-4: Parties with Seats in Both Elections

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>(1)</th>
<th>(2)</th>
<th>(3)</th>
<th>(4)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All minority</td>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>Percent</td>
<td>Dist. From</td>
<td>Percent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>parties</td>
<td>Russia</td>
<td>Russian</td>
<td>Moscow (logged)</td>
<td>of Pensioners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>16.564+</td>
<td>0.205+++</td>
<td>0.848</td>
<td>0.380</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPRF</td>
<td>64.096+++</td>
<td>-0.254+++</td>
<td>-0.498</td>
<td>-0.118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LDPR</td>
<td>-3.727</td>
<td>0.047+++</td>
<td>0.561+</td>
<td>0.401+++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Russia</td>
<td>1.987</td>
<td>0.110+++</td>
<td>0.930+++</td>
<td>-0.208+++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>178</td>
<td>178</td>
<td>178</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R squared</td>
<td>0.748</td>
<td>0.797</td>
<td>0.355</td>
<td>0.693</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adj R squared</td>
<td>0.739</td>
<td>0.790</td>
<td>0.332</td>
<td>0.682</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

+ Significant at 90%
++ Significant at 95%
+++ Significant at 99%

In Model 1, we see that the percent of the population that is ethnically Russian was positively and significantly linked with increased vote share for minority parties.
We also see that economic dependence on the federal government and the second election are both negatively and significantly linked to fewer votes for minority parties. These findings for Russian ethnicity and economic dependence were consistent with the predictions in the hypotheses. We also see that the second election was negatively and significantly linked with fewer votes for minority parties (which obtained seats). The coefficient is also quite large in magnitude, predicting a 20% drop in such votes. The finding for the second election variable lent support to increasing authoritarianism and higher thresholds having a stronger impact on minority votes than did the switch to a pure PR system. It is difficult to tell whether it was due to the raised thresholds, the elimination of regionally concentrated voting, or the increase in authoritarianism, or perhaps all three had a partial role. Nonetheless, this was a significant finding given the large $r$ squared for this model.

Upon comparing Model 1 with the results for United Russia in Model 2, we see that the same factors are significant for both the aggregated minority party vote and the majority party vote, but the relationships are opposite of one another. The factors that increase the percentage of the vote received by one, negatively affect the other. Therefore, it appears that the model examining votes for all minority parties is the near mirror image of the votes for the majority party.

Examining each minority party in turn, we see in Models 3 and 4 some of the characteristics of the each party that was able to hold seats in both the 2003 and 2007 elections, as opposed to those capable of only holding seats in one or the other. Model 3 shows that, overall, the CPRF performs best in voting regions characterized by having many ethnic Russians, many pensioners, and are less economically dependent on the federal government. Model 4 shows that the LDPR is more likely to succeed in regions further from Moscow with many ethnic Russians, but will not perform as well in the regions with a greater economic dependence on the federal government or greater numbers of pensioners. For both parties, the changes between elections led to a decline in the percentage of the vote they received. Perhaps being a former dominant party meant that they still had some lingering access to patronage or as argued by Ishiyama and Quinn (2006).

Next, we ask the question; are these effects the same in both the 2003 and 2007 elections? Therefore, we re-estimate our models for each election, and each party with seats in each election. Models 5-13 reflect minority all parties, and each minority party for the 2003 elections, while models 14-18 answer the same question for the 2007 election. Necessarily, the variable for second election drops out of these models.
Table 2: Models 5-13/ Parties with Seats in 2003 Election

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>(5)</th>
<th>(6)</th>
<th>(7)</th>
<th>(8)</th>
<th>(9)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>9.379</td>
<td>66.527+++</td>
<td>-6.786</td>
<td>-2.904</td>
<td>7.962+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minority parties</td>
<td></td>
<td>All</td>
<td>United Russia</td>
<td>CPRF</td>
<td>LDPR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent Russian</td>
<td>0.249+++</td>
<td>-0.250+++</td>
<td>0.022</td>
<td>0.123+++</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dist. From Moscow (logged)</td>
<td>1.552+</td>
<td>-0.813</td>
<td>1.082++</td>
<td>1.357+++</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent of Pensioners</td>
<td>0.359</td>
<td>-0.164</td>
<td>0.504+++</td>
<td>-0.192++</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urbanization</td>
<td>0.019</td>
<td>-0.018</td>
<td>-0.026</td>
<td>0.027</td>
<td>0.031</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic Dependence</td>
<td>-0.180++</td>
<td>0.135+</td>
<td>-0.075++</td>
<td>-0.064+++</td>
<td>-0.016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>89</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R squared</td>
<td>0.564</td>
<td>0.457</td>
<td>0.296</td>
<td>0.707</td>
<td>0.497</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adj R squared</td>
<td>0.538</td>
<td>0.424</td>
<td>0.254</td>
<td>0.689</td>
<td>0.466</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>(10)</th>
<th>(11)</th>
<th>(12)</th>
<th>(13)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>1.549</td>
<td>1.960</td>
<td>9.520</td>
<td>-1.922</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yabloko</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent Russian</td>
<td>0.023+++</td>
<td>-0.029++</td>
<td>0.037+</td>
<td>0.017++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dist. From Moscow (ln)</td>
<td>-0.135</td>
<td>-0.010</td>
<td>-0.123</td>
<td>0.214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent of Pensioners</td>
<td>-0.106++</td>
<td>0.040</td>
<td>0.054</td>
<td>0.058</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urbanization</td>
<td>0.055+++</td>
<td>0.046+++</td>
<td>-0.125+++</td>
<td>0.013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic Dependence</td>
<td>0.024++</td>
<td>-0.026</td>
<td>-0.016</td>
<td>-0.007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>89</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R squared</td>
<td>0.486</td>
<td>0.153</td>
<td>0.233</td>
<td>0.204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adj R squared</td>
<td>0.455</td>
<td>0.101</td>
<td>0.186</td>
<td>0.155</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

+ Significant at 90%
++ Significant at 95%
+++ Significant at 99%

Model 5, which includes all minority parties aggregated, shows that the distance from Moscow was a significant (and positive correlated) factor for explaining the minority vote in the 2003 election, whereas the variable was not significant when examining across both elections. Again, when compared with the United Russia party in Model 6, the variables that are significant for both the minority parties and the majority party have opposing relationships. In Model 7, the factors that were
significant in explaining the percentage of the vote received by the CPRF and the directions of the relationships are mostly unchanged from the previous regression in Model 3. The only exception is the percentage of the population that is ethnically Russian, which did not have a significant relationship to votes for the CPRF in 2003. In Model 8, we see the factors that explain the percentage of the vote received by the LDPR to be unchanged from the previous regression in Model 4.

The remaining parties in the 2003 election were those that only held seats in the 2003 elections. The Rodina coalition in model 9 proved to be more successful in regions that are closer to Moscow and have higher percentages of ethnic Russians. The Yabloko party is shown by Model 10 to perform best in highly urbanized regions with many ethnic Russians with smaller numbers of pensioners. Interestingly, Yabloko performs better in regions more economically dependent on the federal government. It is the only minority party in the study to have a significant positive relation to that variable. This could indicate that the party has ties with some of the same political and corporate elites that United Russia’s policies benefit.

The Union of Right Forces in Model 11 has the lowest adjusted r-square value in the study, with the variables in this study, explaining only 9% of the forces that drive the percentage of the vote that the party receives. Still, the model shows that ethnicity and urbanization are at least moderately significant factors, with the party shown to perform better in urbanized regions that have lower percentages of Russian ethnicity. Model 12 shows that the Agrarian Party of Russia in fares best in regions with more ethnic Russians and low levels of urbanization, which makes sense given the rural, agrarian focus of the party. Model 13 shows that the only significant variable to explain the percentage of the vote that the Russian Pensioner’s Party received is Russian ethnicity, to which it is positively correlated. Due to the lack of significance that the percent of pensioners variable held in the model, it would seem that pensioners voted more reliably for the CPRF than for the party that supposedly has their specific interests in mind.
### Table 3: Models 14-18 Parties with Seats in 2007 Election

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>All</th>
<th>Minority parties</th>
<th>United Russia</th>
<th>CPRF</th>
<th>LDPR</th>
<th>AJR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>3.359</td>
<td>87.806+++</td>
<td>-1.995</td>
<td>3.593</td>
<td>0.365</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent Russian</td>
<td>0.160+++</td>
<td>-0.257+++</td>
<td>0.071+++</td>
<td>0.097+++</td>
<td>0.027</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dist. From Moscow-In</td>
<td>0.144</td>
<td>-0.182</td>
<td>0.042</td>
<td>0.484+</td>
<td>0.137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent of Pensioners</td>
<td>0.402</td>
<td>-0.078</td>
<td>0.301+++</td>
<td>-0.223++</td>
<td>0.137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>0.039</td>
<td>-0.040</td>
<td>0.004</td>
<td>0.009</td>
<td>0.027</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic Dependence</td>
<td>-0.176++</td>
<td>0.138+</td>
<td>-0.015</td>
<td>-0.052++</td>
<td>-0.064++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R squared</td>
<td>0.433</td>
<td>0.526</td>
<td>0.499</td>
<td>0.549</td>
<td>0.281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adj R squared</td>
<td>0.398</td>
<td>0.495</td>
<td>0.466</td>
<td>0.520</td>
<td>0.235</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

+ Significant at 90%
++ Significant at 95%
+++ Significant at 99%

In the 2007 election, the number of seat holding minority parties reduced from seven to three, though one of the parties had had no seats in 2003. Model 14 shows that the aggregate minority party vote for 2007 was again significantly linked to by Russian ethnicity and economic dependence (in opposing directions to the relationships of those variables to the United Russia party in Model 15). Model 16 shows that the CPRF continued to be strongly supported by pensioners. The variables distance from Moscow and level of urbanization, which had been significant for the CPRF in the 2003 election were not significant factors in the 2007 election. Likewise, the percentage of the population that is ethnically Russian was significant for the CPRF in 2007, but not in 2003. Model 17 shows that the LDPR maintained most of the same relationships with the variables as in the other regressions run on the party in Models 4 and 8. The ‘A Just Russia Party’ in Model 18, which only won seats in the 2007 election, only significantly showed a negative correlation between economic dependence and the percentage of the vote they received.

Based upon Model 1, the hypotheses that were supported proven were hypothesis 1, 5, 6b, and 6c. Hypothesis 1 concerned ethnicity leader to higher minority party votes; hypotheses 5 predicted that reliance upon the federal government for funding would be negatively associated with minority parties obtaining more votes; hypothesis 6b concerned higher thresholds leading to fewer votes for minority parties elected; and 6c concerned increasing authoritarianism. When looking at all three sets of regression together, we can better understand some
key differences between elections and between effects on particular minority parties. This is especially true for the variables concerning the hypotheses that were not supported by the model.

For example, “distance from Moscow” proved not to be significant for all minority parties, but it was significant for some particular parties. Comparing only the models using the two elections years, we see that distance from Moscow was significant for several parties in 2003, but only for the LDPR in 2007. This would suggest that the distance from Moscow was more of a factor when plurality was part of the electoral system and when the thresholds were lower. The same was true for urbanization; it was only significant in regards to a few parties in the 2003 election.

Several variables were significant only for particular parties, but not for most minority parties or for all of them as a class. These variables included percentage of population that are pensioners, and level of urbanization. Pensioners were able to help explain the CPRF and LDPR vote well in all cases but none of the other parties.

Based upon both the 2003 and 2007 elections, Russian ethnicity was an important factor for most of the minority parties in each election, so it serves to reason it would be a significant factor in the model concerning the aggregated minority vote through both elections (Model 1). The correlation between Russian ethnicity and the percentage of the vote gathered was positive for most minority parties (Union of Right Forces being the sole exception), leading to a positive correlation for the variable in Model 1, which considered all parties. This provided the necessary support to uphold hypotheses 1.

Economic dependence on the federal government supported the relationship predicted in hypothesis 5, but from the data, we can see that the only parties for which economic dependence was a significant factor were the CPDR and LDPR (in all cases), Yabloko (in 2003), and AJR (in 2007). With the single exception Yabloko, the relationships the correlation of the variable was negative for all parties, even when the variable was not significant.

Finally, Model 1 upheld hypotheses 6b and 6c based upon the difference between elections being a significant and negatively correlated factor for both the CPRF and LDPR, the only two parties to hold seats in both elections.

Conclusions

Overall, it seemed that the change from the 2003 election to the 2007 election served to increase seats for the majority party at the expense of minority parties. This goes against what one would traditionally think of a proportional representation system in a democracy; however, the raised thresholds are consistent with fewer seats for minority parties. In addition, the increasing power of UF may not need an institutional explanation. Nonetheless, all signs seem to point to United Russia
establishing a system in which it can easily perpetuate its power.

The opposition parties are varied in the forces that increase their votes, though it seems that the electoral change and the percent of patronage negatively affected (nearly) all of them. As long as the factors affecting elections continue to move in a direction favorable to United Russia (such as pensioners continuing to pass and regions become more economically dependent upon the federal government) the party will continue to consolidate its support. Also, many political elites looking for access to power may bandwagon and join the dominant party.

Further research will be needed taking into consideration future elections where United Russia continues to be dominant. If Russian political history is any indicator, it may be decades before the party in power is able to be deposed. In theory, it would be easier to dismantle United Russia’s command of the electorate than it was to dismantle the Soviet Union, but the shield of at least moderate legitimacy afforded by the democratic elections United Russia used to gain power may be a formidable shield against any immediate change.
References

2002 Russian Census. “4.2. NATIONAL COMPOSITION OF POPULATION FOR REGIONS OF THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION.”


Electoral Geography 2.0. “Elections in Russia.”


This study analyzed attachment anxiety, avoidance and self-esteem in young women with Turner's syndrome (TS). Other variables such as growth hormone treatment, height and social support were also examined. Results were then compared to those of women without Turners. It was hypothesized that 1.) Attachment issues such as anxiety and avoidance would be stronger in those with Turners, and 2.) Women with Turners would have lower self-esteem. An online survey using items from the Rosenberg Self-Esteem scale, the Experiences in Close Relationships Revised (ECR-R) scale, and Multidimensional Scale of Perceived Social Support (MSPSS) provided data that was analyzed using Pearson and Spearman Rho correlations, Chi-Square and t-tests. As supported by previous studies, women with Turners were found to have lower self-esteem and were less likely to be in a relationship. However, of those who had been in relationships, no difference in self-esteem was found between the two groups. No significant differences in attachment anxiety or avoidance were found between Turners and non-Turners groups. Interestingly enough, participant’s physical height was found to be negatively correlated with avoidance.
Turners syndrome is a chromosomal disorder occurring in one out of 2,500 live female births. It was identified by endocrinologist Dr. Henry Turner in 1938 when he first described some of the major characteristics including small stature, lack of sexual development, and webbed neck (Collin, 2006). In 1958 it was determined that the genetic background to the condition was “XO” or a missing X chromosome. Even though those with this condition are rarely hospitalized it can affect their everyday lives as well as their long-term physical and psychological health (Collin, 2006). Those with Turners may experience cardiovascular and kidney abnormalities as well as high blood pressure and obesity (Christopoulos, Deligeoroglou, Laggari, Christopoulos & Creatsas, 2006).

Some research has been done on personality and psychosocial problems of those with Turners syndrome. For instance, McCauley, Feuillan, Kushner and Ross (2001) used self and parental report instruments to look at social competence, behavior and self-esteem using 97 TS girls and 93 control subjects between the ages of 7 and 14 and found that girls with Turners had more difficulties with social relationships, immaturity and poor self-concept when compared to the control group. Turners girls were also found to have a decline in self-esteem when moving into early adolescence, while the control group experienced no decline. They also state, that “…research on the psychosocial development has documented adjustment problems in the areas of immaturity, poor concentration, increased activity level, and peer relationships in younger girls with Turners” (p.360).

In adolescents, anxiety and immaturity are found to be the most common problems. There maybe sufficient research in the area regarding Turners, but the attachment patterns in relationships among young women with Turner’s syndrome and their partners are severely under-researched. This is most likely because the incidence of Turner’s is low among the general population. Since this population is less available than the general female population, it is more difficult to conduct empirical research, which is necessary to better understand the experiences of the Turners population.

Personal experience with this disorder is a main factor contributing to my interest in this topic. After preliminary, online conversations with fellow Turners women on a social networking website, there seems to be anecdotal evidence of a common underlying insecurity when it comes to forming or maintaining romantic relationships. This research looked for a significant difference between the romantic attachment of the general female population and that of the Turners population, and looked at possible predictors of attachment and self esteem in these women with Turners. This research will help the parents and clinicians of young girls and women with Turner’s better understand and prepare their child/patient for future relationships. This research also has the potential of bettering the social lives of young
women with Turner’s in general and thus their quality of life.

Several studies have looked extensively into the psychosocial development of those with Turner’s syndrome (TS), including children and adolescents, and many have looked at self-esteem. Another, earlier study by McCauley, Feuillan, Kushner and Ross in (1995) looked at a sample of 122 Turner’s girls and a control group of 108 girls with no genetic disorders between the ages of 13 and 18. This study used self and parental report instruments assessing social, academic, school and behavioral functioning and found that those with TS were seen as having more problems in terms of social relationships. They were also rated by parents as being less socially competent than the control group. With evidence from both the McCauley, et al. (1995) study and the McCauley, et al. (2001) study it is apparent that children and adolescents with Turner’s face self-esteem and social difficulties.

Growth hormone (GH) is a highly suggested regimen for adolescents with Turner’s syndrome, and it is thought that GH improves the social problems those with Turner’s face. Christopoulos, Deligeoroglou, Laggari, Christopoulos and Creatasas (2006) conducted a narrative review looking at literature on the use and effects of growth hormone (GH) in Turner’s. They found that with growth hormone use there was a significant decline in attention problems and social problems as well as withdrawal. They also found that the increased growth rate was associated with the GH and that GH may be associated with positive behavioral changes observed in the individuals. Even though the specific role of GH plays in this improvement is not well known, they suggest that the positive changes could be due to the improved body image and higher self-esteem that results from the increased height, but no evidence was given to support this theory.

With the apparent social problems that young girls with Turner’s face, one has to wonder about the relationships they experience later in life. Rolstad, Moller and Bryman (2007), have examined the marital status, sexual history and sexual functioning of women with Turner’s. In this study, data from interviews and two self-report questionnaires found that women with Turner’s were less likely to have established a stable partner relationship and had their sexual debut later in life than the general Swedish population. Single women with Turner’s were found to have lower levels of sexual desire when compared to the general population. However women with Turner’s who were in relationships did not differ significantly from the general population Jez, Irzyniec and Lew-Starowicz (2006) also came to similar conclusions regarding later dating and sexual debut in life.

The McCauley, et al. studies (1995; 2001) examined self-esteem and other psychosocial problems that Turner’s girls/adolescents face, but they did not look at self-esteem in relation to attachment and relationships. The Christopoulos, et al. (2006) study reviewed GH studies and concluded that GH could be a helpful option
for Turners patients. They theorized that the observed reduction in social and self-esteem problems were a result of the gained height. However no evidence was offered and GH was not looked at in conjunction with relationships and attachment. The last studies mentioned examined the lifestyle of Turners women, including sexual life and relationships. However, these three studies did not examine the attachment variable, which is known to play an important role when establishing relationships, especially those of a romantic nature. So far, research has shown that those with Turners have lower self-esteem, are less likely to be in a relationship and that they have their dating and sexual debut later in life.

It is the purpose of this study to link self-esteem, perceived social support, growth hormone and relationships. By doing this we can gain further insight into possible reasons why women with Turners are less likely to be in romantic relationships and why they have lower self-esteem. Is it possible that growth hormone could help with these issues? There is one question that must be answered first. Are attachment issues such as anxiety and avoidance and lower self-esteem stronger in women with Turners? It was hypothesized that those with Turners have lower self-esteem and that attachment anxiety and avoidance are stronger in this population.

**Method**

**Participants**

Participants were a sample of convenience of 20 young women, 18 or older, with Turners syndrome recruited from various groups on social networking sites such as facebook.com and yahoogroups.com. The control group consisted of 19 young women without Turners recruited from the same networking sites. Over half the participants were 18 to 24 years of age, while around 25% were 30 or older. The smallest portion consisted of 25 to 29 year olds.

**Graph 1: Age of Participants**
Instruments

The instruments used in this study included an online survey which included demographic information as well as items from three different scales. *The Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale*, created by Morris Rosenberg in 1965, was used to assess self-esteem (Rosenberg, 2008). It consists of ten four-point likert scale items and was found to have “satisfactory criterion and convergent validity” by Ferring and Filipp (1996, p. 284). *The Experiences in Close Relationships-Revised* (ECR-R) scale (2009), which consists of 36, seven-point likert scale questions, was used to assess participants’ attachment anxiety and avoidance. It was created by Fraley, Waller, and Brennan in 2000 and was found to be highly reliable and precise by Sibley, Fischer & Liu (2005). The *Multidimensional Scale of Perceived Social Support* (MSPSS), created by Zimet, Dahlem, Zimet and Farley (1988), was then used to assess perceived social support from various sources. It consists of 12, seven-point likert scale questions and was found to have good internal and test-retest reliability as well as moderate construct validity upon testing by its authors.

Procedure

The participants, both control and Turners group, were recruited and told about the study through various Turners groups on the social networking sites facebook.com and yahoogroups.com and were contacted via email messages. They were invited to a new, closed social networking group on their given networking site.
and once they were members they were able to receive group e-mail messages which were sent out about once a week with instructions, information and updates as well as reminders about the survey. The facebook.com group had 70 members while the yahoo group only recruited 3 members. Not all group members completed the survey. These groups provided the needed information about the study, including the informed consent document, a hyper-text link to the survey URL as well as contact information for the researcher and researcher’s mentor. Participants were told this study was looking at romantic experience in women and were also assured of their anonymity and confidentiality. There was no way to link answers to the participants. Participants were asked to join the research group at the beginning of the study. Participants were also informed about the chance to enter a drawing for a flash-drive in the informed consent, and after completing the survey participants were told where to go to enter. A website, hosted by webs.com, was also created which included the same information as the group pages as well as some biographical information about the researcher, the flash-drive entry form, and links to information about Turner Syndrome.

Results

Self-Esteem

As hypothesized women with Turner’s were found to have lower self-esteem (M = 25.85) than those without [M = 30.42; t (39) = -2.429, p = 0.02]. However, when only those who had a history of relationships were included, the significant difference in self-esteem was no longer present [Turners: M = 27.18, Control: M = 30.82; t (27) = -1.587, p = 0.125].

As I hypothesized, self-esteem was positively correlated with perceived social support from a significant other [r (39) = .599, p < 0.01], from family [r (39) = .684, p < 0.01] and from friends [r (39) = .647, p < 0.01]. Self-esteem was negatively correlated with attachment anxiety [r (37) = -0.511, p < 0.01], but not with attachment avoidance. [r (37) = -0.178, p = 0.293] Self-esteem also had a positive correlation with height [ρ (39) = .381, p = 0.017].

Relationship Satisfaction & Length

As hypothesized, women with Turner’s were, in general, less likely to be in a relationship [Turners: 11 yes, 9 no; Control: 17 yes, 2 no; X² (1, N = 39) = 5.718, p = 0.017]. For those in relationships, both groups were found to be similar in relationship satisfaction [Turners: M = 3.64, Control: M = 3.88; t (27) = -1.29, p = 0.208] and length [Turners: M = 5.36, Control: M = 4.94; t (27) = 0.761, p = 0.453]. However, there was a marginal tendency for Turner’s women who had taken
growth hormone to be more satisfied with their relationship \[ r (11) = 1.94, p = 0.078 \].

**Graph 3: Relationship History of Participants**

---

**Attachment Anxiety, Avoidance**

It was hypothesized that attachment anxiety and avoidance would be stronger in women with Turners; however, there was no significant difference found between the two groups. Attachment anxiety was found to be negatively correlated with perceived social support from friends \[ r (37) = -0.477, p<0.01 \] and significant other \[ r (37) = -0.487, p= 0.01 \]. However, the correlation was not significant with support from family \[ r (37) = -0.263, p = 0.116 \]. Avoidance was found to be negatively correlated with height \[ r (37) = -0.393, p = 0.016 \].

**Perceived Social Support**

The perceived social support scale measured three sources of social support: family, friends and a significant other. There were no significant differences in perceived social support between the two groups. It was found that social support from significant other was correlated with social support from family \[ r = 0.671, p<0.01 \] and friends \[ r = 0.784, p<0.01 \]. Support from family and support from friends were also correlated \[ r = 0.707, p<0.01 \].
Discussion

As hypothesized, it was found that women with Turners were less likely to be in a relationship and that Turners women had lower self-esteem. These findings were expected because previous research, such as both McCauley, et al. studies (1995; 2001) and Rolstad, et al. (2007) had come to similar conclusions.

When looking at height and self-esteem another significant relationship was found; those who were taller had higher self-esteem and another issue related to height is the fact that height was found to be negatively correlated with attachment avoidance. So it would seem that the shorter the person was, the higher their avoidance. This might lead one to think that those with Turners would have more attachment avoidance, however a significant difference was not found. Even though those with Turners were not found to be significantly more avoidant that those without, perhaps the slight difference in avoidance, likely due to shorter stature, is enough to keep most Turners women out of relationships. This is a likely explanation as to why Turners women are less likely to be in relationships.

The fact that the significant difference in self-esteem was no longer present when looking at only those who had been in relationships was unexpected. Those who have been in relationships, especially in the Turners population, seem to have better self-esteem. So perhaps the fact that Turners women have fewer relationships is enough to create the significant difference in self-esteem or it could be the shorter stature of the Turners population that causes it, and possibly it is a combination of both. From the results gathered it would seem that the shorter stature associated with Turners, and not Turners itself, is the most likely reason for the lower self-esteem and lack of relationships in women with Turners.

This study has yielded some interesting and helpful results when it comes to better understanding the attachment patterns, relationship experience and self-esteem issues of women with Turners syndrome. However, there is still much more that can be done. Larger samples in future studies would definitely produce better results and make for more validity. There are many possibilities for further study on the Turners population. Study on body image and further research in regards to attachment would help us all better understand the psychology of this understudied group.
Bibliography


The Experiences in Close Relationships-Revised (ECR-R) Questionnaire. Retrieved February 26, 2009, from Psychology at University of Illinois at Urbana Champaign Web site: [http://www.psych.uiuc.edu/~rcfraley/measures/ecrritems.htm](http://www.psych.uiuc.edu/~rcfraley/measures/ecrritems.htm)


College Students’ Perceptions Regarding Legal Drug Usage: Caffeine, Alcohol, and Nicotine

Jonathan Whitfield

Dr. David Conner, Mentor

Ninety-one college students participated in an online survey investigating usage behaviors related to caffeine, alcohol, and nicotine usage behaviors. Participants also rated themselves on social and academic involvement; on the social types with which they identified, as well as to which group an associate or stranger would assign them. In addition, we measured their perceptions of college student types’ drug usage for each drug by amount and by number of servings for social type and time-based contexts. Preliminary findings both extend and confirm previous literature which shows that descriptive and inferential statistics suggest that drug use context has a significant effect on perceived drug usage behaviors as well there being a significant difference between perceived and actual drug usage.

Drug Usage in College Populations

Drug use is a commonplace area of research on college campuses, and the variety of drugs that are available to college students is large (Dierker, et al., 2006; Webb, Ashton, Kelly, & Kamali, 1996; Wechsler, Lee, Kuo & Lee, 2000). In order to
conduct meaningful research in the area of college drug use leads to limiting the scope of the investigation as a function of efficiency. Legal drug research on a college campus is a particularly relevant area of investigation, primarily due to the ages of legality for both alcohol and nicotine when considered with the average age of a traditional college student. However, legal drug research is also concerned with food additives such as methylxanthines, a chemical grouping under which caffeine is a member. After reviewing the place of legal drugs in college drug research, information particular to (a) caffeine, (b) alcohol, and (c) nicotine show the relevancy and widespread use of these drugs in a college setting.

Caffeine

Caffeine is one of the most used psychotropic substances in the world, with usage rates higher than any other drug (Lundsberg, 1998). College campuses are no different, and caffeine consumption is wide-spread (Kapner & Anderson, 2008; Reissig, Strain, & Griffiths, 2009). Particular to the use of caffeine in a college context is the use of energy drinks and other concentrated sources of caffeine. As explicated in Malinauskas, et al. (2007), “[energy] drink consumption has continued to gain popularity since the 1997 debut of Red Bull…” and is intended to “give the consumer a ‘jolt’ of energy” (Background section, para. 1). The authors conclude by stating that “there has been little research performed regarding the energy drink patterns among young adults in the United States (Malinauskas, et al., 2007, Background section, para. 3). Considering such recent developments regarding college students’ adoption of more powerful stimulants such as Ritalin (Kapner, 2008) along with the reported increase in caffeine concentration in beverages such as energy drinks (Malinauskas, et al., 2007) and soft drinks (Lundsberg, 1998, p. 222), research investigating the place of caffeine within a college context is relevant to the discussion of academic drug abuse.

Alcohol

Alcohol is the most commonly abused drug used on college campuses, usually referenced along with binge drinking, or drinking a large amount of alcohol in one sitting (Wechsler & Kuo, 2000). The exact definitions of ‘large’ are discussed in the literature with the standard being 5–6+ or more drinks in a sitting for males or 4–5+ or more drinks in a sitting for females. Other reports (Wechsler, Dowell, Davenport, & Rimm, 1995) differ, saying that 6 or more drinks in a sitting for males or 5 or more in a sitting for females constitutes binge drinking. Co-morbid drug use involving alcohol is also prevalent on college campuses; alcohol is primarily correlated to nicotine usage but also is reported to be used in conjunction with caffeine (Carmody, Brischetto, Matarazzo, O’Donnell, & Connor, 1985).
Nicotine

Nicotine, as well as its primary psychoactive ingredient, is the second most prevalent legal drug. Nicotine use differs from that of alcohol and caffeine, especially in methods of ingestion. Cigarette smoking is a common method of ingestion, with other combusted methods being pipes, cigars, chew and snuff. Individuals in college populations report that they use tobacco to relieve fatigue and sleep inertia related cognitive deficits (Parkin, Fairweather, & Hindmarch, 1997). Tobacco use is significantly positively correlated to alcohol consumption, and is weakly correlated to caffeine consumption (Musgrave-Marquart, Bromley, & Dalley, 1997).

Perceived Drug Usage and its Consequences

While college drug consumption is well researched in the area of actual drug usage behaviors, or descriptive norms of college drug behaviors, the perception of drug behaviors are under researched. These injunctive norms of college drug consumption are, however, important considerations, as the relationship between perception and resultant behavior has been well-established in (a) stereotype construction and (b) social norms.

Stereotype construction

Perception is an action which, as defined through information coding processes by Dijksterhuis & Bargh (2001), “activates the mental representation of this action which in turn will lead to performance of the action” (p.8). Summarizing the concept of “the perception-behavior expressway”, the authors follow with their definition of the interaction between perception and behavior by codifying three levels of behavior mediated by perception:

1. **Observables**, which, as Dijksterhuis and Bargh state, “are easy to define (…) [as] behavior that we can literally perceive,” such as facial expressions, tone and accent of speech, and other behaviors (p. 8).

2. **Trait inferences** are “generated on the behavior of others” and are informed by the (a) behavior being observed, and (b) the environment in which the behavior is occurring. An example of trait inference is when an individual observing a slow walking person automatically and unconsciously slows their speed to match (p. 8).

3. **Social stereotypes** are defined as “integrated collections of trait concepts purportedly descriptive of the social group in question.” They are activated by perception of an individual, but, instead of one behavior, they “automati-
cally categorize that person as a member of his or her group based on [trait inferences], and (...) the stereotype associated with that group becomes active as well (pp. 8-9)."

The consequences of this on the construction of social stereotypes are that they are unconscious processes of imitation which operate at a cognitive level. Operationally defining the social stereotype as based on observable, subjective perceptions and their behavioral implications, the practical application of these is evident in the literature.

Cognitive processes which underlie the formation of social stereotypes have been demonstrated in a variety of fields. As summarized in the work of Richard Ashmore on social stereotypes as a multidimensional construct, theoreticians in the fields of cognitive anthropology and sociology and more “have [recognized] the significant role that socially designated types play in social perception” (Ashmore, Griffio, Green, & Moreno, 2007, p. 2922). Ashmore constructed a method of identifying social stereotypes based on types originally found in high school social typing (Brown, 1989). The procedure used in Ashmore, et al. (2007) involved a modification of Brown’s type labels through a free-sorting exercise with the use of a multidimensional scaling procedure and hierarchical clustering techniques. After the modification procedure, ten summary student types were created, on which 85 student social stereotypes were sorted; the ten categories were then shown to be significantly different through further analysis (p. 2938).

Social Norms Approaches

The social norms approach is a “theory- and evidence-based approach to addressing health issues”, typically involving “the correction of misperceptions involving social norms, rather than attempts to change norms that are unhealthy or problematic” (Berkowitz, 2005). The mechanism of this correction involves two key cognitive biases: pluralistic ignorance and false consensus. Pluralistic ignorance occurs when individuals believe themselves to not be in the majority position when they actually are; this bias, as stated by Berkowitz, is when “individuals incorrectly perceive the attitudes and/or behaviors of peers and other community members to be different from their own when in fact they are not” (2005). Conversely, false consensus is when an individual incorrectly believes themselves to be in the majority position when they are not. While these phenomena have been independently researched (Hines, Saris, & Throckmorton-Belzer, 2002; Shamir & Shamir, 1997; Boven, 2000), their interaction forms the basis for both the production and perpetuation of misperceptions of social norms.

Another issue related to the topic of social norms is that of self/other differences, or “the discrepancy between one’s own views and/or behaviors and those of
others” (Borsari & Carey, 2003, p. 332). These self/other differences are, as explained by Bosari and Carey, “central to the effectiveness of the social norms approach (...) because students tend to view others as drinking more and being more tolerant of alcohol use than themselves” (p. 332). The mechanism behind social norms interventions is to correct the perceptions of these self/other differences; Berkowitz (2005) states that “interventions to correct misperceptions by revealing the actual, healthier norm will have a beneficial effect on most individuals” (p. 194).

Application to College Drug Research

The application of the cognitive basis and construction of college social stereotypes and norms to college drug research is not a direct one, but one that has been predicted and supported in previous studies (Perkins, Meilman, Leichliter, Cashin, & Presley, 1999; Perkins, 2002). The delineation of subsets of a college population that are derived formally, yet still based on informal, subjective labeling of individuals in social stereotyping is useful as it provides a context in which descriptive and injunctive norms of drug usage can be investigated in greater detail than ‘the average student’ (Larimer, et al., 2009). Other studies have determined that specificity in descriptive norm can entail many different referents to the individual in question: (a) gender, (b) ethnicity, and (c) social involvement such as fraternity or sorority membership. Cognitive mappings of socio-academic groups on college campuses affords more specificity and the possibility of matching the mental maps that student individuals have created through perception and behaviors.

Social norms interventions, when applied to college drug consumption behaviors, are often put into practice regarding alcohol consumption. As such, research concerning alcohol norms interventions comprises the largest body of research dedicated to social norms interventions (Perkins, et al. 1999; Wechsler & Kuo, 2000). A significant amount of success has also been seen in tobacco interventions in college populations. However, research regarding caffeine is mostly non-existent; this seems incongruous with the rates of caffeine usage on a world-wide and college level.

Research Questions and Hypotheses

Based on the proportion of extant studies and on the importance and paucity of norms-based caffeine research on the college level, two research questions directed the present study:

1. What are the perceived injunctive norms of caffeine usage?
2. How do the perceived injunctive norms of caffeine usage compare to the injunctive norms of alcohol and nicotine usage?
Two non-directed hypotheses were generated from the research questions:
1. The results of the study will show the perceived injunctive norms of caffeine usage.
2. The perceived injunctive norms of caffeine usage will not be similar to the perceived injunctive norms of alcohol and nicotine usage in reported data.
   Stated differently:
   \[ H_0: \mu_{\text{caffeine}} \neq \mu_{\text{alcohol}}; \mu_{\text{caffeine}} \neq \mu_{\text{nicotine}} \]
   \[ H_A: \mu_{\text{caffeine}} = \mu_{\text{alcohol}}; \mu_{\text{caffeine}} = \mu_{\text{nicotine}} \]

**Methodology**

**Overview**

The study was carried out in two parts. Following the methodology as presented in Perkins et al. (1999) and similar norms-based studies, the first part of the study is a quantitative analysis of data collected via online survey to evaluate the perceived legal drug usage behaviors of each social type summary category across time-based context. Secondly, a meta-analysis of the Missouri College Health Behavior Survey (MCHBS) was performed to assess the demographic properties sample and the observed drug usage for alcohol and nicotine of the MCHBS in comparison to the survey administered for this study.

**Survey**

**Participants**

Participants of the study were 113 Truman State University students (aged 18-25) who were enrolled in Summer 2009 Psychology courses. Participants had the option of enrolling in a drawing for one of five $20 gift certificates to the University Bookstore as well as the possibility of extra credit at the discretion of their respective professors.

**Instrument Construction**

The online survey instrument was derived from past literature and existing surveys, most notably Perkins et al. (1999), Ashmore, Del Boca, & Beebe (2002), Ashmore, et al. (2007) and the MCHBS. The survey is comprised of 42 items separated into 7 different sections, each regarding a different aspect of the research hypotheses in question. The sections are as follows: Consent, Demographics, Deductive Measures of Social Type, Inductive Measures of Social Type, Perceptions Regarding Alcohol, Perceptions Regarding Nicotine, and Perceptions Regarding Caffeine.
The first section of the survey is a consent document which contains relevant information prior to the survey, such as indicating the advantages and disadvantages related to participation in the survey and that participant responses are completely anonymous and independent of their identity. Consent is obtained through an item with a two-value response option, one agreeing that the participant is giving informed consent and the other disagreeing that the participant is giving informed consent. This response option then filters the participants in agreement to the first page of the survey, where the other redirects the participant out of the survey.

Following the consent statement, demographic information is then collected (e.g., age, sex, ethnicity, GPA). The demographic information is directly adapted from the MCHBS as a method of establishing identical question wording, which will then enable analysis between the survey instrument and the archival 2008-2009 MCHBS data. Any additional questions or additions to existing questions were appended after the MCHBS demographic items.

The inductive and deductive measures of social type comprise sections three and four of the survey. Each of these sections is constructed to determine the participants’ own social type summary category but from two different perspectives: deductive and inductive reasoning. Inductively determining the social type summary category is accomplished by asking the participant directly to which of the categories do they belong by three viewpoints (the participant’s viewpoint, the viewpoint of an individual who knows the participant well, and the viewpoint of an individual who does not know the participant well), with each perspective denoting an observation from which the attribution of social type summary category can be inductively derived. From the three perspectives, the participant chooses the appropriate type category by placing a checkmark next to each category. Following inductive determination, deductive determination of the social type summary category is then accomplished by asking the participant what their curricular and extracurricular levels of participation are in academic and social activities in order to obtain approximate levels of activity within each area. These questions ask the amount of activity within each type of social and academic activity on a 5 point scale ranging from 1 to 5 (Not at all active/Extremely active).

The last sections of the survey concern the legal drug usage behaviors of all eight social types, with section five regarding perceptions about alcohol usage, section six regarding perceptions about nicotine usage, and section seven regarding perceptions about caffeine usage. Each section is structured identically, asking the same sets of questions about each of the legal drugs. Framed within specific times or occasions, one set of questions regards the amount of drug consumption in general amount on a 5 point scale ranging from 1 to 5 (No Amount/Great Amount) and the second set of questions regarding the amount of drug consumption in the specific number of servings consumed.
Archival Data (MCHBS)

Participants
Participants of the 2008 and 2009 MCHBS were students from Missouri institutions of higher education, specifically: Harris-Stowe State University, University of Central Missouri, Lincoln University, Missouri Southern State University, Missouri State University, Missouri Western State University, Northwest Missouri State University, Southeast Missouri State University, Truman State University, University of Missouri, University of Missouri-Kansas City, Missouri University of Science and Technology, and the University of Missouri-St. Louis. Regarding the 2008 MCHBS data, there were 5050 participants from across these institutions with 296 participants from Truman State University (TSU); as for the 2009 MCHBS data the overall data is still pending with 290 participants from TSU.

Instrument
The 2008 and 2009 MCHBS are based on the CORE survey, which is administered currently by the CORE Institute at Southern Illinois University-Carbondale (SIUC). This survey, administrated by the Missouri Partners in Prevention (MOPiP), deviates from the CORE survey by having questions that are relevant to the schools being surveyed, removing such elements as questions regarding some illegal drugs and adding questions relating to social norms interventions and campus-based initiatives which are unique to the campuses under investigation. Questions relevant to this study include items establishing demographics and norms for alcohol, as well as illustrating the paucity of data regarding normative usage of nicotine and caffeine.

Procedure
Participant Recruitment
Participants were contacted via email addresses obtained from Truman State University records through the Information Technology Services office. Each participant then confirmed their passive consent prior to progressing through the survey. After completing the survey, each participant was then redirected to a page where they could give their information to be registered for the survey drawing inducement.
Grouping Techniques

The first grouping procedure used is based on Ashmore, et al. (2007). However, instead of the multidimensional approach used by Ashmore, a simplified two-dimensional approach using social and academic spectra was utilized. Furthermore, the hierarchical clustering technique used in the original implementation is further simplified by ranking the means of the social and academic dimensions before using a Cartesian least distance two-dimensional clustering technique. After these steps were taken, another grouping (Follows Rules) was then added to ensure that the generated cognitive mapping more accurately matched the sample taken from TSU.

The second grouping technique is that of social and time-based drug use context. These contexts are subjective divisions of objective time intervals, such as splitting a day into morning, afternoon and night, which has precedence in the literature (Revelle, Humphreys, Simon, & Gilliland; 1980). More time-based contexts were added based off common college social events, such as a night before a test (Test Night) and the night of a social event (Social Event). The reasoning behind these groupings is primarily derived from literature surrounding binge drinking; however, if these definitions can be extended to other drugs, the ‘parties’ that spawn addictive behaviors regarding alcohol may have analogues in other drug cultures. In reference to caffeine and nicotine, it is reasonable then to assume, from this inference and literature regarding Ritalin and other stimulant drugs, that situations where wakefulness and alertness are necessary will feature similar ‘binge’ behaviors.

Results

Descriptive Statistics

Means

The reported perceived drug consumption of every grouping using the stated grouping procedures were generated, resulting in the means and standard deviations reported in Table 2-3 for the first grouping procedure and Tables 4-6 for the second. Shown graphically, the means regarding time based contexts (Tables 2-3) illustrate trends of perceived usage. These means reflect the number of perceived servings of the drug, rather than the actual servings consumed as partially reported in the MCHBS results. Also, this is different than the subjective amount of drug use, which is only a rating of how ‘average’ the reported servings were in reference to the perceived group norm. Following from the methodology, procedure, and the descriptive statistics generated, the first hypothesis seems to be supported under face
validity; however, the experimental validity of these numbers is undetermined and needs further support to be empirically valid.

**Correlations**

Regarding the second hypothesis, correlation coefficients were calculated to investigate how the overall mean perceived consumption in servings of each of the drugs involved in the present study were linearly related. These correlations are Spearman’s $r$; non-parametric correlations done to verify these results are also significant at the alpha level of 0.001. These findings are reported in Table 7.

**Inferential Statistics**

**Means Comparison**

The second hypothesis was tested using overall measures of perceived drug consumption. Using a two-sample $t$-test assuming equal variance, the null hypothesis that the mean perceived reported use of caffeine would not differ significantly from alcohol is rejected [$t(124)=0.084$, $\alpha=0.05$, $p=0.934$]. Similarly, the null hypothesis that the mean perceived reported use of caffeine would not differ significantly from nicotine is also rejected [$t(124)=1.779$, $\alpha=0.05$, $p=0.078$]. Though non-significant, both $t$-tests additionally determined that the mean for caffeine intake is less than that of nicotine and alcohol. Therefore, the alternate hypothesis that the means for perceived caffeine consumption are different from those of alcohol or nicotine is supported.

In comparing the means of certain socioacademic groups, novel results were generated for a subset of the groupings used. This subset was influenced by the stereotype constructions used in Ashmore, et al. (2007) and had the benefit of controlling the Type I family-wise error rate. Between the groupings of ‘Addict’ and ‘Non-Conformist’ for nicotine, the two-sample $t$-test assuming equal variances reported that the means of both groups are from the same distribution [$t(122)=3.719$, $\alpha=0.05$, $p=0.0003$]. As for alcohol, the same test was performed between ‘Addict’ and ‘Popular/In-Crowd’ showing significantly that the means are from the same distribution [$t(126)=3.782$, $\alpha=0.05$, $p=0.0002$]. Finally, the groups ‘Addicts’ and ‘Academic/Student’ were analyzed for caffeine using the same test, showing that both samples do not have the same distribution [$t(126)=1.495$, $\alpha=0.05$, $p=0.137$].
Discussion

Caffeine

The results for perceived caffeine usage in the sample show an interesting trend, as it is different than the trends for alcohol and nicotine: across time-based contexts, the amount consumed in servings shows little difference when compared to the great variance found in both alcohol and nicotine. This reflects the widespread use of caffeine; since there is little need to only use caffeine in night or weekend contexts as is the case with alcohol and nicotine. Caffeine is ingested throughout the day, with the mean value dipping slightly in the weekend values.

The t-test between ‘Addict’ and ‘Academic/Student’ shows that they do not come from the same distribution; a possible interpretation of this test is that ‘Addicts’ consume more caffeine overall than ‘Academic/Student’ individuals, or that perhaps more data is needed to make a more rigorous claim regarding the perceived usage of caffeine. In either case, more information regarding caffeine use would clarify the present investigation significantly.

Alcohol

In terms of alcohol consumption, the perceived norms follow a distinct trend. From the beginning of a week or day time period, perceived drug use sharply increases; in the case of day to night usage, consumption increases by roughly four times as seen in Table 3 and Figure 1. Numerous accounts colloquially verify this and it matches the literature (Wechsler, et al. 2000). Use is rare through the day and increases to nighttime and weekend usage as a consequence of alcohol effects on productivity; any use through the week may cause work deficits the next day due to any drug after effects.

Additionally, as reported above, the socioacademic grouping of ‘Addict’ shares a common distribution with that of ‘Popular/In-Crowd’. This implies that the perception of the sample of TSU students involved in the present study believed that the ‘Popular/In-Crowd’ grouping of Truman’s population uses alcohol to the same extent as that of ‘Addicts’. Further study needs to be done to uniquely confirm this outcome in actual normative usage. However, this data verifies colloquial beliefs regarding popular students’ drug usage.

Nicotine

Nicotine features a similar trend as alcohol but is not as steep, only showing a two times increase from morning to night, which is similar to the trend seen from weekday to weekend nicotine usage (Table 2-3; Figure 1). As a drug that is anecdotally consumed in similar contexts as alcohol, this trend is congruous with the literature.
The hypothesis test regarding ‘Addict’ and ‘Non-Conformist’ groupings showed that they share a common distribution. The perceptions of the sample then imply that those who are in the ‘Non-Conformist’ socio-academic grouping use a similar amount of nicotine in servings as that of an ‘Addict’. Again, as before, further study needs to be done to confirm this finding in normative usage.

Social Stigma and Academic Policy

A possible explanation for the differences in perceived usage in both time-based and socioacademic grouping-based contexts, as shown above, is social stigma. Stigma concerning both alcohol and nicotine consumption is apparent in college environments, especially that of Truman State University. By way of policy, alcohol is banned on campus and nicotine is restricted to certain designated areas on campus. These policy decisions are based on precedents involving the negative effects of such drugs in these contexts: alcohol is linked both colloquially and in case study to poor work and productivity, while nicotine is linked to the possibility of second-hand smoke inhalation and other health related concerns. Normative usage behavior patterns by which drug consumption is regulated are set by these policies, resulting in stigma associated with breaking these social norms. Correlation measures in Table 7 follow this inference, as alcohol and nicotine have a higher linear correlation than that of caffeine and nicotine or caffeine and alcohol.

As an example of this, alcohol consumption in a classroom setting is banned from the campus and shouldn’t be consumed in a class context; however, if one were to consume alcohol in this context there would be both an administrative reaction as well as a social reaction mediated by normative usage patterns by way of the policies listed above. As for nicotine, the same holds true, as any classroom use would result in an academic and social reaction. However, caffeine is not banned and can be consumed without regard to the social or academic appropriateness of the context one is in. The result of both social stigma (which governs the injunctive norms regarding usage) and academic policy (which governs the descriptive norms regarding usage) is a practical model of college drug usage when restricting one’s view to that of socio-academic categorization axes.

Conclusion

Perceived norms are important for college drug research, as they inform the researcher about what individuals in the sample perceive they or others should do in order to be acceptable. In the current study, evidence supported the conclusion that (a) perceived normative caffeine usage data exists and (b) that it differs from those of alcohol and nicotine in important and nuanced ways. Following these assertions, it is apparent that more research needs to be done in the area of perceived norms, but
also in the area of descriptive norms. The CORE and MCBHS surveys lack rigorous normative and perceived norms for caffeine and nicotine usage, focusing instead on norms related to alcohol. Additionally, a nuanced approach in selecting usage behaviors through greater norm referent specificity, as well as more research regarding injunctive and descriptive caffeine norms are possible directions for future endeavors related to the drug use research in college populations.
References


### Tables

**Table 1**

Overall Weekly Reported Drug Consumption by Number of Servings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Substance</th>
<th>Current Study Mean</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S. D.</th>
<th>MCHBS* Mean</th>
<th>S. D.</th>
<th>**</th>
<th>**</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Caffeine</td>
<td>5.17</td>
<td>**</td>
<td></td>
<td>**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alcohol</td>
<td>7.14</td>
<td>7.87 (10.04)***</td>
<td>9.81 (10.06)***</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicotine</td>
<td>5.52</td>
<td>**</td>
<td></td>
<td>**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Data generated from reported number of servings per specific day of week

**The MCHBS does not have measures of normative caffeine usage

***Amount in parentheses is for ‘Drinkers’ subset of MCHBS data

****Calculated from week-related context values (Weekday/Weekend)

**Table 2**

Reported Drug Consumption in Servings by Drug Type and Time of Day

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Substance</th>
<th>Morning Mean</th>
<th>S. D.</th>
<th>Afternoon Mean</th>
<th>S. D.</th>
<th>Night Mean</th>
<th>S. D.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Caffeine</td>
<td>1.97</td>
<td>1.11</td>
<td>1.87</td>
<td>1.17</td>
<td>1.98</td>
<td>1.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alcohol</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>1.19</td>
<td>1.15</td>
<td>3.02</td>
<td>2.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicotine</td>
<td>1.87</td>
<td>1.74</td>
<td>2.17</td>
<td>1.71</td>
<td>2.70</td>
<td>2.02</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 3**

Reported Drug Consumption in Servings by Drug Type and Section of Week

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Substance</th>
<th>Weekday Mean</th>
<th>S. D.</th>
<th>Weekend Mean</th>
<th>S. D.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Caffeine</td>
<td>2.88</td>
<td>1.26</td>
<td>3.26</td>
<td>2.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alcohol</td>
<td>1.84</td>
<td>1.28</td>
<td>5.30</td>
<td>3.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicotine</td>
<td>3.40</td>
<td>3.46</td>
<td>4.90</td>
<td>5.39</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 4
Reported Caffeine Intake by Type of Intake Measure and Social Stereotype

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Stereotype</th>
<th>Number of Servings</th>
<th>Amount of Intake</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>S. D.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Other” Cultures/Ethnicities</td>
<td>2.27</td>
<td>1.39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Conformists</td>
<td>2.58</td>
<td>1.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stigmatized</td>
<td>2.44</td>
<td>1.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Addicts</td>
<td>3.14</td>
<td>1.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Popular/In-Crowd</td>
<td>2.23</td>
<td>1.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greek/Fraternity/Sorority</td>
<td>2.66</td>
<td>1.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Follows Rules</td>
<td>2.01</td>
<td>1.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic/Student</td>
<td>2.70</td>
<td>1.55</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5
Reported Alcohol Intake by Type of Intake Measure and Social Stereotype

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Stereotype</th>
<th>Number of Servings</th>
<th>Amount of Intake</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>S. D.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Other” Cultures/Ethnicities</td>
<td>1.94</td>
<td>1.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Conformists</td>
<td>2.71</td>
<td>1.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stigmatized</td>
<td>2.16</td>
<td>1.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Addicts</td>
<td>5.07</td>
<td>2.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Popular/In-Crowd</td>
<td>3.02</td>
<td>3.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greek/Fraternity/Sorority</td>
<td>4.15</td>
<td>2.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Follows Rules</td>
<td>0.57</td>
<td>0.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic/Student</td>
<td>0.93</td>
<td>0.88</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 6
Reported Nicotine Intake by Type of Intake Measure and Social Stereotype

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Stereotype</th>
<th>Number of Servings</th>
<th>Amount of Intake</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>S. D.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Other” Cultures/Ethnicities</td>
<td>3.28</td>
<td>3.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Conformists</td>
<td>4.65</td>
<td>3.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stigmatized</td>
<td>3.17</td>
<td>3.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Addicts</td>
<td>7.59</td>
<td>5.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Popular/In-Crowd</td>
<td>1.85</td>
<td>2.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greek/Fraternity/Sorority</td>
<td>2.98</td>
<td>3.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Follows Rules</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>0.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic/Student</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>1.36</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 7
Correlations between Perceived Legal Drug Use in Servings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Substance</th>
<th>Caffeine</th>
<th>Alcohol</th>
<th>Nicotine</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Caffeine</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alcohol</td>
<td>0.27*</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicotine</td>
<td>0.43**</td>
<td>0.51**</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* 0.01<p<0.02
**p<0.01
Figures

Figure 1. *Drug Consumption v. Day Time Context*

![Graph showing drug consumption in servings over different times of day.](image1)

- Caffeine Mean
- Alcohol Mean
- Nicotine Mean

Figure 2. *Drug Consumption v. Week Time Context*

![Graph showing drug consumption in servings over weekdays and weekends.](image2)

- Caffeine Mean
- Alcohol Mean
- Nicotine Mean
Experience with Classical Music and Student Academic Performance

Amanda Wiggans

Dr. Maureen Carlson, Mentor

A study was conducted to assess the impact of the controversial classical music experience, otherwise known as “The Mozart Effect”, on undergraduate and graduate students’ academic achievement. A survey was designed to determine the relationship between classical musical training and the dependent measure of academic performance in the form of ACT composite scores and overall GPA. A sample of 112 participants was surveyed during the summer session 2009 at Truman State University. Chi Square analyses of data were conducted and results indicated no significant difference in expected and observed values for measures of student academic achievement -- ACT scores and GPA -- thus suggesting that these are independent of length of musical training.

The Mozart Effect is a musical phenomenon associated with a set of research results that indicate that listening to classical composer’s music may induce a short-term improvement on the performance of certain kinds of mental tasks known as spatial-temporal reasoning (Rauscher, Shaw & Ky, 1993, p 611). Despite the numerous attempts at trying to replicate these research results for short-term...
performance improvement, few scholars have examined the long-term effects that experiences with classical music has on a person. The purpose of this study is to understand the long-term effects that having training in classical music has on a student, and to examine the relationship between classical music and measured academics for the college student.

Additionally, the Mozart Effect is an inclusive term signifying the transformational powers of music in health, education, and well-being. More specifically, this musical phenomenon can also be referred to as a set of research results that indicate that listening to the music of W.A. Mozart may induce a short-term improvement on the performance of certain mental tasks known as spatial-temporal reasoning. The mental tasks that were scored in the original 1993 study by Frances H. Rauscher, Gordon L. Shaw, and Katherine N. Ky were pattern tests, multiple choice maze tests, and a paper-folding and cutting test. Though there was a short-term improvement of these tasks after listening to ten minutes of music, these results have rarely been replicated. Furthermore, few scholars have analyzed the long-term effects of listening to or playing classical music. The purpose of this study is to understand the long-term effects of having training in classical music and how that training impacts overall ACT scores and GP.

Literature Review

In their landmark study, Rauscher, Shaw and Ky (1993) reported that there are correlational, historical and anecdotal relationships between music cognition and other higher brain functions but no causal relationship has been demonstrated between music cognition and cognitions pertaining to abstract operations such as mathematical or spatial reasoning (p. 611).

These researchers conducted an experiment that demonstrated the relationship between music and performance ability. The experiment involved 36 college students who were each given three sets of standard IQ spatial reasoning tasks. Each of the tasks were preceded by 10 minutes in one of three experimental conditions: 1.) listening to Mozart’s Sonata for Two Pianos in D Major, K 488, 2.) listening to a relaxation tape, or 3) silence. One of three abstract reasoning tests taken from the Stanford-Binet intelligence scale was administered after each of the listening conditions. The abstract/spatial reasoning tasks consisted of a pattern test, a multiple choice matrices test, and a paper folding and cutting test (Rauscher, et al., 1993). They found that performance ability was improved for those tasks immediately following in the environment where students listened to Mozart, compared to the students who listened to relaxation or silence. The IQ’s of students participating in the music condition were 8-9 points above their IQ scores in the other two conditions.
While these results appear to be convincing on the surface, even the three researcher’s themselves admit that there are gaps in their study which could be improved upon. “The enhancing effect of the music condition is temporal, and does not extend beyond the 10-15 minute period during which subjects were engaged in each spatial task” (Rauscher, et al., 1993, p 611). The researchers also comment that it would be useful in following studies to vary listening time and to examine whether other areas of general intelligence such as verbal, quantitative, and short-term memory were similarly effected. The researchers also claim that while “we used only one musical sample of one composer, various other compositions and musical styles should be examined” (Rauscher, et al., 1993, p. 611). In addition, the authors suggest that musicians may process music in different ways compared to non-musicians, and that it would be interesting to compare these two groups (p. 611).

Five years later, in 1998, Frances H. Rauscher and Gordon L. Shaw reported that following the publication of their first article in 1993, many other researchers have tried to replicate their results but had failed to do so. Rauscher and Shaw (1998) suggest that “researchers’ diverse choice of dependent measures may account for these varied results” (p. 835). The researchers also suggest that several new areas of study should be investigated in the future to more fully explore the possible positive short term effects of listening to classical music. Some additional areas of interest might include: choice of dependent variables, order of listening conditions, selection of musical composition. Rauscher and Shaw (1998) also stressed that more work is needed before practical applications can be derived. They recommend that researchers exploring the Mozart Effect carefully consider questions of task validity and experimental design. Other factors such as the subjects’ age, musical training, preference for the exposure condition, and aptitude for the task may also play a role (p. 835).

While much research has been conducted on how listening to Mozart can affect one’s cognitive and performance ability, there has been an equally large amount of research conducted on the therapeutic benefit of listening to classical music. One area of the medical field that uses music therapy for treatment is neuroscience, more specifically for patients with traumatic brain injuries. Traumatic brain injury is classified as the form of acquired brain damage to living brain tissue caused by an external, mechanical force. Research shows that in music therapy sessions with patients who have traumatic brain injuries, people who were once labeled ‘unable to respond’ or ‘un-reacting’ have begun to sing and play musical instruments. Single, breathy, vocal utterances have been known to complete cadences and lead to a sharing of melodic phrases. Finger movements limited by spastic muscle patterns and so fine that they must be described in millimeters have determined the direction of musical improvisation and dialogues. These fine, often, minute,
movements and vocal sounds have sometimes developed into a repertoire of physical and communicative gestures that can form the basis of developing relationships in the context of shared music activities. Gigantic, explosive explorations of steel drums, gongs, and large drums have contrasted the stillness of patients no longer able to seek (Gilbertson, 2008, p. 12).

Music therapists very closely observe positive changes in breathing, eye movement and eye contact of patients who need rehabilitation. Initially, patients are approached from a “listening perspective,” and the music therapist concentrates and records any sounds or movements the patient makes. The synchronization of breathing tempo, music tempo and changes in eye activity are interpreted as signs of the patient’s awareness of the music and of the music therapist. Changes in tension and relaxation are regarded as indicators of the patient’s music perception and listening abilities.

Music preference also plays a very important role in music therapy. Patients often are reminded of either a sad or happy memory, which does affect their response to the music which they are listening to. For example, Albinoni’s Adagion in C Minor is often included in relaxation CDs. It is a very beautiful piece with a sustained pulsation and a descending melodic line (Grocke, 2007, p. 54). However, the piece was used in the film, Gallipoli, which is a deeply sad movie about World War I. This piece is also commonly used for funeral services, and it is possible that those associations with memories might draw the patient back. Similarly, the second movement of Mozart’s Piano Concerto No. 21 was used in the 1960’s film Elvira Madigan and when clients hear this music, they may have immediate associations with the content of the film at the time they viewed it (Grocke, 2007, p. 54). Music therapists should always be aware of the factors when choosing selections for clients. It is also important not to make assumptions about what style of music different age groups prefer (p. 56). Older clients tend to prefer classical, country or jazz. Younger clients tend to prefer current or high-energy music, including a Bach fugue played on a synthesizer or a fast, character infused Mozart aria.

Society is constantly striving to be healthier, live longer, and be smarter. News about The Mozart Effect was exactly what parents-to-be wanted to hear. The first organ the fetus develops is the ear. Development begins only a few weeks after conception. Therefore, the baby hears sound even in the earliest stages of life. Sound reaches the in utero ear, but it is distorted somewhat because of the amniotic fluid and tissue surrounding the fetus. Because of this, sounds and music below the pitch level of middle C do not have much of an effect on the fetus and cannot be heard as clearly as sounds or music with higher notes or tones. Coincidentally, most of Mozart’s works are composed with notes above middle C, and all have melodies that musically make perfect sense and are predictable without unexpected key areas or
jarring starts and stops. In fact, the melody and rhythm are not altered much for the baby in the womb when about middle C. Even while the music may sound slightly different to the child, there is plenty of musical stimulation for the baby. Researchers know this by monitoring and measuring heart-rate and movement. Loud, more dramatic sounds tend to increase the heart rate of the child, whereas softer, more soothing sounds tend to decrease the child’s heart rate.

While experts are not exactly sure if the fetus can learn from the music being played while in the womb, it is proven that the child will remember it after birth. According to researcher Norman Weinberger (1999), author of “Lessons of the Music Womb,” a study reported that one-week-old infants prefer the lullaby sung by their mother during pregnancy. The effects of classical music are carried over from prenatal to post partum as well. “Premature babies who are exposed to classical music will gain more weight and leave the hospital sooner (Campbell, 2002, p. 15). Studies also show that prenatal exposure to music increases infant development, and might be able to eliminate certain developmental delays in some children (Weinberger, 1999).

When it comes to the development of children through music listening, Don Campbell is an expert. He reports that “children who have regular music training demonstrate better motor skills and as well as better math and reading abilities compared to children who do not have regular music training” (Campbell, 2001, p.15). Also, a child’s sense of creativity can be exploited while listening to classical music. Campbell suggests that Mozart’s Rondo alla Turke can be utilized to give a child’s mind and body a hearty but creative workout when instructed to listen and clap on the music’s accents. Campbell also suggests that the parent does not have to be a musical genius to implement these ideas into the developmental process of a child; it is most important to have fun while listening to music with the child.

Clearly, there are numerous areas where research can be improved upon in this field. While several experiments have been conducted on the short-term effects of music on the brain, there have been very mixed results; and there has been very little or no attention given to the long-term effects that a background of listening to or playing classical music has on measured intelligence.

Method

The above literature suggests several areas that could be expanded upon to address the question: Does musical training really make a difference in student achievement? For this study, the researcher compared the academic performance and aptitude test scores of trained classical musicians to non-musically trained students to explore the relationship between these factors. After receiving proper IRB approval, the researcher conducted a survey comparing the academic achievements of trained
classical musicians to non-musically trained students. The independent variables were whether or not the student had formal training in classical music. The dependent variables in this study were ACT overall composite scores and grade point average (GPA) as measures of academic achievement.

**Participants** A sample of 112 students were invited to participate. The age group was restricted to undergraduate and graduate college students who were 18 years or older at Truman State University during the summer of 2009. An invitation email along with an informed consent information were also available for participants [See Appendices C and D].

**Instrument** A questionnaire was designed which contained items regarding student’s training in classical music. The trained musicians were asked questions about their length of training, instrument type, etc. If the students did not have training in classical music, they were directed to questions pertaining to their music listening preferences [See Appendices A and B]. The participants were asked to self report their ACT composite scores and GPA, as well as their major at the end of the survey.

**Procedure** The questionnaire’s data were collected via online survey methods. This consisted of a mass email sent to all registered students at the university with a link to an online survey site. An informed consent message was posted at the site with a required response prompt before participants could either confirm and be permitted access to the questionnaire or decline and directed to exit the survey site. The questionnaire was hosted at the Truman State University servers over a two-week period, then its data were downloaded as an excel spreadsheet compatible file and analyzed using SPSS. The researcher coded raw GPA, ACT and length of musical training data into categories for the purpose of statistical analysis [See Appendix E].

The researcher also constructed a separate webpage to provide helpful information and assistance to the study’s participants. This webpage contained links to an introduction informed consent page, summary of results, abstract, and contact information for the researcher and the mentor [See Appendix H].

**Results**

After reviewing the completed online surveys, the data was downloaded and analyzed by the researcher using SPSS software. The discoveries after the statistical analysis of resulted in a rejection of the researcher’s hypothesis. To begin with, a Chi-Square test was conducted to check for cross tabs and independence of variables [See Appendix F]. This analysis was completed for both GPA and ACT scores as to check for independence against length (if any) of musical training. The results of the Chi-Square statistical test showed that there was very little difference between expected
values and observed count, which is consistent in suggesting that both GPA and ACT scores are almost completely independent of any length of musical training.

The researcher also analyzed the percentages of the different categories (1, 2, 3) in which survey participants fell for both GPA and ACT scores. The pie charts [See Appendix G] show that an unusually large number of survey participants fell into the “high” category for both GPA and ACT scores. Over fifty percent of survey participants self reported a GPA of 3.5 or higher. The same was true for ACT scores as over forty percent of survey participants self reported having an overall ACT composite score of 28 or higher. Very few participants reported having GPAs in the low category (below 2.5 to 2.9), similarly few participants reported having an ACT of below 20-23.

Discussion

After reflecting on the results of the statistical analysis of the data, a few questions were presented with possible reasons of why and how the data yielded the results that they did. The researcher believes that there still may indeed be a relationship between musical training and academic performance that was impossible to be shown at the current time due to a lack of the average college student. Over fifty percent of Truman students reported their current cumulative GPA to be in the range of 3.5 to 4.0. This is unusually large number of people in this high GPA category. The researcher believes this is because the survey was hosted and conducted at Truman State University, the Midwest’s only highly selective public university. The average ACT score for Truman State University Students lies in the 26-28 ranges each year for enrolled incoming freshman students (Truman State University, 2009). According to ACT Inc, The average ACT score for the state of Missouri is currently 21.6 (ACT Inc., 2009). Clearly, Truman ACT scores exceed the Missouri average by several points. For these reasons, the researcher believes the results of the research could have been skewed. In the future, it is suggested that the online survey be administered to different college campuses in Missouri, in particular, larger campuses similar to the University of Missouri to obtain a larger and more diverse sample.

The researcher also suggests that in the future, aptitude and achievement should be divided into two separate studies. In specific, aptitude measures like ACT and achievement measures like GPA should be researched separately. The two measures of intelligence are too different to put together and compare. The researcher suggests that aptitude (ACT) to be studied with length of musical training and that achievement (GPA) to be studied with listening preferences.
References


Appendix A

Questionnaire Items

1.) Do you have training in classical music? a.) No  b.) Yes

If “b” selected:

2.) How long have you been playing/singing classical music?

3.) Which type? (Open ended)

4.) Other than Classical music, which do you prefer to listen to?
   * Rock
   * Pop
   * Rap/R&B
   * Country
   * Alternative

5.) When do you listen to music the most?
   * Study
   * Relax
   * Exercise
   * Other (Specify)

6.) What is your current cumulative GPA?

7.) What was your overall composite ACT score?

If “a” selected:

2.) How often do you listen to classical music?

0 times per week, 1-2 times per week, 3+ times per week

If 0 times per week:

3.) What type of music do you listen to?
   * Rock
   * Pop
   * Rap/R&B
   * Country
   * Alternative

4.) When do you listen to music the most?
   * Study
   * Relax
   * Exercise
   * Other (Specify)

5.) What is your current cumulative GPA?
6.) **What was your overall composite ACT score?**
7.) **What is/are your academic major(s)?**

**If 1-2 times per week or 3+ per week:**
3.) **Why do you listen to classical music?** (Open ended)
4.) **When do you listen to music the most?**
   * Study
   * Relax
   * Exercise
   * Other (Specify)

5.) **What is your current cumulative GPA?**
6.) **What was your overall composite ACT score?**
7.) **What is/are your academic major(s)?**
Appendix B

Flow Chart for Questions: Survey Design

Do you have training in classical music?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Yes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

How often do you listen to classical music?

0 1-2 3+ times per week

How long have you been playing/singing classical music?

Which type?

Vocal Instrumental

What type of music do you listen to?

- Rock
- Pop
- Rap/R&B
- Country
- Alternative

Why do you listen to Classical music?

Other than Classical music, which do you prefer to listen to?

- Rock
- Pop
- Rap/R&B
- Country
- Alternative

When do you listen to music the most?

- Study
- Relax
- Exercise
- Other

When do you listen to music the most?

- Study
- Relax
- Exercise
- Other

When do you listen to music the most?

- Study
- Relax
- Exercise
- Other
Appendix C

Invitation Email Letter

Dear Truman Student,

You are cordially invited to take part in a study about students’ musical preferences and the college learning experience. This research is conducted in partial fulfillment of the McNair Scholars’ Program Summer Research Internship Program. It is hoped that this study will further understanding about the relationship between music and learning. Your participation in this study is completely voluntary.

You are asked to take part in an online survey with various questionnaire items that will take approximately 10 -15 minutes to complete. Your anonymous responses to questionnaire items are confidential. There are no identifiers whatsoever. You have the right to withdraw from the study and stop the questionnaire at anytime without penalties of any kind. As with many INTERNET surveys, there are minimal risks of data interception or corruption. All data files will be stored in a secured location and password protected computer by the researcher. Results for the study will be presented in the fall semester at the researchers webpage: “www2.truman.edu/~ajw958” and the annual McNair Research Conference at Truman State University.

Upon completion of the survey, participants may elect to be re-directed from the survey to an electronic sign-up page to register for a drawing to win a prize consisting of $25 gift certificate to Ruby Tuesday.

If you have further questions about the study, please feel free to contact the researcher, Ms. Amanda Wiggans at ajw958@truman.edu and (660) 651-3763, OR her research supervisor, Dr. Maureen Carlson in the Music Department at Truman State University mcarlson@truman.edu and (660) 785-5312. Thank you for your kind consideration.

Sincerely,

Ms. Amanda Wiggans
Music Major
McNair Scholars Program
Appendix D

Informed Consent/Electronic Signature Page

Welcome to the survey website for the study on musical preferences and college behavior. Before deciding whether or not to take part in this study, the researcher would like to provide you with some important information regarding your rights as a participant. Please read the form carefully. You may ask any questions about the research, the possible risks and benefits, your rights as a volunteer, and anything else that is not clear. When all of your questions have been answered, you will have scrolled to the bottom of this page where can decide if you want to be in this study or not:

WHAT IS THE PURPOSE OF THIS STUDY?
This study is designed to learn more about how individuals’ unique musical preferences and background are related to their college learning experience, and will benefit our understanding of how these factors may be related. You will be asked to report both your GPA and ACT composite score.

WHY AM I BEING INVITE TO TAKE PART IN THIS STUDY?
As a Truman State University student enrolled in summer classes, you are uniquely well qualified to respond to questions on the topic of the college experience. Your must be 18 years or older to take part in this study. Your opinions and thoughts on this topic are valuable.

WHAT WILL HAPPEN DURING THIS STUDY AND HOW LONG WILL IT TAKE?
During the study, you will be asked to participate in an online survey. The survey will ask you questions regarding your attitude and experience with music in general. You will also be asked about your GPA and ACT composite score. If you agree to take part in this study, your involvement will last for a maximum of 10-15 minutes.

WHAT ARE THE RISKS OF THIS STUDY?
The possible risks and/or discomforts associated with the procedures described in this study include: Security of information because information sent via the Internet cannot be guaranteed to be secure or error-free as information could be intercepted, corrupted, lost, or destroyed. Also, some individuals may experience very minor embarrassment because they don’t have musical training, knowledge or ability but not more than what they would experience in their everyday lives.
WHAT ARE THE BENEFITS OF THIS STUDY?
We do not know if you will benefit from being in this study. However, we hope that, in the future, other people might benefit from this study because it may provide valuable information for the music discipline.

WHO WILL SEE THE INFORMATION I GIVE?
The information you provide during this research study will be kept confidential to the extent permitted by law. To help protect your confidentiality, only the researcher and her faculty mentor will have access to this data. No personal identifiers will be used. The data will be kept confidential and secured on a password protected to which only the researcher has access.

DO I HAVE A CHOICE TO BE IN THE STUDY?
If you decide to take part in the study, it should be because you really want to volunteer. You will not lose any benefits or rights you would normally have if you choose not to volunteer. You can stop at any time during the study and still keep the benefits and rights you had before volunteering. You will not be treated differently if you decide to stop taking part in the study. You may skip any questions that you prefer not to answer.

WHAT IF I HAVE QUESTIONS?
If you have any questions about this research project, please contact: Amanda Wiggans at ajw958@truman.edu or (660) 651-3763 or Dr. Maureen Carlson at mcarlson@truman.edu or (660) 785-5312.

If you have questions about your rights as a participant, please contact the Truman State University Institutional Review Board Administrator, at (660) 785-7459 or by email at Grants4Truman@yahoo.com.

ACCEPT or DECLINE:

ACCEPT -- By clicking on this link, I hereby affirm that I am 18 years of age or older, and also that I have understood the information regarding my rights as a research participant provided to me on this webpage [link to 1st page of questionnaire]

DECLINE -- I do not accept and prefer not to take the questionnaire. Please close this window or click on this link to be re-directed away from this page. [Will close OR follow link to re-direct away from the page]
## Appendix E

### GPA CODE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CODE NUMBER</th>
<th>GPA RANGES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 (Low)</td>
<td>Below 2.5-2.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 (Avg.)</td>
<td>3.0-3.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 (High)</td>
<td>3.5-4.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### ACT CODE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CODE NUMBER</th>
<th>GPA RANGES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 (Low)</td>
<td>20-23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 (Avg.)</td>
<td>24-27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 (High)</td>
<td>28 and above</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### LENGTH OF TRAINING CODE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CODE NUMBER</th>
<th>LENGTH RANGES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0 (None)</td>
<td>0-No Musical Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 (Little)</td>
<td>1-3 Years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 (Some)</td>
<td>4-7 Years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 (Much)</td>
<td>8+ Years</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix F
Results of Chi Square Analyses

Grade Point Average

Chi-Square Tests

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Chi-Square</td>
<td>1.895&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>.929</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood Ratio</td>
<td>2.267</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>.894</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear-by-Linear Association</td>
<td>.087</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.769</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N of Valid Cases</td>
<td>110</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<sup>a</sup> 6 cells (50.0%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is .10.

Length Code * GPA Code Crosstabulation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GPA Code</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Length Code 0</td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Expected Count</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>23.5</td>
<td>33.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Length Code 1</td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Expected Count</td>
<td>.1</td>
<td>.4</td>
<td>.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Length Code 2</td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Expected Count</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>5.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Length Code 3</td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Expected Count</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>13.4</td>
<td>19.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Expected Count</td>
<td>11.0</td>
<td>41.0</td>
<td>58.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ACT Scores

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Chi-Square</td>
<td>4.924&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>.554</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood Ratio</td>
<td>5.296</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>.507</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear-by-Linear Association</td>
<td>.863</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.353</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N of Valid Cases</td>
<td>110</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<sup>a</sup> 7 cells (58.3%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is .06.
### Length Code * ACT Code Crosstabulation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Length Code</th>
<th>ACT Code</th>
<th>Count</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Expected Count</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>13.0</td>
<td>45.1</td>
<td>62.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Expected Count</td>
<td>.1</td>
<td>.2</td>
<td>.7</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Expected Count</td>
<td>.7</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td>11.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Expected Count</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>26.2</td>
<td>36.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Expected Count</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>23.0</td>
<td>80.0</td>
<td>110.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix G

Percentage Distribution of GPA and ACT Scores within the Sample
ACT Score Categories and Distribution within the Sample
Appendix H
Website Homepage

The Study of Student Attitudes Toward Music and Learning

Informed Consent

Introduction

Download a Summary of Results

Contact Info

Abstract

Welcome to website for *The Study of Students’ Attitudes towards Music and Learning*, which is a research project that seeks to explore the relationship between individual’s unique musical preferences and aspects of their college learning experiences.

The project is conducted by Ms. Amanda Wiggans in partial fulfillment of requirements for the Summer Research Internship (SRI) experience of the Ronald E. McNair Post-Baccalaurate Program.

This website is designed to provide helpful information and assistance to its participants. Please use the navigation bar at the left to access topics of your choice. Thank you for your interest and support for this project.
Negotiating the Panopticon: On Queer Theory, Queerness, Queer Space, and Tactical Strategies

Leia Penina Wilson

Martin Joseph Ponce, Ph.D., Mentor
Ohio State University

Space is—simultaneously—how, when, and where we situate our bodies, desires, and pleasures. It is the matrix via which we come to understand our subjectivities, as well as the birdcage in which we are constrained. It is due to the continual limitation on (and of) our individual and collective negotiations (and manipulations) of space that makes actively contesting “public” space, territory, and memory a critical aspect of democracy. Queer theory has long been concerned with deconstructing and renovating knowledges. Space is citizenship: the lack of queer space within the “public” sphere signifies an erasure, not only of queer representation and narrative, but queer experiences and memories themselves, thus this project is a creative-critical investigation of queer place-making. By engaging in a poetic interrogation\(^1\) of “sense-making,” this project seeks to articulate and invite creative resistance to hegemonic cultures.

\(^1\) It should be noted that this paper is part of a larger multi-generic project involving poetry.
It may be an uneasy “truth”\(^2\) that the world goes around according to binary systems of gender and sexuality—one is female or male, woman or man, adult or child, able or disabled, white or other, etc. However, this is only true because we set ourselves up in opposition to something else—either we are something or we symbolize a lack of that something. There is no conversation between the two and there is no questioning of the categories themselves. This is where feminist and queer theories provide perspective: binaries do not sustain themselves—they are a product of practice, ritual, and repetition. Michel Foucault, Anne Fausto-Sterling, Judith Butler, Gayle Rubin, and others explicate the fact that sexuality is constructed. As Butler points out, “Thinking the body constructed demands a rethinking of the meaning of construction itself” (xi).

We deconstruct sex and gender, and find that it is cultural meaning attached to the biological body. The strict biological binary, of either female or male, exists because meaning is imposed on bodies. The binary oppositions rest on metaphors and cross-references, and, as is so often in patriarchal discourse, sexual difference serves to encode or establish meanings that are, literally, unrelated to the body or gender. Gendered meanings have been attached to the body, but originate from the body. Anne Fausto-Sterling questions the authenticity of gendered systems in Sexing the Body by asking, “Is there some easy way to envision the double sided process that connects the production of gendered knowledge about the body on the one surface to the materialization of gender within the body on the other?” (253). It is in the spaces of the in-between where the most resistance to hegemonic cultures, ideologies, and ways of being are activated. It is the spaces between (usually) two oppositional and assumed truths that demonstrate and map, not only the risk of staunch categories of being, but also the interlocking and overlapping relationships and complexities intrinsically built by the continual re-affirmation of these categories.

Current critical queer theory has formulated queer as a response to various regimes of power and systems of domination, utilizing queer as a deconstructive tool, and claiming queer as a radical alternative sex(uality) and identification. Jagose, in *Queer Theory: An Introduction*, states that “there is no generally acceptable definition of queer...Nevertheless, the inflection of queer that has proved most disruptive to received understandings of identity, community and politics is the one that problematises normative consolidations of sex, gender and sexuality” (99).

The social construction of gender connected cultural meanings to sex, and as such, females and males developed identities as women and men. Thus, meaning making systems are gendered systems, which are reinforced in cultural representations, and these in turn establish the terms by which relations between women and

---

\(^2\) By “truth,” in this case, I mean a great number of people and groups of people in positions of privilege have resigned themselves to acquiescence: we have stopped actively protesting the negation (both symbolic and material) of our bodies and desires (especially in the public realm, where the most potential for effect occurs).
men are organized and understood. Positive definitions depend upon the negation or repression or misdirection of something else that is presented as antithetical to it. If gender, sex, and genitals were seen as independent, instead of interdependent, then the gender regime would find it difficult to breathe.

Judith Butler deconstructs gender and sex in her groundbreaking work entitled *Gender Trouble*. Butler explicates the point that what we consider “real” serves a specific regime, and that “illegitimate” meanings threaten “normative” cultures because, in their variance and attempt to discover themselves, they question and challenge the very regimes that so many people are comfortable with accepting or do not even think to question or are not aware of—to any degree. However, whether we are aware coincidentally or purposefully, this does not excuse the fact of violence, in its many forms, enacted on queer bodies.

It is not enough to call out these binaries as ineffective identity categories and methods and languages of expression, we must reject any notions of these binary regimes because they limit, restrict, and control our expressions and our bodies. We should not be arguing over whether or not the constructionist or the essentialist model is “better” or more effective, we should be ”spoil[ing] the effectiveness of these categories”—“female,” “male,” “woman,” “man,” as Jason Cromwell exhorts us to do.²

This is, in part, the significance of queer theory—it turns a critical eye to what appears to be apparent, it investigates what may not always be seen at first in relation to notions of gender and sexuality. Queer theory functions as a framework that reveals that information and knowledge aren’t exhaustive, it problematizes itself, and understands that “normalcy” is a subjective creation. Queer theory is comfortable with flexibility; it is fine with its own transmogrifying tendencies (410). This also includes the need to conceive of gender and sex independently, in order to bring down the regimes that seek to regulate and restrict our desires.

Annamarie Jagose states that “Identity” is probably one of the most naturalized cultural categories each of us inhabits: one always thinks of one self as existing outside all representational frames, as somehow marking a point of undeniable realness” (78). In fact, however, any “realness” we may (or may not) inhabit is the product of a specific context. Various women’s liberation movements for the longest time would not recognize lesbianism because it was embedded within the category of “homosexual,” but the gendering of sexualities has different histories.

Jagose remarks on lesbian feminism saying that “the masculine relation to sexuality has been figured differently from the feminine”—making the point that within a reproductive economy, access to sources—economical, social, political—is

---

² Jason Cromwell, in “Queering the Binaries: Transsituated Identities, Bodies, and Sexualities,” declares that we should “queer the binary,” in order that the categories “are made peculiar, seem bizarre, and spoil the effectiveness of the categories” (410).
dependent upon the social mobility of the subject which, in turn, is dependent upon, and constituted by, masculine needs and concerns (45). Roland Barthes makes this point most clearly when talking about the formation of “identity.” Barthes brings to the forefront in his *Mythologies* “that our understanding of ourselves as coherent, unified, and self-determining subjects is an effect of those representational codes commonly used to describe the self and through which, consequently, identity comes to be understood” (Jagose 78).

The political ideal, in regards to identity and space, should not be a melting pot, where all difference dissipates into a collective pseudo-truth, where difference caters, and falls, to the power of the status quo, of dominant regimes that seek to assimilate, rather than liberate, but instead a mosaic, in which multiple differences (within the self and of spaces) is a multifarious strength, to be called upon and utilized at will, rather than an identity calamity to be altered.

We must recognize that it is not the self which should be altered, but the categories that claim to express our subjectivities. The knowledges of queer theory, and those produced by, within, and from queer theory, are initially deconstructive. Queer “marks both a continuity and a break with previous gay liberationist and lesbian feminist models” (Jagose 75). The former catalyzed Stonewall. Although 27 June 1969 did not mark the beginnings of the gay liberation movement, it marks symbolically “an important shift away from assimilationist policies and quietist tactics” (30). It represents the moment when lesbian and gay identities became political.

Unlike the homophile movement, the gay liberationist movement was no longer about “just being like heterosexuals save in sexual-object choice.” D’Emilio notes that the two movements were concerned with, more or less, the same issues and targeted the same institutions—“urban police forces, the federal government, the churches, the medical profession, the press, and other media” (Jagose 22-29). There is the tendency to think of the gay liberationist movement as more radical than the homophile movement, but Annamarie Jagose notes that “It is worth remembering that in its radical origins it raised issues similar to those championed by gay liberation, but in a different context and with different effects” (29). The homophile movement was acting within a different context, within a society and time (during the 1950’s homosexuality was considered a disease, something to be “cured”) where to be homosexual—to even be suspected—of homosexuality (implicit in this word is a pathologizing attitude)— meant that you were “beyond respectability” (28-29).

The gay liberationist movement, positioned itself within the context of refusal—refusal to be treated as second-class citizens, refusal to cater to “normative” constructs of humanness, indeed, refusal to be considered anything other than another contemplating individual, that is,—a *person*. As Jagose states, “gay liberationists
challenged conventional knowledge about such matters as gendered behaviour, monogamy and the sanctity of the law" (31). No longer would there be any silent acquiescence. Dennis Altman discusses the connection between American gay liberation and other counter-culture movements of the 1960’s in his book *Homosexual Oppression and Liberation* (1972) (Jagose 33). His primary conclusions are the creation of a “new consciousness” centered on a “suspicion of hypocrisy and a strong distrust of authority” (33-34). It is also important to note that this revolution and resistance sparked by Stonewall was also concerned with fighting for the rights of all oppressed groups. It was one of the early attempts at a coalition against multiple oppressions.

If we conformed to the same beliefs, systems, and structures without question, without some form of flux, then there would be no growth—no quantifiable or qualify-able development of the human species. We would be stuck in a vacuum of our own creation. The gender and sexual regimes which work upon our bodies and our psyches, those regimes that dictate our form and the ways in which we can function, are not problems belonging to only those communities scrutinized by the status quo. Gender, gender construction, and the violence—visible and invisible—that results from challenging “normative” and “naturalized” notions of gender and sex are not strictly problems for lesbian and gay, bisexual, transgender, and transsexual peoples. In the same way, racism and sexism are not only problems for communities of color and women.

The ability to negotiate and manipulate our language, which isn’t our language, in the first place, is important, especially since language and grammar are rigid and the more rigid the grammar the less possibility there is of re-signification. Written text and language are so privileged within Western societies that we sometimes forget that it’s not the only place of signification. We first communicate orally: words are spoken to us, we hear, and imitate, eventually learning to form sentences and ideas ourselves.

Diana Taylor provides an active and playful approach for thinking about the construction of queer spaces. In *The Archive and the Repertoire: Performing Cultural Memory in the Americas*, Taylor looks at the historical processes of transnational contact, specifically in witnessing by focusing on embodied behaviors. She looks at performance “less from what it *is* than what it allows us to *do*” (16), making clear that performance “function[s] as vital acts of transfer, transmitting social knowledge, memory, and a sense of identity through reiterated” behaviors (2-3). She looks at performance—dance, staged readings and performances, art—as a method of understanding the world, not simply as an object of analysis.

We all live with contextual limitations and contextual privileges. By considering performance as “a system of learning, storing, and transmitting knowledge,” we can
articulate and put into practice meaningful actions we can do, actions and performances which do not ask for an impractical martyrdom (16). By turning to embodied practices and behaviors, from the politics of public space to linguistic realities, Taylor asks us to consider the ways in which cultural memory is formed—“Civic disobedience, resistance, citizenship, gender, ethnicity, and sexual identity, for example, are rehearsed and performed daily in the public sphere” (3).

We remember events and histories due to the archive and the repertoire, which, working in conjunction, produces personal and collective expression and thus, cultural memory. The archive, Taylor states, is made up of “documents, maps, literary texts, letters, archaeological remains, bones, videos, films, CDs, all things supposedly resistant to change” (19). It is the interpretation of the archive that changes over time: “archival memory works across distance, over time and space” (19). Complementary to the archive, is the repertoire, which “requires presence: people participate in the production and reproduction of knowledge by “being there” (20). The repertoire “enacts embodied memory: performances, gestures, orality, movement, dance, singing” (20). These acts are usually thought of as “ephemeral” and “non-reproducible” knowledges (20). Part of the strength of looking at performance as a way of knowing the world, is that embodied and lived experiences and practices are not based on the dominance of written language (25). This provides a more active approach to engaging in the formation of knowledge, indeed, it allows us to “expand what we understand as knowledge,” what we privilege as knowledge, and how we engage in meaning-making.

Queer and queer theories seek to interrogate the structure, and as they disrupt dominance, they rearticulate knowledges, demonstrating that signification isn’t all it’s hacked up to be (by hacked up I mean that meaning-making systems are often privileged systems, and as such, must be evaluated). Queer theorist Hennessy states that “information has become so much the structure in dominance that language, discourse, or cultural practice is often taken to be the only arena of social life” (Queer Cultures, 721). Of course, information in a world that prizes “facts” over experiences is crucial, but slapping each other with labels does not explicitly help people “understand” (if categorization can be considered as understanding) other people. Locating where and who this information comes from is also crucial to forging subjectivities and altering an economic system.

Though we do not literally carry space with us, we do create the space our bodies exist in; we remember and recall performances, poetry readings, festivals, demonstrations, Take-Back the-Night Walks, as well as actual built spaces, landscapes, and designs. It is the totality of these subjectivities (the social relations, the actual designed/built space, and the generated meaning, desire, and erotic

* Relevant data in English are available online: www.perepis2002.ru/ct/doc/English/4-2.xls
potential) that constitute queer space (Ingram 43). As Ingram declares it is the entirety of the “textures...how they shift over time, and where they stabilize—the communalities and communities—that are built] have direct implications for the spaces, networks, and coalitions that are possible at any given time” (43). An ideal safe space would be a space (place) where the differences in each of us could be recognized, rather than held as a liability; a space where the need to choose one aspect of our identities at the expense of another would not be necessary. Indeed, being forced to choose one aspect over another would be a partial suicide because we would be rejecting and destroying a part of ourselves in order to claim another part, and we are fooling ourselves as people—as contemplating, feeling individuals—if we think that we are not—each of us—full of some sort of contradiction.

Jose Esteban Muñoz confronts the spaces of performance in Disidentifications Queers of Color and the Performance of Politics, when he looks at how queers negotiate mainstream culture. He states “Solo performance speaks to the reality of being queer at this particular moment. More than two decades into a devastating pandemic, with hate crimes and legislation aimed at queers and people of color institutionalized as state protocols, the act of performing and theatricalizing queerness in public takes on ever multiplying significance” (1). This is one of the directions that queer theory is heading in: performance theory and studies. While talking about queer theory and performance may be dangerously close to skirting on issues of spectacle, Muñoz argues that performance brings queer space, specifically “the space of a queer bedroom” into the public realm.

Although Muñoz is specifically dealing with Marga Gomez’s performance in Marga Gomez Is Pretty, Witty, and Gay, it proves interesting to use this metaphor in more broad terms, especially since there is such an emphasis on knowing within our culture (1). But I wonder if we ever stopped to really look at what it is we want to know or why we want to know? If we strip curiosity, to use the civilized word, down to its bones, what we are really asking is, with whom are you sleeping? And, we are also saying, this is the person with whom I am sleeping. The problem is that we have reduced an entire person down to what gives them pleasure, even as dominant dichotomies seek to silence, restrain, and restrict pleasures to a singular type. Our identities are processed, categorized, and filed under ‘not threatening’ in so far as “not threatening” is the ability to tattoo whatever label onto the person formally in question. Consequently, if we cannot be identified so easily, we are then thrown aside, where we accept out exile, resist, or possibly we decide the isolation isn’t worth it, and truth becomes the cost of recognition. This is exactly why binary thinking is itself a central problem and where the ability to negotiate and manipulate the language becomes increasingly important.

Muñoz continues to explicate performance as a way of knowing the world,
instead of simply as an object of analysis. On Gomez's transformative performance, Muñoz states that "Her performance permits the spectator, often a queer who has been locked out of the halls of representation or rendered a static caricature there, to imagine a world where queer lives, politics, and possibilities are representable in their complexity" (1). By actively confronting and utilizing performance, space is being shaped and altered. The "real" is no longer certain, and it is in uncertainty where dominant publics are destabilized. This is important in shaping the history and politics of our futures. The future is a practice of freedom: it is a process, a becoming, a building. This is a "building [that] takes place in the future and in the present" (Muñoz 200). It is important as active members in culture—as citizens—to recognize that we are not without the resources to alter and affect culture (Muñoz 200).
Works Cited